

*Article*



# **Intelligent Systems Integrating BIM and VR for Urban Subway Microenvironmental Health Risks Management**

**Qiwen Chen <sup>1</sup> , Chenhui Li <sup>1</sup> , Xiaoxiao Xu <sup>1</sup> , Peng Mao 1,[\\*](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8985-1500) and Lilin Xiong 2,\***

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Engineering Management, School of Civil Engineering, Nanjing Forestry University,
- Nanjing 210037, China; chenqiwen@njfu.edu.cn (Q.C.); 18907567350@163.com (C.L.); xxx@njfu.edu.cn (X.X.) <sup>2</sup> Department of Environmental Health, Nanjing Municipal Center for Disease Control and Prevention, Nanjing 210003, China
- **\*** Correspondence: maopeng@njfu.edu.cn (P.M.); hzxionglilin@163.com (L.X.)

**Abstract:** With the rapid development and construction of urban subways, various risks associated with human health and wellbeing within subway microenvironments have seriously increased. However, only a few intelligent systems have been validated as suitable for facilitating the management of subway environments. Field tests can be time-consuming and inefficient, and questionnaires often lack true intuitiveness for participants. Therefore, to enhance subway environment management, this study proposed intelligent systems that integrate building information modeling (BIM) and virtual reality (VR) for managing health risks in urban subway microenvironments. The systems were developed using Revit 2021, Navisworks 2020, Unity 2019, MYSQL 8.0, and Visual Studio 2019. Additionally, they were applied in scenarios for environmental assessment and passenger coping capability enhancement, differentiated into an expert visual-based health risk assessment system and a gamified simulation system for passenger risk prevention. The feasibility of the approach was validated with the case of Xinzhuang subway station of Line 3 in Nanjing, China. The findings revealed that the assessment system enabled experts to have a better and straight understanding of subway microenvironmental health risks and the gamification simulation system significantly enhanced the passengers' coping capacity. The integration of BIM and VR, with its design features such as visibility, optimization, and simulation, compensated for BIM's lack of providing an immersive experience for systems. The intelligent systems introduced in this study present novel models for environmental assessment and passenger training, catering to both subway operators and researchers. The innovative systems serve as a cornerstone in guaranteeing the health and safety of public transportation operations.

**Keywords:** urban subway; building information modeling; virtual reality; risk assessment; microenvironmental health risks; coping capacity

# **1. Introduction**

Urban subways, renowned for their speed and capacity, are prevalent across 79 countries, including Japan, the United States, Korea, China, Brazil, Chile, and Colombia [\[1,](#page-20-0)[2\]](#page-20-1). Globally, subway networks spanned approximately 36,854.20 km in 2021, facilitating nearly 39.67 billion passenger journeys [\[3\]](#page-20-2). Despite being a vital mode of transport, exposure to microenvironments within subways—such as platforms, halls, and carriages—poses significant health risks. Airborne particles in these areas often contain heightened levels of iron, manganese, chromium, nickel, and copper, posing severe health hazards [\[4,](#page-20-3)[5\]](#page-20-4). Furthermore, concentrations of PM,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , VOCs, bacteria, and fungi in underground stations exceed permissible limits set by WHO, ASHRAE, and US EPA by 1.1–13.2 times [\[6\]](#page-20-5). Excessive exposure to respirable particulate matter can exacerbate chronic health conditions like lung dysfunction and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease [\[7\]](#page-20-6). The predominantly underground nature of subways, with limited natural ventilation, can also facilitate virus transmission [\[8\]](#page-20-7), leading to concerns about passenger safety and health [\[9\]](#page-20-8).



**Citation:** Chen, Q.; Li, C.; Xu, X.; Mao, P.; Xiong, L. Intelligent Systems Integrating BIM and VR for Urban Subway Microenvironmental Health Risks Management. *Buildings* **2024**, *14*, 1912. [https://doi.org/10.3390/](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings14071912) [buildings14071912](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings14071912)

Academic Editor: Jiying Liu

Received: 22 February 2024 Revised: 28 May 2024 Accepted: 14 June 2024 Published: 22 June 2024



**Copyright:** © 2024 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license [\(https://](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) [creativecommons.org/licenses/by/](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)  $4.0/$ ).

