


Article

Evaluation of Sustainability and Accessibility Strategies in Vocational Education Training

Gunay Kibrit ^{1,2,*}, Fahriye Altinay ^{1,2} , Gokmen Dagli ^{1,2}, Zehra Altinay ^{1,2} , Ramesh Sharma ³ ,
Rustam Shadiev ⁴ , Ahmed Tlili ⁵ , Menil Celebi ⁶, Mohamed Jemni ⁷ and Meryem Bastas ²

¹ Societal Research and Development Center, Faculty of Education, Institute of Graduate Studies, Near East University, Nicosia 99138, Northern Cyprus, Turkey

² Societal Research and Development Center, Faculty of Education, University of Kyrenia, Kyrenia 99320, Northern Cyprus, Turkey

³ School of Global Affairs, Dr. B. R. Ambedkar University Delhi, New Delhi 110015, India

⁴ School of Educational Science, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing 210098, China

⁵ Smart Learning Institute, Beijing Normal University, Beijing 100875, China

⁶ Societal Research and Development Center, Faculty of Health Sciences, Near East University, Nicosia 99138, Northern Cyprus, Turkey

⁷ ALESCO, Tunis 1003, Tunisia

* Correspondence: gkibrit@yahoo.com; Tel.: +90-533-8634567

Abstract: Sustainability plays a significant role in all levels of education. Paying attention to strategies for accessibility in educational levels is highly needed. This research aims to evaluate accessibility strategies in vocational education training (VET). It is significant to put efforts into VET to raise awareness on accessibility for the societal benefits of inclusivity and digital transformation in services for all. While preparing the educational context for digital education, accessibility strategies are essential for establishing the future of education. The study adopted the qualitative research approach and used semi-structured interviews and public reports for data collection. The sample of the study comprised the staff working at the management/administrative level in VET and at the ministry of education. Results indicated that suitable strategies are crucial for sustainability and accessibility in VET. Active citizenship for the global world requires understanding the practical sides of accessibility. In this respect, this study recommends vocational training activities based on sustainability and accessibility. To set sustainable strategies in VET, defining the proper roles and responsibilities of teachers, trainers, and staff are essential. The administrative authority, protection of school fixtures and procedures, resolving financial issues, overcoming obstacles such as quality activities, and the professional inadequacy of teacher training are basic steps for developing VET.

Keywords: accessibility; strategy; sustainability; vocational education training



Citation: Kibrit, G.; Altinay, F.; Dagli, G.; Altinay, Z.; Sharma, R.; Shadiev, R.; Tlili, A.; Celebi, M.; Jemni, M.; Bastas, M. Evaluation of Sustainability and Accessibility Strategies in Vocational Education Training. *Sustainability* **2022**, *14*, 12061. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su141912061>

Academic Editor: David Manzano Sánchez

Received: 24 August 2022

Accepted: 21 September 2022

Published: 23 September 2022

Publisher's Note: MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2022 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

1. Introduction

In today's world, when the world has become a small village, VET has strategic importance in realizing the development goals, gaining a solid position in the global competitive environment and training the workforce participating in production in terms of quality and quantity. VET aims to prepare students for careers in specific industries or occupations. VET can provide students with the skills and knowledge necessary to perform a particular job. It can also help students develop the ability to work independently, as well as in teams.

As per the definition of VET, education provides the professional skills that an individual in society needs for a particular profession and develops these skills in various ways [1]. Each individual has a specific physical and mental capacity. Education, on the other hand, tries to raise the individual to the highest level they can reach by using their ability. On the other hand, VET ensures the individual's development by educating them in a profession within their capacity in the best way.

The primary purpose of VET system is to train and develop a qualified workforce that brings economic and financial growth in various domains of life. While achieving this goal, it cooperates with the social and economic system. A skilled workforce refers to a human resource with professional qualifications, is hardworking, prioritizes moral rules, and aims to create added value for the institution and country in which it is located [2]. The VET system collaboratively operates with the school, the business sector, and the individual. It directs the individual to job sectors wherein they can develop their skills and learning opportunities. By providing the workforce for the needs and expectations of the business sector, the vocational and technical education system stakeholders aim to establish a renewed viable structure. Quality is one of the prime ingredients for creating an equitable and inclusive education ecosystem. It also adds value to lifelong learning approaches and promotes sustainable development through education and leading a sustainable lifestyle; there has to be a considered focus on developing a culture of peace and non-violence, creating avenues for gender equality, safeguarding human rights, and promoting world citizenship. In order to achieve the above, curriculum quality needs to be continuously improved. Curriculum quality has become an increasingly important area of concern for education policy-makers in many countries. The needs of the 21st-century workforce continue to change, and curriculum quality has been an important area of focus for education policy-makers in many countries. However, the concept of curriculum quality is not always well-understood or applied in practice.

States strive to bring their populations up to better living standards with economic growth, but, while reaching an advanced level of development, they ignore their environmental and social effect. To prevent this situation, Karademir et al. [3] and Benli Özdemir et al. [4] proposed a plan to meet today's needs without compromising the resource stock that will meet the needs of future generations.

