



# **E**ff**ect of Graphite on Copper Bioleaching from Waste Printed Circuit Boards**

**Linlin Tong 1,2, Qianfei Zhao 1,2, Ali Reza Kamali 2,3,4 [,](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2849-8547) Wolfgang Sand 5,6,7 and Hongying Yang 1,2,\***

- <sup>1</sup> Key Laboratory for Ecological Metallurgy of Multimetallic Mineral of Ministry of Education, Northeastern University, Shenyang 110819, China; tongll@smm.neu.edu.cn (L.T.); 1810550@stu.neu.edu.cn (Q.Z.)
- <sup>2</sup> School of Metallurgy, Northeastern University, Shenyang 110819, China; ali@smm.neu.edu.cn
- <sup>3</sup> Energy and Environmental Materials Research Centre (E2MC), Northeastern University, Shenyang 110819, China
- <sup>4</sup> Department of Materials Science and Metallurgy, University of Cambridge, Cambridge CB3 0FS, UK
- <sup>5</sup> College of Environmental Science and Engineering, Donghua University, Shanghai 201620, China; wolfgang.sand@uni-due.de
- 6 Institute of Biosciences, Mining Academy and Technical University Freiberg, 09599 Freiberg, Germany
- <sup>7</sup> Faculty of Chemistry, Biofilm Centre, University Duisburg-Essen, 45141 Essen, Germany
- **\*** Correspondence: yanghy@smm.neu.edu.cn; Tel.: +86-024-8367-3932

Received: 26 December 2019; Accepted: 13 January 2020; Published: 19 January 2020



**Abstract:** The efficient extraction of copper as a valuable metal from waste printed circuit boards (WPCBs) is currently attracting growing interest. Here, we systematically investigated the impact of bacteria on the efficiency of copper leaching from WPCBs, and evaluated the effect of graphite on bioleaching performance. The HQ0211 bacteria culture containing *Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans, Ferroplasma acidiphilum,* and *Leptospirillum ferriphilum* enhanced Cu-leaching performance in either ferric sulfate and sulfuric acid leaching, so a final leaching of up to 76.2% was recorded after 5 days. With the addition of graphite, the percentage of copper leaching could be increased to 80.5%. Single-factor experiments confirmed the compatibility of graphite with the HQ0211 culture, and identified the optimal pulp density of WPCBs, the initial pH, and the graphite content to be 2%  $(w/v)$ , 1.6, and 2.5  $g/L$ , respectively.

**Keywords:** waste printed circuit boards; graphite; bacteria; leaching; copper

#### **1. Introduction**

The capability of bacteria in oxidizing pyrite and, hence, dissolving its copper content was first realized in the middle of the last century, opening a window to great biohydrometallurgical opportunities [\[1\]](#page-8-0). Modern bioleaching processes rely on the function of specialized micro-organisms to solubilize valuable target metals. Subsequently, pure metals can be extracted with techniques such as solvent and ion exchange. Bioleaching technology has the advantage of being energy-efficient without generating toxic gases. Therefore, it has been widely used to recover valuable metals from low-grade minerals, and to remove heavy metals from various sources such as sludge, fly ash, polluted soil, and sediment [\[2–](#page-8-1)[6\]](#page-9-0). Furthermore, bioleaching was found to be a viable method to leach metals from electronic waste, such as used batteries and waste printed circuit boards (WPCBs) [\[7](#page-9-1)[,8\]](#page-9-2).

A huge amount of electrical and electronic equipment (EEE) reaches the end of its life every day and ends up as waste. With the constant improvement of EEE performance, an increasing amount of such waste is generated [\[9\]](#page-9-3). Only in 2016, 44.7 million metric tons of e-waste were globally generated, according to the Global E-Waste Monitoring Report. The report predicted that global



e-waste production will probably increase to 52.2 million metric tons by 2021. Electronic products such as TVs, computers, mobile phones, and tablets contain printed circuit boards (PCBs), accounting for about 3.1% of total EEE weight [10]. Because of the consumption of electronic products, the number of WPCBs is rapidly growing [11]. Therefore, metal pollution caused by WPCBs has become a serious environmental problem. e-waste production will probably increase to 52.2 million metric tons by 2021. Electronic products such<br>as TVs, computers, mobile phones, and tablets contain printed circuit boards (PCBs), accounting for<br>about 3.1% of tota