The growing concern over health risks in urban subway microenvironments has spurred interest [\[10\]](#page-20-9). Addressing these concerns requires intelligent systems. Current research often relies on field tests and questionnaires to study subway microenvironmental health risks [\[11–](#page-20-10)[13\]](#page-20-11). For instance, questionnaires involving 399 subway construction professionals aimed to understand factors impacting the safety of Chinese subway projects [\[11\]](#page-20-10). Additionally, tools like air velocity meters and portable  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  analyzers were used to assess environmental quality in Nanjing's subway system [\[13\]](#page-20-11). However, field tests are timeconsuming and inefficient [\[14,](#page-20-12)[15\]](#page-21-0), often taking months or years to complete [\[16\]](#page-21-1). They also lack comprehensive scenarios [\[17](#page-21-2)[,18\]](#page-21-3), rarely covering extreme risk levels simultaneously. Ethical concerns further limit extreme scenario testing due to potential health risks to participants [\[19,](#page-21-4)[20\]](#page-21-5). Questionnaires, while overcoming some field test limitations, have their drawbacks. Participants can only visualize scenarios through descriptions on paper, lacking the immersive experience of subway microenvironments [\[21\]](#page-21-6). To address these challenges, this study proposes intelligent systems capable of constructing comprehensive subway microenvironmental scenarios, efficiently collecting data, and providing an immersive experience to enhance passenger coping abilities.

This study integrated building information modeling (BIM) with virtual reality (VR) for the management of health risks in the urban subway microenvironment. In a broader context, BIM involves collaboration among individuals, information systems, databases, and software. It can encompass hardware, tangible and intangible resources, as well as knowledge. BIM in a stricter sense refers to the semantic database associated with the construction object, which accompanies it throughout its life cycle [\[22\]](#page-21-7). The rapid development of BIM and VR lays the foundation for establishing the approach. BIM, which is widely applied in the construction field, possesses characteristics of visualization and simulation. It also demonstrates a high capability to build a 3D subway environment with various scenarios. It could play a promising role in the operation of subways, especially in the management of microenvironments such as platforms, station halls, and carriages [\[23,](#page-21-8)[24\]](#page-21-9). Moreover, VR allows for human-computer interaction through computer-generated simulations, creating a virtual environment. With the application of BIM and VR, participants can immerse themselves in subway platforms, halls, and carriages with different levels of humidity, light brightness, crowd density, and other site conditions in virtual environment.

This study aimed to overcome the shortcomings of lengthy and incomplete field tests and the lack of intuitiveness in questionnaires by creating a BIM and VR-combined system to facilitate subway environment management. Based on different application functions, systems included the assessment of health risks and the improvement of behavioral capacity by building a visualized 3D scene with BIM and providing an immersive experience with VR. Firstly, research on subway microenvironmental health risks using standard approaches and research applying BIM or VR are introduced respectively. Then, this study constructed a framework based on the proposed BIM-VR approach to develop an expert visual-based health risk assessment system and a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. Finally, the feasibility of systems was validated through a case study of Nanjing Subway Line 3 (Xinzhuang Station). This study introduced intelligent systems for assessing health risks intuitively and easily and improving passenger coping capacity in the subway microenvironment, which plays a pioneering and fundamental role for the healthy and safe operation of the public transportation. Actually, the intelligent system developed in this paper has already been applied as a data collection system in the study by Chen et al. (2024) to propose a decision support system for iterative intervention management of subway microenvironmental health risks [\[10\]](#page-20-9).

### **2. Background**

#### *2.1. Research on Subway Microenvironmental Health Risk Using Standard Approaches*

The concept of the microenvironment appears in the biological field initially, which refers to the intercellular matrix and the body fluid components within it  $[25]$ ; it was subsequently expanded to numerous other fields. Concerning subways, the microenvironment

is defined as an environment including the thermal environment, acoustic environment, light environment, or air quality, which is directly related to human activities [\[13\]](#page-20-11). Subway platforms, halls, and carriages are special microenvironments [\[26,](#page-21-11)[27\]](#page-21-12). Since urban subways are relatively confined and full of passengers, they pose a significant threat to the health and comfort of passengers [\[10,](#page-20-9)[28\]](#page-21-13). Continuous exposure to urban subways can lead to rapid changes in heart rate, pulmonary dysfunction, and cardiovascular diseases [\[29](#page-21-14)[,30\]](#page-21-15) but few intelligent systems have been proposed on how to assess the level of environmental