The Need for the Study

Education plays a vital role in enabling people with disabilities to have an independent will, to lead a life without being dependent on others, and to ensure their personal development at a level that can participate in all areas of social life—poverty, unemployment, exclusion from society, etc. Education is the only possibility to solve many social problems such as these. It is an opportunity for an individual to benefit from the avenues and services available in the social sphere and to produce his service only if he can reach and make the most of all areas of life and the activities and services offered. It is crucial to be able to benefit from technology and to have full access to information in terms of participation in social life [5]. The identification of accessibility strategies in VET is helpful for

- Making education more accessible to those with disabilities
- Making accommodations for those with disabilities
- Offering support services to those with disabilities
- Creating an inclusive environment for all students.

The main challenge of accessibility strategies in VET is that they need to be tailored to the needs of each learner. This can be difficult to achieve if the VET institution does not have the resources or expertise to cater for learners with different needs. In addition, some accessibility strategies may not be appropriate for all learners, so it is important to carefully select which strategies to implement.

Individuals with disabilities have the right to get involved in high-quality working life and education in order to shape their future. Like other individuals without disabilities, they have the right to participate in the activities of universities in every area and to participate in social life by taking advantage of all of their opportunities. However, it is essential to have environments where people with disabilities have proper education to benefit from educational facilities and opportunities in many ways and build their future. Therefore, it is necessary to make improvements and arrangements specific to each disability situation [6].

Quality is one of the prime ingredients for creating an equitable and inclusive education ecosystem. It also adds value to lifelong learning approaches. To promote sustainable development through education and to lead a sustainable lifestyle, there has to be a considered focus on developing a culture of peace and non-violence, creating avenues for gender equality, safeguarding human rights, and promoting world citizenship, while providing all students with the necessary knowledge and skills for sustainable development through the contribution of cultural diversity and culture to create a base for sustainable development are priority objectives [7].

The role of sustainability in education is to provide students with the knowledge and skills they need to live and work in a sustainable way. This includes understanding the environmental, social, and economic issues that impact our world and how to make choices that will help protect our planet for future generations. Education for sustainable development is crucial for the future of humanity and the planet. Sustainable development is a development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. It is based on the principles of social justice, environmental protection, and economic efficiency. Education for sustainable development is crucial as it helps people understand the interconnectedness of the natural, social, and economic systems that make up our world. It also helps people develop the skills and knowledge they need to make informed decisions about how to live sustainably.

In the northern part of Cyprus, there is less attention on VET and its facilities. Students and families pay less attention to VET, and there is an intensified need to pay attention to sustainable development strategies for VET planning covering accessibility strategies for providing education for all.

This study aims to evaluate and develop sustainability and accessibility strategies in VET. The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) has been working to promote education for sustainable development since 2002. In 2015, UNESCO launched the sustainable development goals (SDGs) to replace the millennium development goals (MDGs). The SDGs include a specific goal (SDG 4) on education for all. There is no one-size-fits-all approach to education for sustainable development. The concept is flexible and can be adapted to local contexts and needs. However, all approaches should aim to promote sustainable development literacy among all people. This means having a basic understanding of the issues and challenges related to sustainable development and being able to make informed decisions about how to live sustainably. In this context, this study will shed light and guide the Ministry of National Education, VET department, vocational high schools, those who prepare programs in the field of VET, other researchers, and vocational teachers in Northern Cyprus. In alignment with this premise, this study sought answers to the following questions:

1. What are the aims of VET?
2. What is accessibility in VET, and how should it be ensured?
3. What vocational training activities for accessibility have been carried out?
4. What are the SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats) of VET?
5. What are the roles, responsibilities, and obstacles experienced in developing VET?
6. What are suggestions to sustain and develop VET for promoting accessibility?

2. Methods

2.1. Methodology

This study is qualitative research in nature. Qualitative research is adopted to reveal perceptions and events in a natural environment [8] and when the focus is on accomplishing it in a realistic and holistic manner [9].

Data Collection Tool

A semi-structured interview schedule was created, which included four open-ended semi-structured questions. The consent of the respondents was obtained as an ethical practice and also to not lose any data in the interviews. Legard et al. [10] highlighted the

significance of interviews in capturing the perceptions and opinions of the respondents as an effective strategy. The semi-structured interview schedule created within the scope of this study included four open-ended semi-structured questions.

To ensure internal validity, the interview schedule was submitted to external faculty members from the Near East University, Faculty of Education, Department of Educational Sciences, to get expert opinions. Faculty members were asked to provide feedback on the clarity of the questions, the appropriateness of the questions for the study, and whether they thought the questions would be difficult for participants to answer. In addition, the interview schedule was pilot-tested with two faculty members who were not included in the final sample. Pilot testing resulted in minor changes to the wording of some questions and the addition of a few questions.