Bioleaching, which is mainly used for sulfidic or oxidized ores  $[12–14]$ , has also attracted attention for WPCB recycling due to advantages of low cost, low energy consumption, simple operation, and environmental friendliness. Studies have shown that graphite can be used as a catalyst to increase the bioleaching rate of pyrite. In the case of sphalerite, graphite was found to influence microbial the bioleaching rate of pyrite. In the case of sphalerite, graphite was found to influence microbial<br>populations [15,16]. At present, the role and potential of graphite in WPCB bioleaching has not been reported. This study presents detailed information about the effect of graphite on bioleaching via<br>the shake-flask bioleaching process. We studied the leaching behavior of WPCBs with and without the shake-flask bioleaching process. We studied the leaching behavior of WPCBs with and without graphite addition to elucidate the reaction mechanism of bioleaching. In addition, the effects of bacteria and chemical reagents on WPCB copper leaching were compared, and the mechanism of bacteria action was clarified. In the process of bacterial growth, the role of graphite was discussed in detail. Finally, the best graphite-leaching conditions for bioleaching copper from WPCBs were determined.

#### **2. Materials and Methods**  $W$  and desktop-computer motherboards that were purchased from an e-definition of  $\mathbb{R}$  $\mathbb{R}$  received in Shanghai, China. Were company located with  $\mathbb{R}$ . We receive company  $\mathbb{R}$

## 2.1. Materials

WPCBs were extracted from desktop-computer motherboards that were purchased from an e-waste recycling company located in Shanghai, China. WPCBs were crushed using a pulverizer (SJ1000-1, Jiangxi tongyong chemical examination system type equipment Co., Ltd., Nanchang, China) and sieved to obtain a size range of less than  $250 \ \mu m$ . The obtained powder was washed with distilled water and dried at 60 °C for 48 h. For chemical analysis, WPCB powder was digested using digesting equipment (aqua regia) followed by analysis using an inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometer (ICP-OES, Avio500, PerkinElmer, Waltham, MA, USA). Obtained results are shown in Table [1.](#page-2-0) The main metal in WPCBs was copper with a content of 23 wt %. In addition, Al, Sn, Ti, Mg, Pb and Zn were present. XRD analysis (Figure [1\)](#page-1-0) confirmed that copper was the only detectable crystalline phase. Graphite powder with an average particle size of 28 µm was purchased from the Shenyang Fifth Reagent Company. Table [1](#page-2-0) shows the ICP chemical analysis of WPCBs (wt %). China) and sieved to obtain a size range of less than 250 μm. The obtained powder was washed with  $\alpha$  and  $\alpha$  and  $\alpha$  and  $\alpha$  is  $\alpha$  is  $\alpha$  is  $\alpha$  is  $\alpha$  and  $\alpha$ . The interaction  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  or  $\alpha$  is  $\alpha$ .

<span id="page-1-0"></span>

Figure 1. X-ray diffraction pattern of WPCB powder (-250 µm) before bioleaching.

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

#### *2.2. Micro-Organisms and Cultivation*

The HQ0211 culture (*Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans*, *Ferroplasma acidiphilum*, *Leptospirillum ferriphilum*) was cultured at 9 K in a medium containing 3.0 g (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 g KCL, 0.5 g K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>, 0.5 g MgSO<sub>4</sub>·7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.01 g Ca(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub>, and 44.2 g FeSO<sub>4</sub>·7H<sub>2</sub>O in 1 L distilled water. The initial pH of the medium was adjusted to 1.6 using concentrated sulfuric acid. Then,  $10\%$  ( $v/v$ ) of bacterial suspension was inoculated in 200 mL growth medium and incubated in an orbital shaker (HZQ-QX, Harbin Donglian Electronic Technology Development Co., Ltd., Harbin, China) at 170 rpm with a constant temperature of 45 ◦C. Bacterial growth was quantitatively analyzed by optical microscopy and the blood-cell-counting chamber method until cell concentration reached  $1.0 \times 10^8$  cells per mL. All reagents were analytical-grade (AR).

#### *2.3. Chemical Leaching*

To determine the role of bacteria in leaching process, WPCB powder was first leached with sulfuric acid and ferric sulfate.