risk intuitively and easily. Currently, studies on subway microenvironmental health risks commonly employ methods such as field tests or questionnaires. However, both methods have significant limitations. Fewer intelligent systems have been proposed to address the shortcomings of the two methods and to better manage subway environments. Firstly, due to its advantages of reliable data and high accuracy, field tests are commonly employed in subway environmental management. Instruments such as portable carbon dioxide samplers and indoor air quality meters are commonly used in field tests. For example, in Barmparesos et al.'s (2016) study,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  levels in the Athens subway system were measured using portable carbon dioxide samplers [\[31\]](#page-21-16). Similarly, the temperature and humidity in Shanghai metro stations were measured using indoor air quality meters [\[32\]](#page-21-17). However, field tests tend to be time-consuming and inefficient, and often require several months or even years to complete. Hsu et al. (2020) expended nine months exploring the air pollutants of the Taiwan subway [\[15\]](#page-21-0). Passi et al. (2021) even devoted nearly three years [\[14\]](#page-20-12). The field test can certainly provide accurate physicochemical data on the subway [\[33\]](#page-21-18), but the approach is not comprehensive enough to assess the microenvironmental risks of the subway. For example, Martins et al. (2015) measured  $PM_{2.5}$  exposure concentrations in subway carriages, with a minimum of 20.2 µgm<sup>-3</sup> and a maximum of 91.3 µgm<sup>-3</sup> but no intermediate concentrations (between 70  $\mu$ gm<sup>-3</sup> and 80  $\mu$ gm<sup>-3</sup>) of PM<sub>2.5</sub> exposure were obtained in the test [\[17\]](#page-21-2). And the average  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration in the Hong Kong and Guangzhou subway was 10.2 μgm<sup>-3</sup>, and 55 μgm<sup>-3</sup>, respectively [\[18\]](#page-21-3). These values are significantly lower than that of ambient air quality standards (GB3095-2012) [\[34\]](#page-21-19). Therefore, the test data for Hong Kong and Guangzhou subway lack the scenarios with severe air quality microenvironments. The field test was conducted on the condition that scenarios were not comprehensive. Scenarios with different risk levels, especially extreme ones, rarely appear concurrently. Moreover, it is difficult to create scenarios of extreme conditions in real life too. Even if extreme scenarios could be created, it would challenge the health of subjects, which is a serious violation of the ethical principle (never endangering human health) [\[19,](#page-21-4)[20\]](#page-21-5). Therefore, field tests inevitably have limitations of being incomplete and time-consuming.

Questionnaires can potentially overcome the above-mentioned limitations of field tests. The questionnaire is also a well-established approach to study subway microenvironmental health risk. Yang et al. (2022) applied questionnaires to analyze the thermal comfort of the subway in Harbin (China) on 19 and 21 December 2019 [\[12\]](#page-20-13). Han et al. (2015) designed questionnaires using thermal, air, light, acoustic, and overall comfort as the comfort measurement dimensions [\[35\]](#page-21-20). His team spent nearly 16 days in 2014 conducting a questionnaire survey of on-site passengers. Furthermore, Mao et al. (2022) also used questionnaires to investigate the sensitivity of subway passengers to microenvironmental health risks [\[36\]](#page-21-21). However, one limitation of this approach was that an immersive experience of the subway environment could not be achieved since subjects could only visualize various scenarios through descriptions from the paper [\[21\]](#page-21-6), which was not intuitive, not to mention not experiencing the illumination and crowd density of subway microenvironments immersively.