2.2. Working Group

This sample for the study constituted 20 administrators, including the directors of the VET Department (10 participants) affiliated with the Ministry of National Education and the Vocational High School administrators (10 participants) affiliated with the Ministry of National Education in the spring term of 2021–2022. The managers participating in the research were selected following the purposive random sampling method. The purposive sampling method was used to select a representative sample of the most suitable participants for the purpose and research questions of the study. This method was chosen because the goal of the study was to collect information and perspectives from individuals who have experience in the field of sustainable development and VET. Furthermore, the study searched for detailed information about the experiences of the participants, and the purposive sampling method is the most appropriate method, as it provides a wider range of perspectives and sources of information.

Purposive random sampling is the purposeful classification of systematic and randomly selected case samples in line with the purpose of the research [11]. At the same time, the credibility of the information collected by this method is considered to be higher [12].

2.3. Data Collection

In-depth interviews are considered to be a type of qualitative research, which involves collecting data that is non-numerical in nature. This means that in-depth interviews allow for a more in-depth exploration of a research topic than what is possible with quantitative research methods. In-depth interviews are conducted one-on-one and usually last for about an hour. The interviewer will ask the interviewees questions about their thoughts and experiences on the research topic. In-depth interviews are typically taped so that the interviewer can go back and transcribe the interview later. In-depth interviews are a good choice of data collection method when the researcher is interested in exploring a topic in detail and when the researcher wants to build rapport with the interviewee. However, in-depth interviews are not well-suited for collecting data from a large number of people.

To collect qualitative data for this research, 20 participants were interviewed. The participants were informed in advance about the purpose of the study and the use of the interview method as the data collection method. A “Google Meeting” was organized to explain the subject and purpose of the meeting to the participants. Appointments were made in advance for the preliminary interviews with the participants. The participants’ trust was gained by giving extensive information to the participants about the research. They were duly informed that the data obtained would be kept confidential and that their names would not be disclosed. All confidentiality and ethical rules were followed. The data of the study was collected in January 2021 from participants who participated in the study voluntarily.

2.4. Analysis of Data

For qualitative data analysis, the opinions of the interviewed participants and the answers given to each question were categorized and tabulated. The data obtained from the

answers to the research interview questions were analyzed by content analysis. In content analysis, data are analyzed in four stages [8]. The data were analyzed using a descriptive qualitative data analysis technique.

1. **Coding the data:** For content analysis, at the outset, each participant was assigned a number. The recorded interviews were given a respective number of that participant. The data obtained from the participants were analyzed within the framework of the research and divided into meaningful parts, and the conceptual meaning was named and coded. The coding keys and interview transcripts were read separately by the researchers, and the necessary arrangements were made by discussing the “consensus” and “disagreement” issues. For the reliability calculation of the research, the average was calculated to be 92% by using the reliability formula suggested by [13]. Reliability calculations over 70% are considered reliable for analysis [13]. The results obtained here were deemed reliable to the research. In the coding made by the researchers, the codes showing compatibility were taken as the basis for reaching the themes.
2. **Creating themes:** At this stage, the codes were determined to be framed as distinct themes.
3. **Organizing and defining the data according to codes and themes:** Organizing and defining the data on the basis of codes and themes in qualitative analysis is a systematic process. The process of organizing and defining the data based on codes and themes in qualitative analysis is known as coding. Coding is the process of assigning a code, or label, to each piece of data in a dataset. This can be done manually, by a researcher, or by using software. Once the data has been coded, the researcher can then begin to analyze it, looking for patterns and themes.
4. **Interpretation of findings:** The interpretation of findings is done by analyzing the data and making inferences based on the findings.

3. Findings and Analysis

This section presents the findings related to the research questions. Data has been presented in tabular format and is followed by its analysis.

3.1. The Aims of VET

The first objective of this research was to examine the aims of VET. The answers provided by the respondents are given in Table 1.

Table 1. Findings on the work and aims of VET.

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
Studies and aims of VET	The aim of VET is to raise individuals who will contribute to the country's economy by improving the productive student profile of the country.	8	40%
	Professions will strengthen local capital and eventually create a self-sufficient structure.	1	5%
	Developing creativity, having artistic people	2	10%
	To play an important role in eliminating the lack of intermediate staff, in taking the front of the external workforce together with apprenticeship training, and in keeping our demographic structure intact	9	45%

Some of the participant's views on the findings regarding the studies and aims of VET are as follows:

K(12): “The purpose of VET can be defined as raising individuals who will contribute to the country's economy by improving the productive student profile of the country”.

K(18): “Vocational training is very important in order to develop creativity and have artistic people”.

We can say that VET has a great purpose and importance in raising individuals who will contribute to the country's economy by improving the productive student profile of the country within the scope of its studies and objectives. In addition to these, it should be evaluated that a country must attach great importance to VET to develop students' creativity and have artistic people as an outcome of VET. Thus, it is inferred that professions will strengthen local capital and lead to the formation of a self-sufficient country in the end. Thus, it can be said that eliminating the lack of intermediate staff will also ensure that our country's demographic structure is not deteriorated by preventing the external workforce and apprenticeship training. Most of the participants reported that the development of VET can support local capital for a competitive advantage compared to other countries for the work force and skilled people to services for all.