For this, the initial pH, pulp density, and the concentration of ferric ions were adjusted to 1.6, 5% (*w*/*v*), and 9 g/L, respectively. Leaching experiments were carried out at 45 ◦C and 170 rpm in an orbital shaker. WPCBs contain brominated flame retardants, and these compounds, together with pH value, can affect the growth of bacteria. The pH value of the leaching samples was adjusted using 1:1 sulphuric acid to between 1.6 and 1.8 throughout the process. All experiments were conducted in triplicate.

#### *2.4. Graphite Compatibility with Bacteria*

Various quantities (0.1 and 0.5 g) of graphite were added to 500 mL Erlenmeyer flasks that contained 200 mL bacterial culture, and were incubated in an orbital shaker at 170 rpm with a constant temperature of 45 ◦C for 5 days. In addition, a blank control group without graphite was established. Planktonic cell concentration and of the attached form were periodically monitored to determine the number of bacteria and thus to evaluate possible graphite toxicity to the bacteria. The bacterial suspension was centrifuged at low speed, and the supernatant was used for the determination of planktonic bacteria. The same volume of PBS buffer was added to the centrifuge tube after the supernatant was removed, followed by centrifugation by a vortex oscillator (Vortex Genie 2) for several minutes. The supernatant was absorbed by centrifugation for the determination the attached bacteria.

#### *2.5. Pulp-Density E*ff*ect*

Various quantities of WPCBs (0, 2, 4, 10, and 20 g) were added to 500 mL Erlenmeyer flasks containing 200 mL bacterial culture for the biological experiments. The flasks were incubated at 45 ◦C and 170 rpm in an orbital shaker for 5 days. Cell concentration, copper-leaching percentage, and redox potential  $(E_h)$ , which was measured with a Pt electrode by using a calomel electrode (Hg/Hg<sub>2</sub>Cl<sub>2</sub>), were periodically monitored to determine the tolerance of bacteria to WPCBs. All experiments were done in triplicate.

#### *2.6. Graphite E*ff*ect*

To evaluate the impact of graphite, experiments were conducted in 500 mL flasks containing 200 mL bacterial culture with the addition of various amounts of graphite  $(0, 0.1, 0.3,$  and  $0.5$  g). The initial redox potential and inoculum were 650 mV and  $3 \times 10^8$  cells per mL, respectively. The flasks were preincubated at 45 °C and 170 rpm in an orbital shaker for 3 days, and then 4 g dried WPCB

<span id="page-3-0"></span>powder for leaching was added for 5 days. All experiments were carried out in triplicate on the basis of the flowchart shown in Figure [2.](#page-3-0)



**Figure 2.** Flow diagram of conducted experiments to evaluate graphite function in WPCB connectively bioleaching. copper bioleaching.

#### *2.7. Analytical Methods*

*2.7. Analytical Methods*  Shanghai, China). *E<sub>h</sub>* was monitored by calomel electrode (TM39, INESA Scientific Instrument Co., Ltd., Shanghai, China). The phase composition of the samples was studied by X-ray diffraction (XRD, Cu target, Kα rays, Philips X' pert, PANalytical, Westborough, MA, USA). The morphology and chemical composition of powders were analyzed by scanning electron microscopy (SEM, SU-8010, Hitachi high technology Co., Ltd., Tokyo, Japan), equipped with an energy dispersive spectroscope (EDS). Thermo Nicolet 380 Fourier transform infrared spectrometer (Thermo Fisher, Cambridge, MA, USA) was used to measure the infrared spectrum (FT-IR).  $Fe^{2+}$  and  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration was measured by potassium dichromate titration and iodometry, respectively. Copper leaching was evaluated using by potation and iodometry, respectively. Copyright was evaluated using was evaluat The pH of the leachate was measured by a pH meter (pHS-25, INESA Scientific Instrument Co., Equation (1):

$$
copper leading percent = C_1/C_2 \times 100\%,
$$
 (1)

where  $C_1$  is copper concentration in the leachate, and  $C_2$  is the initial WPCB copper concentration.

## 2.8. Statistical Experiment Design

All experiments were done in triplicate. The data are presented as means ± SD to evaluate the statistical significance between the 3 parametric groups. Statistical analysis was conducted with Origin<br> $s_{\text{1}}$  software. 9.0 software.

