




Correction

Correction: Syah et al. Current Challenges and Advancements on the Management of Water Retreatment in Different Production Operations of Shale Reservoirs. *Water* 2021, 13, 2131

Rahmad Syah¹, Alireza Heidary², Hossein Rajabi², Marischa Elveny^{3,*} , Ali Akbar Shayesteh^{4,*} ,
Dadan Ramdan¹ and Afshin Davarpanah⁵ 

- ¹ Data Science and Computational Intelligence Research Group, Universitas Medan Area, Medan 20223, Indonesia; rahmadsyah@staff.uma.ac.id (R.S.); dadan@uma.ac.id (D.R.)
- ² Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Shiraz University, Shiraz 71348-14336, Iran; alireza.heidary66@gmail.com (A.H.); rajabi.hossein1986@gmail.com (H.R.)
- ³ Data Science and Computational Intelligence Research Group, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan 20155, Indonesia
- ⁴ School of Environment, College of Engineering, University of Tehran, Tehran 14174, Iran
- ⁵ Department of Petroleum Engineering, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran 1477893855, Iran; afshindpe@gmail.com
- * Correspondence: marischaelveny@usu.ac.id (M.E.); shayesteh.ali@ut.ac.ir (A.A.S.)

In the original publication [1], references [1,7,14–41] and [44–76,85] should be replaced with the following new and relevant citations, as stated below in the References section. The authors state that the scientific conclusions are unaffected. This correction was approved by the Academic Editor. The original publication has also been updated.

Updated Reference Section

- 1 Panagopoulos, A. Study and evaluation of the characteristics of saline wastewater (brine) produced by desalination and industrial plants. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **2021**, *29*, 23736–23749.
- 7 Tran, T.; Sinurat, P.; Wattenbarger, R.A. Production characteristics of the Bakken shale oil. In *SPE Annual Technical Conference and Exhibition*; SPE: Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, 2011; p. SPE-145684.
- 14 Conrad, C.L.; Yin, Y.B.; Hanna, T.; Atkinson, A.J.; Alvarez, P.J.; Tekavec, T.N.; Reynolds, M.A.; Wong, M.S. Fit-for-purpose treatment goals for produced waters in shale oil and gas fields. *Water Res.* **2020**, *173*, 115467.
- 15 Cosgrove, W.J.; Loucks, D.P. Water management: Current and future challenges and research directions. *Water Resour. Res.* **2015**, *51*, 4823–4839.
- 16 Stefanakis, A.I. Constructed wetlands for sustainable wastewater treatment in hot and arid climates: Opportunities, challenges and case studies in the Middle East. *Water* **2020**, *12*, 1665.
- 17 Zhou, Q.; Deng, X.; Wu, F. Impacts of water scarcity on socio-economic development: A case study of Gaotai County, China. *Phys. Chem. Earth Parts A/B/C* **2017**, *101*, 204–213.
- 18 Finster, M.; Clark, C.; Schroeder, J.; Martino, L. Geothermal produced fluids: Characteristics, treatment technologies, and management options. *Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev.* **2015**, *50*, 952–966.
- 19 Jiménez, S.M.; Micó, M.M.; Arnaldos, M.; Medina, F.; Contreras, S. State of the art of produced water treatment. *Chemosphere* **2018**, *192*, 186–208.
- 20 De Luna, P.; Hahn, C.; Higgins, D.; Jaffer, S.A.; Jaramillo, T.F.; Sargent, E.H. What would it take for renewably powered electrosynthesis to displace petrochemical processes? *Science* **2019**, *364*, eaav3506.



Citation: Syah, R.; Heidary, A.; Rajabi, H.; Elveny, M.; Shayesteh, A.A.; Ramdan, D.; Davarpanah, A. Correction: Syah et al. Current Challenges and Advancements on the Management of Water Retreatment in Different Production Operations of Shale Reservoirs. *Water* 2021, 13, 2131. *Water* **2024**, *16*, 2096. <https://doi.org/10.3390/w16152096>