### *2.2. Research Applying BIM or VR*

BIM stands for building information modeling, which refers to the semantic database linked to the construction object, providing continuous support throughout its life cycle [\[22\]](#page-21-7). Simulating a 3D state will help optimize the management of buildings [\[37,](#page-21-22)[38\]](#page-21-23). Therefore, BIM is widely used in the management of shopping malls, houses, schools, transportation infrastructure, etc. [\[39](#page-21-24)[,40\]](#page-21-25). BIM, as a maturing technology, has the potential to build a figurative 3D urban subway based on two-dimensional information. It has been applied in the performance management of subway station, safety design for emergency evacuation of subway stations [\[41\]](#page-21-26), and thermal comfort monitoring of subways [\[24\]](#page-21-9). However, the BIM platform fails to provide an immersive experience for systems. Therefore, VR is introduced. As technology advances, VR, AR, and MR are products of the integration of virtual and real worlds, with an increasing number of scholars integrating these technologies with BIM to achieve more powerful functionalities. For example, a BIM-AR system was proposed by implementing marker-based AR, enabling the viewing, interaction, and collaboration with 3D and 2D BIM data via AR among geographically dispersed teams [\[42\]](#page-21-27). El Ammari et al. (2019) achieved remote interactive collaboration in facilities management by integrating MR with BIM. In this study, VR technology was selected for integration with BIM [\[43\]](#page-21-28). VR can be defined as a three-dimensional computer-generated simulated environment, which attempts to replicate real world or imaginary environments and interactions, thereby supporting work, education, recreation, and health [\[44\]](#page-21-29). VR generates a virtual environment via computers and creates an immersive experience with the supplement of various devices such as HMDs, glasses, and multiple displays [\[45\]](#page-22-0). Introducing VR can lead to a better interactive immersive experience [\[46](#page-22-1)[,47\]](#page-22-2). It provides experts with visual panoramic views of subways and engages passengers in immersive risk-coping behavior simulation.

The idea of combining BIM and VR has been widely applied in architecture, engineering, and construction [\[48\]](#page-22-3). Complemented with BIM, VR enables systems to provide an immersive experience for their users. However, VR has not been fully advanced in supporting construction information interoperability and with collaboration, which can be facilitated with BIM [\[49\]](#page-22-4). Therefore, on one hand, intelligent systems developed based on VR can provide users with immersive subway scene experiences. On the other hand, intelligent systems can also design different scenarios for simulation according to needs and quickly collect data through computer software, effectively addressing the incompleteness and time-consuming issues associated with field tests. The management efficiency of BIM-VR has been amply proved by cases such as building seismic loss prediction [\[50\]](#page-22-5), on-site assembly services in prefabricated construction [\[26\]](#page-21-11), and construction fire safety [\[51\]](#page-22-6). However, due to the complexity of large infrastructures such as the subway, the integration of BIM and VR is still at the infancy stage. Standard approaches (e.g., field tests and questionnaires) are still extremely popular for studying the management of subway microenvironmental health risks.

Therefore, to bridge the gaps from these existing standard research approaches, this study proposed intelligent systems for the management of the subway microenvironment. Based on different application functions, systems included the assessment of health risks and the improvement of behavioral capacity by building a visualized 3D scene with BIM and providing an immersive experience with VR. The goal of the research was to develop systems that combine BIM and VR to display the microenvironment of subways through virtual reality, facilitating the management of subway environments.

## **3. Methodology**

#### *3.1. Proposed Approach*

Based on the proposed approach shown in Figure [1,](#page-4-0) researchers in this study developed systems to assess the risk levels of the subway microenvironment and coping capability, which allows for the interactive transmission information of dual users (experts and passengers).

<span id="page-4-0"></span>

which enables the interaction and transmission and transmission of dual-user. The interaction of dual-user. The

**Figure 1.** Proposed BIM-VR approach. **Figure 1.** Proposed BIM-VR approach.

The specific BIM-VR approach should perform the following functions.

Based on the proposed BIM-VR approach, we utilized Revit to construct a three-di-(1) Building a 3D visualization model based on 2D information via BIM.

BIM is an ideological concept that simulates the design, construction, and operational management pro[ces](#page-22-7)ses of a project using 3D digital models [52]. Revit, as a specific BIM implementation software, was utilized to create and simulate a 3D digital model of the subway. This software enables the integration of information from basic components such as columns, beams, slabs, walls, and detailed components like holes, pipes, and preburied items [\[53\]](#page-22-8). It accurately constructs models based on 2D information and presents them in a three-dimensional format, providing a visual model that facilitates roaming simulation [\[54\]](#page-22-9).

(2) Integrating three-dimensional BIM files, indicators, and coping behaviors to achieve a roaming experience.