## 3. Results and Discussion

### 3.1. Chemical Leaching

*3.1. Chemical Leaching*  The performance of the leaching and bioleaching processes to extract copper from WPCBs higher performance than that of chemical leaching. With the increase of leaching time, copper leaching in a sterile ferric sulfate increased to a maximum value of 44% after around 3 days, and then fluctuated around this value at longer leaching periods. The efficiency of copper leaching in the acid solution was far less than that of the ferric sulfate, so that only 9% copper leaching was recorded after 3 days. At this time, the copper leaching of the bacterial group was found to be 60%, which was further increased to  $\mathbf{S}$  is that of the ferric sulfate, so that only 9% conditate, so that only 9% copper leads was recorded after leads depended on experiment conditions, as exhibited in Figure [3.](#page-4-0) Copper-bioleaching extraction had

<span id="page-4-0"></span>76% after 5 days. Interestingly, with the presence of 0.12 g graphite, leaching performance was increased to a value of 80%, demonstrating the positive impact of graphite in enhancing bioleaching performance.



Figure 3. Copper-leaching percentage (mean  $\pm$  SD) versus leaching time under different conditions (bacteria without graphite; bacteria with 0.6 g/L graphite; pH = 1.6 sulfuric acid and 9 g/L ferric sulfate, respectively; other conditions: 45 ℃, 170 rpm).

## *3.2. Graphite Compatibility with Bacteria 3.2. Graphite Compatibility with Bacteria 3.2. Graphite Compatibility with Bacteria*

Graphite is often used in various applications and types of equipment. However, the use of graphite for the microbial leaching of WPCBs has not been reported in the literature. Before the catalytic experiment, compatibility between bacterial culture and graphite was tested. As can be seen in Figure 4, th[e b](#page-4-1)acteria in the assays with the graphite grew in free form and were adsorbed. The number of free and adsorbed bacteria was  $1.7 \times 10^8$  and  $1.3 \times 10^8$ , respectively. The total number was equal to the control assay, which was  $2.9 \times 10^8$ . Results indicated that graphite did not inhibit the growth of bacteria. growth of bacteria. growth of bacteria.

<span id="page-4-1"></span>

Figure 4. Planktonic- and attached-cell concentration (mean  $\pm$  SD) during bacterial growth with graphite addition (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 0.5 g/L graphite, 45 °C, 170 rpm).

The infrared spectra of the original graphite sample and of the graphite sample treated by bacteria are shown in Figure [5.](#page-5-0) The graphite involved in bacterial growth exhibited  $v_3$  stretching vibration peaks for SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> at 1183 and 1082 cm<sup>-1</sup>. FeO<sub>6</sub> octahedral vibration appeared at 468 cm<sup>-1</sup>, indicating that jarosite was attached to the surface of the graphite material [\[17\]](#page-9-10). In addition, a stretching vibration Peak related to the saturated C=O bond appeared at 1737 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Other peaks that were detected in the spectrum include a  $-NO_2$  peak at 1510 cm<sup>-1</sup>, benzene ring C=C at 1463 cm<sup>-1</sup>, aliphatic C=O at  $1500$ 1387 cm<sup>-1</sup>, acetate C=O or aryl ether at 1239 cm<sup>-1</sup>, and aromatic compounds at 833 and 738 cm<sup>-1</sup> [\[18\]](#page-9-11).  $1387 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ , acetate C=O or aryl ether at 1239 cm<sup>-1</sup>, and aromatic compounds at 833 and 738 cm<sup>-1</sup>.

<span id="page-5-0"></span>

Figure 5. FT-IR spectra of graphite in bacterial growth after coculture for 5 days: (a) before co-culture; (b) after co-culture (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 0.5 g/L graphite, 45 °C, 170 rpm).

Graphite morphology before and after being used in the leaching process is shown in Figure 6. As can be seen in Figure [6a](#page-5-1), the raw graphite material contained curved graphite flakes with a layered structure. The morphology of the graphite sample after interaction with the bacteria is shown in Figure [6b](#page-5-1). Obviously, graphite flakes accumulated, reducing their surface area. On the other hand, such accumulated carbon particles can form flat substrates on which bacteria can be attached. such accumulated carbon particles can form flat substrates on which bacteria can be attached.

<span id="page-5-1"></span>

Figure 6. SEM graphite micrographs in bacterial growth after coculture for 5 days: (a) before co-culture; (b) after co-culture (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 0.5 g/L graphite, 45 °C, 170 rpm).