3.2. What Is Accessibility in VET and How Should It Be Ensured?

The second question of this study was to assess the nature of accessibility in VET and how it should be ensured. The answers obtained from the respondents are given in Table 2.

Table 2. Findings on what is accessibility in VET and how it should be ensured?

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
What is accessibility in VET and how should it be	Accessibility in VET enables people to access the professions or courses they have in mind in both formal education and non-formal education units whenever they want.	5	25%
	Accessibility is the ability of people to acquire new and/or traditionally determined knowledge, skills, and practices according to the needs of society.	6	30%
	Accessibility is the ability of any product, service, technology, or environment to be accessible and usable by everyone, including people with disabilities and the elderly.	4	20%
	Organizing and developing workshop environments according to a plan	2	10%
	It is necessary to set a certain staff quota for people who have developed themselves in this field in their businesses.	3	15%

Some of the participants' views on what is accessibility in VET and how it should be ensured are as follows:

K(11): "We can say that accessibility in VET means enabling people to access the professions or courses they have in mind in both formal education and non-formal education units whenever they want".

K(13): "Accessibility can be explained as the ability of people to acquire new and/or traditionally determined knowledge, skills and practices according to the needs of society".

From the findings of the participants' views on what accessibility is in VET and how it should be, it is noted that accessibility in VET is enabling people to access the professions or courses they have in mind in both formal education and non-formal education units whenever they want. Accessibility can be explained as the ability of people to acquire new or traditional knowledge, skills, and practices according to the needs of society. In this context, it is stated that any product, service, technology, or environment should be accessible and usable by everyone, including people with disabilities and the elderly. The workshop environments should be organized and developed according to a plan, and a particular staff quota should be set for people who have improved themselves in this field in their businesses, and it can be done with good planning. It is underlined that accessibility

is an opportunity to establish equality in education and facilitates training courses and materials for people with disabilities.

3.3. What Is Being Done in Vocational Training Activities for Accessibility

The third objective of this study was to examine what is being done in vocational training studies for accessibility. The responses related to this objective are given in Table 3.

Table 3. Findings on what is being done in vocational training studies for accessibility.

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
What is done in vocational training studies for accessibility	In the name of accessibility, promotions are carried out primarily in secondary schools, and this is shaping the VET profile in our students' minds.	6	30%
	Receiving applications in the vocational–technical education department or vocational high schools as a result of promotions	2	10%
	Showing and explaining what the young people who will study in the departments will encounter with the guidance of the guidance teachers	5	25%
	Nothing is done in vocational training in the name of accessibility.	4	20%
	It is stated that both schools and the ministry have insufficient work on accessibility, and more strategies need to be developed.	3	15%

Some of the participant's views on the findings on what is being done in vocational training studies for accessibility are as follows:

K(8): "In the name of accessibility, I can say that promotions are carried out primarily in secondary schools and it is ensured that the VET profile in our students' minds is formed".

K(19): "As a result of the promotions, applications are received at the vocational -technical education department or vocational high schools".

The findings related to the participant's views about what is being done in VET studies for accessibility; it can be said that, in the name of accessibility, promotions for vocational high schools are carried out primarily during the secondary school periods of the students, and it is possible to shape the VET profile in the minds of the students. As a result of the promotions, it is understood from the opinions of the participants that the necessary evaluations were meticulously made by taking student applications from the vocational–technical education department or vocational high schools. However, according to the opinions of some participants, it can be said that the promotion of vocational high schools is insufficient and that both the ministry and non-governmental organizations should raise awareness in both students and families more. In this context, according to the participants' opinions, showing and explaining what the young people who will study in the departments will encounter with the guidance of the guidance teachers in the schools will significantly relieve both their families and students. In addition, the efforts of both schools and the ministry on accessibility are insufficient, and it is understood that serious strategies need to be developed in this regard. More trainings for awareness on accessibility are needed for headmasters, students, and guidance teachers.

3.4. Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats (SWOT), Taking into Account the Activities of VET (VET and Training)

Another objectives of this research was to examine the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats of the activities of VET. The responses provided by the respondents are given in Table 4.

Table 4. Findings on strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats related to the activities of VET.