Unity demonstrates an excellent compatibility with Revit, which supports FBX format files exported from Revit. BIM docks with Unity without obvious barriers, which can substantially ensure the integrity of the physical model of the urban subway. Moreover, as a powerful 3D game development engine, Unity is lightweight and functionally stable. It can operate safely and stably under Mac or Windows systems. Developers can apply Visual Studio as the C# script editor whose codes could program indicators and coping behaviors into the expert visual-based health risk assessment system and the passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system to construct the roaming VR scenario.

(3) Combining VR with MYSQL to facilitate the transmission of information from dual-users.

On one hand, Unity should read the indictors' values from MYSQL for systems development. On the other hand, the log-in information and the results of experts' risk assessment or the passengers' selections of coping behaviors need to be saved into MYSQL. Programming languages such as C# can implement the lap between Unity and MYSQL, which enables the interaction and transmission of dual-user.

Based on the proposed BIM-VR approach, we utilized Revit to construct a threedimensional model of the subway, while interaction design was achieved via VR software such as Unity and external devices like head-mounted devices. In terms of data flow, this study combined Unity and MYSQL software to import expert and passenger information and save results. Ultimately, we developed an expert visual-based health risk assessment system and a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. During application, both experts and passengers wore head-mounted devices to enter the three-dimensional model of the subway station, experiencing textures on the walls, brightness of lights, and other elements. Through immersive roam in the subway station, they provided their respective risk assessments or coping behaviors.

# 3.2. Framework Development

This study investigated risk assessment and prevention gamification simulation systems of the urban subway microenvironment based on the BIM-VR framework. The framework consisted of the following parts: (1) setting indicators and coping behaviors;<br>(2) developing and  $(3)$  developing indicators and coping behaviors; (2) building information modeling; (3) accepting front-end work for system development; (2) developing an expert visual-based health risk assessment system; and (5) developing (4) developing an expert visual-based health risk assessment system; and (5) developing a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. The system overcame the limitations of unintuitive questionnaires and time-consuming field tests by introducing the BIM-VR approach, assessing the risk level of the subway microenvironment, and enhancing passenger risk-avoidance coping capability. The BIM-VR framework is shown in Figure [2,](#page-5-0)<br>and the software used is listed in Table 1. and the software used is listed in Table [1.](#page-6-0)

<span id="page-5-0"></span>

**Figure 2. Figure 2.**  BIM-VR framework. BIM-VR framework.



<span id="page-6-0"></span>**Table 1.** Software used in the paper.

olors in Figure 2 respectively represent the five different steps: setting  $\,$ indicators and coping behaviors, building information modeling, accepting front-end work for system development, developing an expert visual-based health risk assessment system, and developing a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. As shown in Table [1,](#page-6-0) this study involved five software applications: Revit, Navisworks, Unity, afformation. Firstly, nevit is a blivi software that supports parametric If define the properties and behaviors of building elements by setting n and coordination software used in the ing project collaboration and clash detection. Thirdly, Unity is used for developing VR, AR, and other interactive applications. It features powerful graphics rendering capabilities and user-friendly development tools. Additionally, MYSQL is an open-source relational database management system known for its stability, reliability, high performance, ease of use, and deployment. Lastly, Visual Studio is an integrated development environment used for developing various types of software applications. Its strengths include powerful development tools, extensive plugin support, intelligent code editor, and convenient debugging capabilities. For the above reasons, we chose these five  $\mathsf{ns}$ , and rebars of the substments made to the substment  $\frac{1}{2}$  is crucial to establish subway microenvironmental health risk indicators. These indicators. These in-The different colors in Figure 2 respectively represent the five different steps: setting MYSQL, and Visual Studio. Firstly, Revit is a BIM software that supports parametric material visual station and station with the above solitude that suppose plannettic modeling. Users can define the properties and behaviors of building elements by setting modeling. Seens can define the properties and senatively of standing elements by setting<br>parameters and constraints, enabling intelligent modeling. Secondly, Navisworks is a project conaboration and coordination software used in the architecture, engineering, and construction industries. Its advantage lies in its ability to integrate model data from different  $\mathsf{ms.}$  $\mathbf{b}$ project collaboration and coordination software used in the architecture, engineering, and design software, facilitating project collaboration and clash detection. Thirdly, Unity is used  $\text{ns.}$  $\alpha$ . Specifically,  $\alpha$ software applications.