Received: 27 May 2024

Accepted: 27 June 2024

Published: 25 July 2024



Copyright: © 2024 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

- 21 Wu, X.; Xia, J.; Guan, B.; Liu, P.; Ning, L.; Yi, X.; Yang, L.; Hu, S. Water scarcity assessment based on estimated ultimate energy recovery and water footprint framework during shale gas production in the Changning play. *J. Clean. Prod.* **2019**, *241*, 118312.
- 22 Fito, J.; Tefera, N.; Van Hulle, S.W. Sugarcane biorefineries wastewater: Bioremediation technologies for environmental sustainability. *Chem. Biol. Technol. Agric.* **2019**, *6*, 6.
- 23 Pyne, R.D. *Groundwater Recharge and Wells: A Guide to Aquifer Storage Recovery*; CRC Press: Boca Raton, FL, USA, 2017.
- 24 Adewumi, J.R.; Oguntuase, A.M. Planning of wastewater reuse programme in Nigeria. *Consilience* **2016**, *15*, 1–33.
- 25 Duraisamy, R.T.; Beni, A.H.; Henni, A. State of the art treatment of produced water. *Water Treat.* **2013**, *199*, 186–208.
- 26 Rahman, I.U.; Mohammed, H.J. Produced water treatment through an integrated system: A case study. In Proceedings of the 5th Online International Conference on Sustainability in Process Industry (SPI-2020), Peshawar, Pakistan, 15–16 December 2021; pp. 15–16.
- 27 Vikrant, K.; Kim, K.H.; Deep, A. Photocatalytic mineralization of hydrogen sulfide as a dual-phase technique for hydrogen production and environmental remediation. *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* **2019**, *259*, 118025.
- 28 Sousa-Zomer, T.T.; Miguel, P.A. Sustainable business models as an innovation strategy in the water sector: An empirical investigation of a sustainable product-service system. *J. Clean. Prod.* **2018**, *171*, S119–S129.
- 29 Kayhanian, M.; Tchobanoglous, G. Water reuse in Iran with an emphasis on potable reuse. *Sci. Iran.* **2016**, *23*, 1594–1617.
- 30 Pandit, A.B.; Kumar, J.K. *Drinking Water Treatment for Developing Countries: Physical, Chemical and Biological Pollutants*; Royal Society of Chemistry: London, UK, 2019.
- 31 Shoushtarian, F.; Negahban-Azar, M. Worldwide regulations and guidelines for agricultural water reuse: A critical review. *Water* **2020**, *12*, 971.
- 32 Pichel, N.; Vivar, M.; Fuentes, M. The problem of drinking water access: A review of disinfection technologies with an emphasis on solar treatment methods. *Chemosphere* **2019**, *218*, 1014–1030.
- 33 Odhiambo, G.O. Water scarcity in the Arabian Peninsula and socio-economic implications. *Appl. Water Sci.* **2017**, *7*, 2479–2492.
- 34 Levänen, J.; Hossain, M.; Lyytinen, T.; Hyvärinen, A.; Numminen, S.; Halme, M. Implications of frugal innovations on sustainable development: Evaluating water and energy innovations. *Sustainability* **2015**, *8*, 4.
- 35 Angelakis, A.N.; Gikas, P. Water reuse: Overview of current practices and trends in the world with emphasis on EU states. *Water Util. J.* **2014**, *8*, e78.
- 36 Paranychanakis, N.V.; Salgot, M.; Snyder, S.A.; Angelakis, A.N. Water reuse in EU states: Necessity for uniform criteria to mitigate human and environmental risks. *Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2015**, *45*, 1409–1468.
- 37 Campbell, S.J.; Savage, G.B.; Gray, D.J.; Atkinson, J.A.; Soares Magalhães, R.J.; Nery, S.V.; McCarthy, J.S.; Velleman, Y.; Wicken, J.H.; Traub, R.J.; et al. Water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH): A critical component for sustainable soil-transmitted helminth and schistosomiasis control. *PLoS Neglected Trop. Dis.* **2014**, *8*, e2651.
- 38 Hutton, G.; Chase, C. The knowledge base for achieving the sustainable development goal targets on water supply, sanitation and hygiene. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2016**, *13*, 536.
- 39 Gude, V.G. Desalination and water reuse to address global water scarcity. *Rev. Environ. Sci. Bio./Technol.* **2017**, *16*, 591–609.
- 40 Radjenovic, J.; Sedlak, D.L. Challenges and opportunities for electrochemical processes as next-generation technologies for the treatment of contaminated water. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2015**, *49*, 11292–11302.
- 41 Igunnu, E.T. and Chen, G.Z. Produced water treatment technologies. *Int. J. Low-Carbon Technol.* **2014**, *9*, 157–177.