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
Strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats, taking into account the activities of education	Strengths: Practices are the most important thing in all training. Although the theoretical knowledge is more at the beginning of the work, the rest consists mostly of applications. This does not bore the student. After graduating from vocational high schools, a student immediately starts working as a workforce. Even if he has little academic knowledge, it only affects a very small part of his work. For example, he gets a chance to progress by improving himself/herself at the apprentice/journeyman/master levels. He can earn his bread money at every level. In vocational high schools, learning outcomes can be determined, and these outcomes can be applied to people who will follow the same path after all. It requires more frequent self-development efforts in the continuity of professional development.	6	30%
	Weaknesses: Vocational high schools are perceived as places where lazy students are preferred by the country, so it is difficult to improve the quality. Parent–school unions are not very strong in vocational high schools. The reason is that they are mostly preferred by the families of workers, so they cannot take care of their children much. They do not make any effort to care. Since academic courses (physics, chemistry, biology, etc.) in vocational high schools are very rare, it becomes difficult for students to enter the university. They must take additional supplementary classes.	5	25%
	Opportunities: Having a profession at an early age, learning by doing, the opportunity to be the boss of your own business, the opportunity to appear in domestic and international competitions, adapting to the sector by doing skill training in enterprises	5	25%
	Threats: It is a very expensive education system, and new technologies are difficult to implement; other problems include weak and problematic student profiles, the insensitivity of families, and shortages of budgets.	4	20%

Considering the activities of VET, some of the participants' views on the findings on strengths and weaknesses, opportunities, and threats are as follows:

K(7): "Even though the theoretical knowledge is more at the beginning of the work, the rest consists mostly of applications. This does not bore the student. I can talk about the strengths that a student in vocational high schools immediately starts working as a workforce after graduating."

K(2): "As vocational high schools are perceived as places where lazy students are preferred by the country, it is difficult to raise the quality. Parent-school unions are not very strong in vocational high schools. The reason is that they are mostly preferred by the families of the workers, so they cannot take care of their children much."

Considering the activities of the VET, the findings on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats (SWOT), making applications in all training is the most critical issue. Although the theoretical knowledge is more at the beginning of the work, the rest consists mostly of applications. This does not bore the student. After graduating from vocational high schools, a student immediately starts working in the workforce. Even if he/she has little academic knowledge, it only affects a very small part of his work. For example, he/she gets a chance to progress by improving himself/herself at the

apprentice/journeyman/master levels. He/she can earn his/her bread money at every level. Learning outcomes can be determined in vocational high schools. It requires more frequent self-improvement efforts in the continuum of professional development. As the weaknesses of VET, since vocational high schools are perceived as places preferred by deviant students in our country, it is difficult to increase the quality. Parent–school unions are not very strong in vocational high schools. Families are not able to take care of their children enough because they are the schools preferred most by workers’ families and families with low income and education. They do not make any effort to care. Since the academic courses (physics, chemistry, biology, etc.) in vocational high schools are very rare, the rate of students choosing VET decreases, because it is more difficult for students to enter the university. In vocational high schools, students must take additional supplementary courses in order to enter universities. As opportunities in VET, it is possible to get a job at an early age. Students have the chance to learn by doing more. Students graduating from vocational high schools have the opportunity to be the boss of their own businesses more efficiently. Students who are in vocational high schools in terms of VET have the chance to represent our country more in domestic and international competitions. As threats to VET, since VET high schools are a much more expensive education system, and new technologies are challenging to implement, difficulties may be experienced in this education. In VET high schools, difficulties are encountered in VET because the majority of students are weak and have varied problems like the insensitivity of families, the lower education level of their families, and low-income families. Technological facilities are limited to prevent the real practice of accessibility strategies from becoming a threat in VET, but the willingness of teachers and students to accept a new philosophy of education for social justice becomes a main strength in VET.

3.5. Roles, Responsibilities, and Obstacles Experienced in the Development of VET

The fifth question of the research was to examine the roles, responsibilities, and obstacles experienced in developing VET. The responses of the participants are given in Table 5.

Table 5. Findings on the roles, responsibilities, and obstacles experienced in the development of VET and providing permanent activities.

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
Roles, responsibilities, and obstacles experienced in the development of VET and providing permanent activities	Roles and responsibilities: administrative authority, protection of school fixtures, approval of student disciplinary procedures, execution of student affairs	4	20%
	Roles and responsibilities: directing the school–parent union, eliminating financial problems, solving the problems among teachers, ensuring the approval of teachers	5	25%
	Roles and responsibilities: transportation, follow-up of annual plans, establishing a link between businesses and schools	3	15%
	Obstacles experienced: financial impossibilities, lack of quality activities, professional inadequacy of teacher training	6	30%
	Obstacles experienced: difficulties in accepting permanent activities by the ministry, and the majority of those who think that the development of vocational high schools is unimportant and unnecessary.	2	10%

Some of the participants’ views on roles and responsibilities in the development of VET and providing permanent activities and the obstacles experienced are as follows:

K(3): “Within the scope of roles and responsibilities in VET, I can talk about roles and responsibilities such as guiding the school-parent union, solving financial problems, solving problems among teachers, ensuring the approval of teachers”.

K(20): “Within the scope of obstacles experienced in VET, I can talk about issues such as financial impossibilities, lack of quality activities, professional inadequacy of teacher training”.