#### tors and Coping Behaviors. The creation of a creation umns, beams, walls, and rebars of the subway, with adjustments made to the subway, with adjustments  $\alpha$ 3.2.1. Setting Indicators and Coping Behaviors

and materials through input parameters. The creation of a result parameters results results results results of a It is crucial to establish subway microenvironmental health risk indicators. These indicators can be derived from existing research on subway microenvironments [\[55–](#page-22-10)[57\]](#page-22-11) or based on standards such as the Ambient Air Quality Standards (GB3095-2012) and the Code for the Design of Subway (GB50157-2013) [\[34](#page-21-19)[,58\]](#page-22-12). Additionally, for the simulation of risk avoidance games for passengers, it is recommended to categorize and list common coping behaviors based on previous studies [\[59](#page-22-13)[,60\]](#page-22-14). The specific indicators and coping behaviors could be changed according to the actual application. Furthermore, assigning values to indicators should align with real-world scenarios and research requirements.

## 3.2.2. Building Information Modeling

This study employed BIM to depict the 3D representation of the subway microenvironment as the foundational step for developing subsequent systems. The initial phase of BIM modeling involved data collection, which comprised two key types of data. Firstly, architectural and structural drawings of the subway were essential, encompassing plan drawings, elevation drawings, section drawings, and detailed drawings of large samples. Secondly, texture data for the 3D model, such as material properties, coloring, gloss, and saturation of components, was crucial. In the subsequent step, Revit was utilized to process this data. Specifically, Revit was employed to construct internal elements like columns, beams, walls, and rebars of the subway, with adjustments made to their dimensions and

telligent code editor, and convenient debugging capabilities. For the above reasons, we

cations. Its strengths include powerful development tools, extensive plugin support, in-

materials through input parameters. This process resulted in the creation of a comprehen-<br>circa 3D model of the urban subway. The details of the whole BIM model are massed at in sive 3D model of the urban subway. The details of the whole BIM model are presented in<br>Figure 3 Figure [3.](#page-7-0) *Buildings* **2024**, *14*, 1912 8 of 26

<span id="page-7-0"></span>

**Figure 3.** Details of building information modelling. **Figure 3.** Details of building information modelling. **Figure 3.** Details of building information modelling.

3.2.3. Accepting Front-End Work for System Development 3.2.3. Accepting Front-End Work for System Development

The login interface and user information screen were created. Once users inputted their information and logged in, this data was connected to MySQL for storage. After logging in, the user information screen was displayed in the top left corner of the page, including the user's ID, name, and completed assessments. The new image (user information screen) and<br>these gave tarts (ID, gaves, sampleted assessments) were grated. The tarts associated with MYSQL to display the latest ID, name, and completed assessments. The user information screen is shown in the upper left [c](#page-8-0)orner of Figures 4 and 5. three new texts (ID, name, completed assessments) were created. The texts associated with

<span id="page-7-1"></span>

**Figure 4.** Details of building information modelling (floor one). **Figure 4.** Details of building information modelling (floor one).

<span id="page-8-0"></span>

**Figure 5.** Details of building information modelling (floor two). **Figure 5.** Details of building information modelling (floor two). **Figure 5.** Details of building information modelling (floor two).

*Buildings* **2024**, *14*, 1912 9 of 26

Two microenvironmental management interfaces of experts' assessment and passengers' coping behaviors were designed to achieve different functions. An image as a background in the panel and some new texts (indicators, "Risk level" or "Coping behaviors") were created. Control toggles that were already filled with the risk level ("high, relatively high, medium, relatively low, and low") or specific coping behaviors such as "wear a mask" were set on the right side of the interfaces (Figures 6 and [7\).](#page-8-1) The[n,](#page-9-0) indicators' values in MYSQL were read by Unity. The judgment statements that passed in code 1 to display the assessment interface and passed in code  $0$  to display the coping behavior interface were set in the interface code. Thus, selecting the "Expert" button led to the expert vision-based health risk assessment system, whereas the "Passenger" button led to the passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. Systems recorded assessment results and behavior selections in MYSQL by empowering toggles to manipulate MYSQL.