## *3.3. Pulp-Density Effect 3.3. Pulp-Density Effect 3.3. Pulp-Density E*ff*ect*

Figure [7](#page-6-0) shows the bacterial-growth curve, redox potential (*Eh*), and copper leaching for assays Figure 7 shows the bacterial-growth curve, redox potential (*Eh*), and copper leaching for assays with up to 10% (*w*/*v*) pulp density. With the increase of pulp density, the growth of bacteria so that, at  $10\%$  pulp density, cell concentration was far less than  $1.0 \times 10^8$  cells per mL. This is because Figure 7 shows the bacterial-growth curve, redox potential (*Eh*), and copper leaching for assays with up to 10% (*w*/*v*) pulp density. With the increase of pulp density, the growth of bacteria decreased, where  $\frac{100}{\pi}$  (*w*/*v*) pulp density. With the increase of pulse  $\frac{100}{\pi}$ ,  $\frac{100}{\pi}$ so that, at 10% pulp density, cell concentration was far less than  $1.0 \times 10^8$  cells per mL. This is because

friction between particles was promoted with the increase of pulp concentration, hindering bacterial growth. In fact, the bacteria's tolerance was reduced in the presence of a large quantity of heavy-metal species [\[19,](#page-9-12)[20\]](#page-9-13). On the other hand, Figure [7b](#page-6-0) and Equations (2) and (3) [\[21\]](#page-9-14) indicate that the redox potential initially decreased with increasing bioleaching time due to the presence of trivalent iron oxide copper. Then, potential increased at longer periods since the bacteria adapted to the environment [\[19\]](#page-9-12). Copper-leaching percentage decreased with increasing WPCB dosage (Figure [7c](#page-6-0)). At 1% (*w*/*v*) and 2% (*w*/*v*) pulp density, bacteria adapted well in terms of the leaching environment. In this study, maximum leaching for copper was obtained at 1% (*w*/*v*) pulp density. The leaching percentage at 1% (*w*/*v*) and 2% (*w*/*v*) pulp density was almost the same after 5 days, and copper leaching reached 90% after 3 days. When continuing to increase pulp density to 10%, copper-leaching percentage was only 35%. High WPCB dosage resulted in lower copper extraction partly due to limitations in air distribution and oxygen mass transfer, which inhibited the oxidation efficiency of  $Fe^{2+}$  by the bacteria [\[8,](#page-9-2)[22,](#page-9-15)[23\]](#page-9-16). In addition, copper concentration increased with WPCB dosage. It can be seen from the Figure [7a](#page-6-0) that the ability of bacteria to resist copper decreased. Considering the obtained results for bacterial growth and copper leaching, a pulp density of 2% was selected for the subsequent experiments.

$$
Cu + 2Fe^{3+} \rightarrow Cu^{2+} + 2Fe^{2+}
$$
 (2)

$$
4Fe^{2+} + 4H^{+} + O_{2} \stackrel{HQ0211}{\rightarrow} 4Fe^{3+} + 2H_{2}O \tag{3}
$$

<span id="page-6-0"></span>

Figure 7. (a) Cell concentration, (b) redox potential, and (c) copper-leaching percentage (mean  $\pm$  SD) during copper bioleaching at different WPCB pulp densities (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 45 °C, 170 rpm). during copper bioleaching at different WPCB pulp densities (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 45 ◦C, 170 rpm).

### *3.4. Graphite Effect on Copper Bioleaching 3.4. Graphite E*ff*ect on Copper Bioleaching*

The effect of graphite on copper ion concentration in the bacterial leaching assays is shown in The effect of graphite on copper ion concentration in the bacterial leaching assays is shown in Figure [8.](#page-7-0) As depicted, in the absence of graphite, the leaching of copper from WPCBs amounted to Figure 8. As depicted, in the absence of graphite, the leaching of copper from WPCBs amounted to 90%

<span id="page-7-0"></span>after 5 days. Leaching performance increased with the increase of graphite addition, so that the final copper concentration in the bioleaching assays, with the presence of 0.5, 1.5, and 2.5 g/L of graphite, was detected to be 93.66%, 95.22%, and 100%, respectively. As shown in Figure [4,](#page-4-1) some bacteria were adsorbed on the graphite surface. As discussed, the main mechanism involved in the bioleaching of copper from WPCBs is  $Fe<sup>3+</sup>$  oxidation. Graphite can act as the cathode accelerating the dissolution of copper anodes [\[16\]](#page-9-9). *Minerals* **2020**, *10*, x FOR PEER REVIEW 8 of 10



**Figure 8.** Copper-leaching percentage (mean ± SD) during WPCB bioleaching at different graphite **Figure 8.** Copper-leaching percentage (mean ± SD) during WPCB bioleaching at different graphite concentrations (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 2% (*w*/*v*) pulp density, 45 °C, 170 rpm). concentrations (other conditions: 1.6 pH, 2% (*w*/*v*) pulp density, 45 ◦C, 170 rpm).