The findings related to the participants’ views on roles and responsibilities in the development of VET and the obstacles experienced show the following issues: administrative authority, protection of school fixtures, approval of student disciplinary procedures, execution of student affairs directing the school–parent union, eliminating financial problems, solving the problems between teachers, and ensuring teachers’ approval and transportation. According to the participants’ opinions, crucial roles and responsibilities are: following the annual plans and establishing a link between the businesses and the school. The findings further indicate that the financial impossibilities, lack of quality activities, professional inadequacy of teacher training, and difficulties in accepting permanent ministry activities are issues that need immediate attention. Most of those who think the development of vocational high schools is unimportant and unnecessary among the ministry and the public are among the obstacles experienced in VET high schools.

The roles, responsibilities, and obstacles experienced in developing VET vary depending on the country. In general, VET is developed by government agencies, educational institutions, and employers. The government typically sets the goals and standards for VET, while educational institutions develop the curriculum and provide the training. Employers may provide input on the goals and standards for VET, as well as offer internships and other opportunities for students to gain experience in their field of interest.

One of the main obstacles to developing effective VET is a lack of coordination between the various stakeholders. There may be a lack of communication between the government, educational institutions, and employers, which can make it difficult to develop a cohesive plan for VET. Additionally, funding for VET can be limited, which can make it difficult to provide adequate resources for students and educators.

3.6. Suggestions to Sustain and Develop VET

The sixth question of the research was about participants’ views on what can be done to sustain and develop VET. The findings are presented below in Table 6.

Table 6. Findings on what can be done to sustain and develop VET.

Category	Themes	Frequency (f)	Percent (%)
What can be done and suggestions for the continuation of development	In the development of VET: labor force analysis of people in industries and sectors of each country, and the determination of standards	7	35%
	In the development of VET: the removal of barriers to raising students with standards (material and bureaucratic)	2	10%
	In the development of VET: the control and revision of standards every five years	3	15%
	In ensuring the sustainability of VET: sustainability is the most important issue. While achieving the goals for a certain period, the school administration and the teachers should be united in order not to move away from these goals in the long run.	4	20%
	In ensuring the sustainability of VET, strategic plans should be made in the short and long term. Support should be sought from all segments, and their suggestions should be listened to. The support of parents should not be neglected, and their support should be sought.	4	20%

Some of the suggestions which the participants provided on what can be done for the development and sustainability of VET are below:

K(4): “In the development of VET and providing permanent activities; I can suggest initiatives on issues such as workforce analysis and setting standards with people in industry and sectors”.

K(18): “In the development of VET and providing permanent activities; I have serious suggestions that the standards should be checked and revised every five years”.

Vocational high schools can be made more attractive by initiatives on issues such as the labor force. They suggested setting standards with personnel involved in VET. The Ministry of Education should work on allocating more financial resources to vocational high schools and removing bureaucratic obstacles to raising students’ standards. In this context, it is of great importance for the Ministry of Education to control and revise the VET standards every five years. Sustainability is the most critical issue in vocational high schools. While achieving the goals for a certain period of time, it is recommended to give more importance to issues such as school administration, teachers’ bonding, and division of labor to avoid these goals in the long run. In VET, short- and long-term strategic plans must be made with great seriousness. Support should be sought from all segments of society, especially from the parents in VET. It is further recommended to conduct in-depth studies on continuous cooperation and planning with the industrial sector.

There are many options for sustaining and developing VET. Some options include:

- Providing financial support for vocational schools;
- Establishing partnerships between vocational schools and businesses;
- Offering incentives for businesses to hire vocational school graduates;
- Creating awareness campaigns to promote the benefits of VET.

4. Conclusions

This section provides the concluding remarks for the stakeholders.

4.1. Implications

VET has a great purpose for the economic growth of the country and an individual. VET with a contemporary curriculum in alignment with the national priority contributes to graduate outcomes. This empowers people to actively contribute to societal and national development. A country must attach great importance to VET to develop students’ creativity and to have artistic people. The participants expressed that professions will strengthen local capital and contribute significantly to forming a self-sufficient country. Thus, it is recommended that eliminating the lack of intermediate staff will also ensure that our country’s demographic structure is not deteriorated by harming the external workforce together with apprenticeship training [14].

The accessibility in VET enables people to access the professions or courses they have in mind in both formal and non-formal education units whenever they want. Accessibility can be explained as the ability of people to acquire new or traditional knowledge, skills, and practices according to the needs of society. In this context, we can say that any product, service, technology, or environment should be accessible and usable by everyone, including people with disabilities and the elderly. We can state that workshop environments should be organized and developed according to a plan and that a particular staff quota should be designated for people who have improved themselves in this field in their businesses, and it can be done with good planning [15].

For greater accessibility, promotions for vocational high schools are carried out primarily during the secondary school periods for students, and it is possible to shape the VET profile in the students’ minds. As a result of the promotions, it is evident from the participants’ opinions that the necessary evaluations were made meticulously by taking student applications from the vocational–technical education department or vocational high schools. However, according to the views of some participants, it can be said that the promotion of vocational high schools is insufficient and that both the ministry and non-governmental organizations should raise the awareness of both students and families more. In this context, showing and explaining what the young people who will study in

the departments will encounter with the guidance of the guidance teachers in the schools will significantly relieve both their families and students. In addition, the efforts of both schools and the ministry on accessibility are insufficient, and serious strategies need to be developed in this regard [16].