- 44 Carolin, C.F.; Kumar, P.S.; Saravanan, A.; Joshiba, G.J.; Naushad, M. Efficient techniques for the removal of toxic heavy metals from aquatic environment: A review. *J. Environ. Chem. Eng.* **2017**, *5*, 2782–2799.
- 45 He, Y.; Flynn, S.L.; Folkerts, E.J.; Zhang, Y.; Ruan, D.; Alessi, D.S.; Martin, J.W.; Goss, G.G. Chemical and toxicological characterizations of hydraulic fracturing flowback and produced water. *Water Res.* **2017**, *114*, 78–87.
- 46 Zheng, J.; Chen, B.; Thanyamanta, W.; Hawboldt, K.; Zhang, B.; Liu, B. Offshore produced water management: A review of current practice and challenges in harsh/ Arctic environments. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* **2016**, *104*, 7–19.
- 47 Pichtel, J. Oil and gas production wastewater: Soil contamination and pollution prevention. *Appl. Environ. Soil Sci.* **2016**, *2016*, 2707989.
- 48 Sonone, S.S.; Jadhav, S.; Sankhla, M.S.; Kumar, R. Water contamination by heavy metals and their toxic effect on aquaculture and human health through food Chain. *Lett. Appl. NanoBioSci.* **2020**, *10*, 2148–2166.
- 49 Abdel-Raouf, M.S.; Abdul-Raheim, A.R. Removal of heavy metals from industrial waste water by biomass-based materials: A review. *J. Pollut. Eff. Control* **2016**, *5*, 180, ISSN 2375-4397. <https://doi.org/10.4172/2375-4397.1000180>.
- 50 Ghasemi, A.; Moghaddam, M. Thermodynamic and Environmental Comparative Investigation and Optimization of Landfill vs. Incineration for Municipal Solid Waste: A Case Study in Varamin, Iran. *J. Therm. Eng.* **2020**, *6*, 226–246.
- 51 Afroze, S.; Sen, T.K. A review on heavy metal ions and dye adsorption from water by agricultural solid waste adsorbents. *Water Air Soil Pollut.* **2018**, *229*, 225.
- 52 Zolfaghari, R.; Fakhru'l-Razi, A.; Abdullah, L.C.; Elnashaie, S.S.; Pendashteh, A. Demulsification techniques of water-in-oil and oil-in-water emulsions in petroleum industry. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* **2016**, *170*, 377–407.
- 53 Fakhru'l-Razi, A.; Pendashteh, A.; Abdullah, L.C.; Biak, D.R.; Madaeni, S.S.; Abidin, Z.Z. Review of technologies for oil and gas produced water treatment. *J. Hazard. Mater.* **2009**, *170*, 530–551.
- 54 Torres, L.; Yadav, O.P.; Khan, E. A review on risk assessment techniques for hydraulic fracturing water and produced water management implemented in onshore unconventional oil and gas production. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2016**, *539*, 478–493.
- 55 Alzahrani, S.; Mohammad, A.W. Challenges and trends in membrane technology implementation for produced water treatment: A review. *J. Water Process Eng.* **2014**, *4*, 107–133.
- 56 Al-Ghouti, M.A.; Al-Kaabi, M.A.; Ashfaq, M.Y.; Da'na, D.A. Produced water characteristics, treatment and reuse: A review. *J. Water Process Eng.* **2019**, *28*, 222–239.
- 57 Munirasu, S.; Haija, M.A.; Banat, F. Use of membrane technology for oil field and refinery produced water treatment—A review. *Process Saf. Environ. Prot.* **2016**, *100*, 183–202.
- 58 Wang, S.; Zhao, S.; Uzoejinwa, B.B.; Zheng, A.; Wang, Q.; Huang, J.; Abomohra, A.E. A state-of-the-art review on dual purpose seaweeds utilization for wastewater treatment and crude bio-oil production. *Energy Convers. Manag.* **2020**, *222*, 113253.
- 59 Peng, B.; Yao, Z.; Wang, X.; Crombeen, M.; Sweeney, D.G.; Tam, K.C. Cellulose-based materials in wastewater treatment of petroleum industry. *Green Energy Environ.* **2020**, *5*, 37–49.
- 60 Barati, R.; Liang, J.T. A review of fracturing fluid systems used for hydraulic fracturing of oil and gas wells. *J. Appl. Polym. Sci.* **2014**, *131*, 1–11.
- 61 Kreipl, M.P.; Kreipl, A.T. Hydraulic fracturing fluids and their environmental impact: Then, today, and tomorrow. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2017**, *76*, 160.
- 62 Ellafi, A.; Jabbari, H.; Tomomewo, O.S.; Mann, M.D.; Geri, M.B.; Tang, C. Future of hydraulic fracturing application in terms of water management and environmental issues: A critical review. In Proceedings of the SPE Canada Unconventional Resources Conference, Virtual, 28 September–2 October 2020; SPE: New Orleans, LA, USA, 2020; p. D053S011R001.