As observed in Figure 8, a 10% increase in the copper leaching was recorded by adding 0.5 g As observed in Figure [8,](#page-7-0) a 10% increase in the copper leaching was recorded by adding 0.5 g graphite to the system. In order to study the action mechanism of graphite, leaching residues were analyzed by infrared spectroscopy and scanning electron microscopy for assays with a graphite addition of 2.5 g/L. addition of 2.5 g/L.

The FT-IR spectra of the residual materials retrieved from the bioleaching bath with and without The FT-IR spectra of the residual materials retrieved from the bioleaching bath with and without the involvement of graphite are shown in Figure [9,](#page-8-2) in which peak absorption frequencies associated the involvement of graphite are shown in Figure 9, in which peak absorption frequencies associated with chemical bonds or functional groups can also be seen. The absorption peak at 3396 cm−1 belongs with chemical bonds or functional groups can also be seen. The absorption peak at 3396 cm−<sup>1</sup> belongs to the stretching vibration of O–H. Antisymmetric and symmetric stretching vibrations of  $-CH<sub>2</sub>$  appeared at 2930 and 2854 cm<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. C=O stretching vibrations for carboxyl and carbonyl groups appeared at 1720 cm<sup>-1</sup>. The bending vibration of water molecule −OH was located at 1640 cm<sup>-1</sup>, and the stretching vibration of C=C at 1507 cm<sup>-1</sup>. The FTIR spectrum of the residual WPCB material obtained after the bioleaching process with the presence of graphite is e[xh](#page-8-2)ibited in Figure 9b. The spectrum shows the  $v_3$  stretching vibration peaks for SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2−</sup> at 1190 and 1079 cm<sup>−1</sup>. The deformation vibration of O–H and H–O–H could be observed at 1004 and 636 cm<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. The octahedral vibrations of FeO<sub>6</sub> appeared at 506 and 473 cm<sup>−1</sup>. The existence of characteristic peaks of SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> and FeO<sub>6</sub> in the spectrum indicated the formation of jarosites. Furthermore, the presence of the absorption peak of  $\rm NH^{4+}$  at around 1430 cm<sup>−1</sup> demonstrated the precipitation of such ja[ros](#page-9-10)ite species [17].

Figure [10](#page-8-3) shows the scanning-electron-microscope images combined with EDS map analysis of the raw WPCB powder material, and of the biological leaching residue from the optimized assay in which graphite content was 2.5 g/L. The copper presence in the samples is highlighted by arrows in the micrographs. As can be observed in Figure [10a](#page-8-3), in the raw WPCB, a relatively high amount of copper was distributed on the plastic substrate as distinguished clusters. According to Figure [10b](#page-8-3), the total amount of existing copper in the sample obviously decreased after the bioleaching process without the presence of copper. On the other hand, no obvious copper could be detected in the WPCB sample after bioleaching with the presence of graphite (Figure [10c](#page-8-3)). These results further confirm the positive effect of graphite on the bioleaching assays.

<span id="page-8-2"></span>

Figure 9. FT-IR of residual material retrieved after copper bioleaching from WPCBs. (a) Original WPCB powder and (**b**) WPCBs for residues containing 2.5 g/L graphite.

<span id="page-8-3"></span>

**Figure 10.** SEM and EDS map analysis of WPCBs (**a**) before bioleaching; WPCB surface morphology **Figure 10.** SEM and EDS map analysis of WPCBs (**a**) before bioleaching; WPCB surface morphology for residues (b) after bioleaching and (c) containing 2.5 g/L graphite under bioleaching condition.