The implications of sustainability and accessibility in VET are that programs and courses must be designed to be accessible to all students, regardless of their location or ability. Additionally, programs must be designed to be sustainable, so that they can be continued in the future without damaging the environment or depleting resources. The strategies to ensure sustainability and accessibility in VET can be

- Making sure that the courses offered are relevant to the needs of the industry and the community;
- Ensuring that the courses are affordable and accessible to everyone;
- Making sure that the courses are of high quality so that the students can get good jobs after completing their studies;
- Encouraging students to take up green jobs and courses which will help in protecting the environment.

There are many things that can be done to sustain and develop VET for promoting accessibility. One thing that can be done is to provide more funding for VET programs. Another thing that can be done is to increase the number of VET programs offered at schools and colleges. Additionally, VET programs can be made more accessible to students with disabilities by providing accommodations such as Braille materials, sign language interpreters, and accessible computer labs.

Considering the activities of VET, making applications in all training is the most critical issue. After graduating from vocational high schools, a student immediately starts working in the workforce. Even if they have little academic knowledge, it only affects a small part of their work. For example, they get a chance to progress by improving themselves to the apprentice/journeyman/master levels. They can earn their bread money at every level. Learning outcomes can be determined in vocational high schools. It requires more frequent self-improvement efforts in the continuum of professional development. As for the weaknesses of VET, since vocational high schools are perceived as places preferred by lazy students in our country, it is not easy to increase the quality. Parent-school unions are not very strong in vocational high schools. We can say that families cannot take care of their children enough because they are the schools preferred mainly by workers' families and families with low income and education. They do not make any effort to care. Since the academic courses (physics, chemistry, biology, etc.) in vocational high schools are very rare, the rate of students choosing VET decreases because it is more difficult for students to enter the university. Students graduating from vocational high schools have the opportunity to be the boss of their own businesses more efficiently. Students who are in vocational high schools in terms of VET have the chance to represent their country more in domestic and international competitions. As for the threats to VET, since VET high schools are a much more expensive education system, new technologies are challenging to implement. In VET high schools, difficulties are encountered in VET because the majority of the student profiles are weak and problematic students are more common and due to the insensitivity of the families, the lower education of families, and families with low incomes [17].

Major obstacles as reported by the respondents were directing the school-parent union, eliminating financial problems, solving issues between teachers, and ensuring teachers' approval and transportation. Essential roles and responsibilities include following the annual plans and establishing a link between businesses and schools. The financial impossibilities, lack of quality activities, the professional inadequacy of teacher training, and difficulties in accepting permanent activities by the ministry are other obstacles to the sustainability and accessibility of VET. Most respondents think the development of vocational high schools is unimportant and unnecessary among the ministry and the public, which are among the obstacles experienced in VET high schools [18].

4.2. Recommendations and Future Works

Vocational high schools can be attractive through initiatives on issues such as analyzing labor force challenges and sharing them with people in the industry and sectors. Setting appropriate standards based on the views and feedback of the participants on what can be done to maintain, develop, and provide permanent activities in VET. The Ministry of Education should work on allocating more financial resources to vocational high schools and removing bureaucratic obstacles to remove the obstacles in raising students' standards. In this context, it is of great importance for the Ministry of Education to control, review, and revise the VET standards every five years. Sustainability is the most critical issue in vocational high schools. While achieving the goals, it is recommended to give more importance to issues such as school administration, teachers' bonding, and the division of labor to avoid these goals in the long run. In VET, strategic plans are implemented with great seriousness in the short and long term. In this context, support should be sought from all segments of society, and suggestions should be listened to. Especially in VET, the support of parents should not be neglected. It is further recommended to carry out serious research studies on continuous cooperation and planning with the industrial sector [19].

Connecting the research to design based in vocational education becomes important for further research [20] Strategies for accessibility should not be limited to higher education [21], and guidelines for accessibility can be developed for all levels of education. VET students can be role models for all educational institutions [22].

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, G.K., G.D., F.A. and A.T.; methodology, G.D. and M.J.; software, M.B.; validation, R.S. (Ramesh Sharma), Z.A. and F.A.; formal analysis, M.C.; investigation, G.D.; resources, Z.A. and M.J.; data curation, R.S. (Ramesh Sharma); writing—original draft preparation, R.S. (Rustam Shadiev); writing—review and editing, F.A. and A.T.; visualization, funding G.K.; supervision, Z.A.; project administration, F.A. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Institutional Review Board Statement: The study was approved by the Ethics Committee of Near East University, which is EB 744 on 5.11.2021.