- 63 Fu, C.; Liu, N. Waterless fluids in hydraulic fracturing—A review. *J. Nat. Gas Sci. Eng.* **2019**, *67*, 214–224.
- 64 Gregory, K.; Mohan, A.M. Current perspective on produced water management challenges during hydraulic fracturing for oil and gas recovery. *Environ. Chem.* **2015**, *12*, 261–266.
- 65 Alzahid, Y.A.; Mostaghimi, P.; Alqahtani, N.J.; Sun, C.; Lu, X.; Armstrong, R.T. Oil mobilization and solubilization in porous media by in situ emulsification. *J. Colloid Interface Sci.* **2019**, *554*, 554–564.
- 66 Perazzo, A.; Tomaiuolo, G.; Preziosi, V.; Guido, S. Emulsions in porous media: From single droplet behavior to applications for oil recovery. *Adv. Colloid Interface Sci.* **2018**, *256*, 305–325.
- 67 Skauge, A.; Zamani, N.; Gausdal Jacobsen, J.; Shaker Shiran, B.; Al-Shakry, B.; Skauge, T. Polymer flow in porous media: Relevance to enhanced oil recovery. *Colloids Interfaces* **2018**, *2*, 27.
- 68 Almajid, M.M.; Kovscek, A.R. Pore-level mechanics of foam generation and coalescence in the presence of oil. *Adv. Colloid Interface Sci.* **2016**, *233*, 65–82.
- 69 Kolawole, O.; Wigwe, M.; Ispas, I.; Watson, M. How will treatment parameters impact the optimization of hydraulic fracturing process in un-conventional reservoirs? *SN Appl. Sci.* **2020**, *2*, 1865.
- 70 Cao, K.; Siddhamshetty, P.; Ahn, Y.; Mukherjee, R.; Kwon, J.S. Economic model-based controller design framework for hydraulic fracturing to optimize shale gas production and water usage. *Ind. Eng. Chem. Res.* **2019**, *58*, 12097–12115.
- 71 Hernández-Pérez, L.G.; Lira-Barragán, L.F.; Ponce-Ortega, J.M. Hybrid multiobjective optimization using deterministic and metaheuristic techniques for flowback water reusing in hydraulic fracturing processes. *Ind. Eng. Chem. Res.* **2020**, *59*, 15298–15308.
- 72 Pal, S.; Mushtaq, M.; Banat, F.; Al Sumaiti, A.M. Review of surfactant-assisted chemical enhanced oil recovery for carbonate reservoirs: Challenges and future perspectives. *Pet. Sci.* **2018**, *15*, 77–102.
- 73 Tackie-Otoo, B.N.; Mohammed, M.A.; Yekeen, N.; Negash, B.M. Alternative chemical agents for alkalis, surfactants and polymers for enhanced oil recovery: Research trend and prospects. *J. Pet. Sci. Eng.* **2020**, *187*, 106828.
- 74 Ayirala, S.C.; Yousef, A.A. A state-of-the-art review to develop injection-water-chemistry requirement guidelines for IOR/EOR projects. *SPE Prod. Oper.* **2015**, *30*, 26–42.
- 75 Olajire, A.A. Review of ASP EOR (alkaline surfactant polymer enhanced oil recovery) technology in the petroleum industry: Prospects and challenges. *Energy* **2014**, *77*, 963–982.
- 76 Rellegadla, S.; Prajapat, G.; Agrawal, A. Polymers for enhanced oil recovery: Fundamentals and selection criteria. *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* **2017**, *101*, 4387.
- 85 Sun, Y.; Wang, D.; Tsang, D.C.; Wang, L.; Ok, Y.S.; Feng, Y. A critical review of risks, characteristics, and treatment strategies for potentially toxic elements in wastewater from shale gas extraction. *Environ. Int.* **2019**, *125*, 452–469.

Reference

1. Syah, R.; Heidary, A.; Rajabi, H.; Elveny, M.; Shayesteh, A.A.; Ramdan, D.; Davarpanah, A. Current Challenges and Advancements on the Management of Water Retreatment in Different Production Operations of Shale Reservoirs. *Water* **2021**, *13*, 2131. [[CrossRef](#)]

Disclaimer/Publisher’s Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.