#### **4. Conclusions 4. Conclusions**

A systematic investigation was conducted to evaluate the effect of bacteria and graphite on A systematic investigation was conducted to evaluate the effect of bacteria and graphite on copper leaching from WPCBs. Results showed that: (1) The presence of bacteria improved the leaching of copper from WPCBs. (2) The graphite addition enhanced the dissolution of copper from WPCBs.  $\mathcal{L}(\mathcal{A})$  Bacteria could grow in the presence of graphite planktonically and in an attached form. (4) An (4) An optimal graphite addition could be recorded. In the leading and  $\frac{1}{2}$ . optimal graphite addition could be recorded. In the presence of 2.5 g/L graphite, the leaching percentage of  $Cu^{2+}$  reached 100%.

**Author Contributions:** conceptualization, L.T.; methodology, L.T. and Q.Z.; validation, H.Y.; formal analysis, Author Contributions: Conceptualization, L.T.; methodology, L.T. and Q.Z.; validation, H.Y.; formal analysis, L.T.;  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  a.C.,  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  and  $\mathcal{E}_{\text{SUS}}$  $\mathbf{v} \in \mathbb{R}$ , the manuscript. investigation, Q.Z.; data curation, Q.Z.; writing—original-draft preparation, Q.Z.; writing—review and editing, L.T., W.S., A.R.K. and Q.Z.; funding acquisition, H.Y. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This study was financially supported by the Special Fund for National Key R&D Program of China **Funding:** This study was financially supported by the Special Fund for National Key R&D Program of China (2018YFC1902001) and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (U1608254). (2018YFC1902001) and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (U1608254).

Acknowledgments: We are very grateful to the Northeastern University Testing Center and Laboratory, School of Metallurgy, Northeastern University.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest. **Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## **References References**