Informed Consent Statement: Informed consents were obtained from all subjects involved in the study.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Arpat, B.; Yeşil, Y.; ve Kocaalan, M. Meslek Yüksek Okullarında Uygulanan İşbaşı Eğitimlerinde Yaşanan Sorunlar ve Çözüm Önerileri. İcoae' 18 IV. In Proceedings of the International Conference on Applied Economics and Finance & Extended with Social Sciences, Kuşadası, Turkey, 28–30 November 2018; pp. 471–476.
- Canbal, M.; Kerkez, B.; Suna, H.; Numanoğlu, K.; ve Özer, M. Mesleki ve Teknik Ortaöğretimde Paradigma Değişimi İçin Yeni Bir Adım: Eğitim Programlarının Güncellenmesi. *Eğitim ve İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi* **2020**, *11*, 2–26.
- Karademir, A.H.; Uludağ, G.; Cingi, M.A. Okul Öncesi Öğretmen Adaylarının Sürdürülebilir Çevreye İlişkin Davranış Düzeylerinin İncelenmesi. *Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* **2017**, *41*, 120–136.
- Benli Özdemir, E.; ve Arık, S. Çocukların Üstbilişsel Farkındalıkları ile Sürdürülebilir Kalkınmaya Yönelik Tutumlarının İncelenmesi. *Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Türk Dünyası Uygulama ve Araştırma Merkezi (ESTÜDAM) Eğitim Dergisi* **2018**, *3*, 1–22.
- Aygül, H.H. Eğitime Erişim, Yoksulluk ve Formel/Enformel İşgücü Olarak Üniversite Gençliği: "İstihdam İçin mi Eğitim? Eğitim İçin mi İstihdam?". *Uluslararası Toplum Araştırmaları Dergisi* **2018**, *8*, 58–87.
- Mengi, A. Engelli Öğrencilerin Üniversite Eğitimi Sürecinde Karşılaştığı Güçlükler: Van Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Örneği. *YYÜ Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* **2019**, *16*, 147–170. [[CrossRef](#)]
- Sterling, S. *Sustainable Education: Revisioning Learning and Change*; Schumacher Briefings: Bristol, UK, 2001.
- Yıldırım, A.; Şimşek, H. *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri*, 8th ed.; Seçkin Yayınevi: Ankara, Turkey, 2011.
- Kuş, E. *Nitel-Nitel Araştırma Teknikleri: Sosyal Bilimlerde Araştırma Teknikleri: Nicel mi*; Anı Yayıncılık: Ankara, Turkey, 2003.
- Legard, R.; Keegan, J.; ve Ward, K. *Derinlemesine Görüşmeler. İçinde*; Richie, J., ve Lewis, J., Eds.; Kalitatif Araştırma Uygulaması, Sage: London, UK, 2003; pp. 139–168.

11. Marshall, C.; ve Rossman, G.B. *Niteliksel Araştırma Tasarımı; Adaçayı Yayınları*: New York, NY, USA, 2014.
12. Creswell, J. *Research in Education: Design, Conduct and Evaluation of Quantitative and Qualitative Research*; SAGE Publications: Thousand Oaks, CA, USA, 2016.
13. Miles, M.B.; Huberman, A.M. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*, 2nd ed.; Sage: Thousand Oaks, CA, USA, 1994.
14. Riyanda, A.R.; Jalinus, N.; Abdullah, R.; Ranuharja, F.; Islami, S.; Adi, N.H.; Aminuddin, F.H. The New Paradigm of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). *Edukatif Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan* **2022**, *4*, 364–371. [[CrossRef](#)]
15. Perez, A. *Cultural Considerations in Postsecondary and Vocational Education: A Discussion on Equity and Accessibility*; IGI Global: Hersey, PA, USA, 2022.
16. Raudasoja, A.; Ryökkynen, S. Inclusive Finnish vocational education and training. *Soc. Educ.* **2022**, *10*, 72–75.
17. Goras-Postică, V.; Cheptanari, S.; Negrean, M. The intellectual output of strategic planning in the service of quality vocational education. *Studia Univ. Mold.* **2022**, *5*, 17–25.
18. Aksoy, Y. A Swot Analysis Study on the Usability of Distance Education in Vocational Music Education. *Int. J. Educ. Technol. Sci. Res.* **2022**, *7*, 1274–1333.
19. Rang, G. Problems and suggestions on the teaching quality of Chinese vocational education. *Kant* **2022**, *1*, 211–216.
20. Gerholz, K.H.; Wagner, A. Design-based research—Grounding, understanding and empirical illustration in the context of vocational education. In *Methods for Researching Professional Learning and Development*; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2022; pp. 513–534.
21. Mendoza-González, R.; Luján-Mora, S.; Otón-Tortosa, S.; Sánchez-Gordón, M.; Rodríguez-Díaz, M.A.; Reyes-Acosta, R.E. Guidelines to Establish an Office of Student Accessibility Services in Higher Education Institutions. *Sustainability* **2022**, *14*, 2635. [[CrossRef](#)]
22. Weiwei, Z. Concepts and Practice Used in Vocational Education for International Development during COVID-19 in China. *High. Educ. Orient. Stud.* **2022**, *2*, 15–23.