- <span id="page-8-0"></span>1. Colmer, A.R.; Hinkle, M.E. The Role of Microorganisms in Acid Mine Drainage: A Preliminary Report. 1. Colmer, A.R.; Hinkle, M.E. The Role of Microorganisms in Acid Mine Drainage: A Preliminary Report. 2. Brierley, J.A. Acdidophilic thermophilic archaebacteria: Potential application for metals recovery. *FEMS Science* **1947**, *106*, 253–256. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.106.2751.253)
- <span id="page-8-1"></span>*Microbiol*. *Rev.* **1990**, *6*, 287–291. 2. Brierley, J.A. Acdidophilic thermophilic archaebacteria: Potential application for metals recovery. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.* **1990**, *6*, 287–291. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6968.1990.tb04102.x)
- 3. Baniasadi, M.; Vakilchap, F.; Bahaloo-Horeh, N.; Mousavi, S.M.; Farnaud, S. Advances in bioleaching as a sustainable method for metal recovery from e-waste: A review. *J. Ind. Eng. Chem.* **2019**, *76*, 75–90. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jiec.2019.03.047)
- 4. Fu, W.; Khraiwesh, B.; Liu, H.; Kai, L. Advances in Biotechnology for Sustainable Development. *BioMed Res. Int.* **2016**, *2016*, 7154916. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2016/7154916)
- 5. Gu, T.; Rastegar, S.O.; Mousavi, S.M.; Li, M.; Zhou, M. Advances in bioleaching for recovery of metals and bioremediation of fuel ash and sewage sludge. *Bioresour. Technol.* **2018**, *261*, 428–440. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.04.033)
- <span id="page-9-0"></span>6. Yin, S.; Wang, L.; Kabwe, E.; Chen, X.; Yan, R.; An, K.; Zhang, L.; Wu, A. Copper Bioleaching in China: Review and Prospect. *Minerals* **2018**, *8*, 32. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/min8020032)
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>7. Jadhav, U.; Hocheng, H. Enzymatic bioleaching of metals from printed circuit board. *Clean. Technol. Environ.* **2015**, *17*, 947–956. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10098-014-0847-z)
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>8. Yang, C.; Zhu, N.; Shen, W.; Zhang, T.; Wu, P. Bioleaching of copper from metal concentrates of waste printed circuit boards by a newly isolated *Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans* strain Z1. *J. Mater. Cycles Waste Manag.* **2017**, *19*, 247–255. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10163-015-0414-7)
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>9. Wang, L.; Li, Q.; Li, Y.; Sun, X.; Li, J.; Shen, J.; Han, W.; Wang, L. A novel approach for recovery of metals from waste printed circuit boards and simultaneous removal of iron from steel pickling waste liquor by two-step hydrometallurgical method. *Waste Manag.* **2018**, *71*, 411–419. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2017.10.002)
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>10. Wang, F.; Zhao, Y.; Zhang, T.; Wang, L.; Duan, C. Physical Recovery of Metal Resources in Waste Circuit Boards. *Multipurp. Util. Miner. Resour.* **2017**, *2*, 1–7.
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>11. Priya, A.; Hait, S. Extraction of metals from high grade waste printed circuit board by conventional and hybrid bioleaching using *Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans*. *Hydrometallurgy* **2018**, *177*, 132–139. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.hydromet.2018.03.005)
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>12. Mahmoud, A.; Cézac, P.; Hoadley, A.F.A.; Contamine, F.; D'Hugues, P. A review of sulfide minerals microbially assisted leaching in stirred tank reactors. *Int. Biodeterior. Biodegrad.* **2017**, *119*, 118–146. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ibiod.2016.09.015)
- 13. Rodrigues, M.L.M.; Lopes, K.C.S.; Leôncio, H.C.; Silva, L.A.M.; Leão, V.A. Bioleaching of fluoride-bearing secondary copper sulphides: Column experiments with *Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans*. *Chem. Eng. J.* **2016**, *284*, 1279–1286. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2015.09.020)
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>14. Shiers, D.W.; Collinson, D.M.; Watling, H.R. Life in heaps: A review of microbial responses to variable acidity in sulfide mineral bioleaching heaps for metal extraction. *Res. Microbiol.* **2016**, *167*, 576–586. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.resmic.2016.05.007)
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>15. Liu, W.; Yang, H.; Song, Y.; Tong, L. Catalytic effects of activated carbon and surfactants on bioleaching of cobalt ore. *Hydrometallurgy* **2015**, *152*, 69–75. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.hydromet.2014.12.010)
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>16. Mehrabani, J.V.; Shafaei, S.Z.; Noaparast, M.; Mousavi, S.M. Bioleaching of Different Pyrites and Sphalerite in the Presence of Graphite. *Geomicrobiol. J.* **2017**, *34*, 97–108. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01490451.2016.1141339)
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>17. Desborough, G.A.; Smith, K.S.; Lowers, H.A.; Swayze, G.A.; Hammarstrom, J.M.; Diehl, S.F.; Leinz, R.W.; Driscoll, R.L. Mineralogical and chemical characteristics of some natural jarosites. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **2010**, *74*, 1041–1056. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2009.11.006)
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>18. Zhang, X.; Shi, H.; Ren, Y. Preparation of graphene oxide and investigation on antibacterial property. *Northwest Pharm. J.* **2018**, *33*, 796–800.
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>19. Bajestani, M.I.; Mousavi, S.M.; Shojaosadati, S.A. Bioleaching of heavy metals from spent household batteries using *Acidithiobacillus ferrooxidans*: Statistical evaluation and optimization. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* **2014**, *132*, 309–316. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2014.05.023)
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>20. Kumar, A.; Saini, H.S.; Kumar, S. Bioleaching of Gold and Silver from Waste Printed Circuit Boards by *Pseudomonas balearica* SAE1 Isolated from an e-Waste Recycling Facility. *Curr. Microbiol.* **2018**, *75*, 194–201. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00284-017-1365-0)
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>21. Jowkar, M.J.; Bahaloo-Horeh, N.; Mousavi, S.M.; Pourhossein, F. Bioleaching of indium from discarded liquid crystal displays. *J. Clean. Prod.* **2018**, *180*, 417–429. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.01.136)
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>22. Xiang, Y.; Wu, P.; Zhu, N.; Zhang, T.; Liu, W.; Wu, J.; Li, P. Bioleaching of copper from waste printed circuit boards by bacterial consortium enriched from acid mine drainage. *J. Hazard. Mater.* **2010**, *184*, 812–818. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2010.08.113)
- <span id="page-9-16"></span>23. Xia, M.; Bao, P.; Liu, A.; Wang, M.; Shen, L.; Yu, R.; Liu, Y.; Chen, M.; Li, J.; Wu, X.; et al. Bioleaching of low-grade waste printed circuit boards by mixed fungal culture and its community structure analysis. *Resour. Conserv. Recycl.* **2018**, *136*, 267–275. [\[CrossRef\]](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2018.05.001)



© 2020 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://[creativecommons.org](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.)/licenses/by/4.0/).