<span id="page-8-1"></span>

S <sub>1</sub>	Internal					Personnel		<b>External</b>	
illumination	250	<200>	<b>PM2.5</b>	55	$50$	65% educational level			<b>Risk level</b>
temperature	28	$<18 - 23$	CO <sub>2</sub>	2000	< 1000			Level IV social environment	
humidity	90%	$~1430\% - 60\% >$	$_{\rm CO}$	8	$24>$	technology level	85%		High
wind	0.5	< 0.5 >	<b>TVOC</b>	0.4	< 0.6				
noise	100	<70>	bacterium	4000	$<$ 4000>			natural environment Heavy rain	Relatively high
<b>PM10</b>	350	<250>	flow density	3	<1>	emergency skills	75%		
Equipment						Management			Medium
infrastructure location pass rate 85%						65% safety knowledge pass rate			
emergency location pass rate				85%		emergency drill effect		<b>Relatively low</b>	Relatively low
High infrastructure integrity						supervision system integrity		Medium	
emergency integrity Low					emergency plan integrity		Medium	Low	
maintenance pass rate				85%		supervision strength		<b>Relatively high</b>	
emergency effectiveness				<b>Relatively low</b>		risk investigation strength		Low	⊻ $\vee$ English
						organizational coordination		<b>Relatively low</b>	<b>ESC</b>

**Figure 6.** The experts' assessment interface. **Figure 6.** The experts' assessment interface. **Figure 6.** The experts' assessment interface.

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

**Figure 7.** The passengers' coping behaviors interface. **Figure 7.** The passengers' coping behaviors interface.

# 3.2.4. Developing an Expert Visual-Based Health Risk Assessment System 3.2.4. Developing an Expert Visual-Based Health Risk Assessment System

Firstly, the three-dimensional model was exported to a NWC file. With some of the nonvisible structural components hidden by Navisworks, the model was classified, optimized, and exported as an FBX file. The optimized FBX file was imported into Unity for light adjustment and entity collision to truly visualize the subway microenvironment scene. The illumination was adjusted by the light source setting function of the Unity software for realistic visual perception. To enhance the realism of roaming in the subway scene, this study controlled the "S", "W", "A", and "D" to shift the collider forwards and backwards, or laterally (colliding in the scene), and finally achieving the unity-based 3D backwards, or laterally (colliding in the scene), and finally achieving the unity-based 3D subway station (Figures [8](#page-9-1) and [9\)](#page-10-0). Experts needed to roam the subway and continuously collect subway microenvironmental indicators. Eventually, all indicators were displayed collect subway microenvironmental indicators. Eventually, all indicators were displayed in the microenvironment assessment interface. Experts were placed in the model of the 3D urban subway scene and delivered risk level assessments (high, relatively high, medium, relatively low, and low) based on the indicators displayed on the interface.

<span id="page-9-1"></span>

**Figure 8.** Unity-based subway station 3D rendering (floor two).

<span id="page-10-0"></span>

Buildings 2024, 14, 1912 12 of 28

**Figure 9.** Unity-based subway station 3D rendering (elevator).

3.2.5. Developing a Passenger Risk Prevention Gamification Simulation System

Based on the urban subway model constructed via Revit and Unity, the same approach as an expert visual-based health risk assessment system was adopted to develop a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. Furthermore, passengers could immersively roam the interior of the 3D subway. The indicators and coping behaviors of passengers were displayed within the coping behavior interface. Passengers could choose their risk coping behaviors based on the information displayed in the interface.

# **4. Case Study**

#### *4.1. Setting of the Risk Indicators and Coping Behaviors*

For the case study validating the proposed approach, we utilized BIM-VR systems based on Xinzhuang subway station of Line 3 in Nanjing. To comprehensively identify effective risk indicators, a search was conducted on "Web of Science" using the search string TS = [("subway" OR "metro" OR "underground") AND ("microenvironment" OR "environment") AND ("health risk" OR "risk")]. The results are presented in Table [2.](#page-11-0) It is essential to note that while these risk indicators are provided, their determination was not the primary focus of this study and could be adjusted based on specific practical considerations. The indicators are numbered in Table [2,](#page-11-0) such as A1 and A2.

Using a similar approach, we derived coping behaviors from the literature, identifying nine types, which are listed in Table [3.](#page-11-1) Further research may adjust these coping behaviors according to specific practical circumstances.



<span id="page-11-0"></span>**Table 2.** Subway microenvironmental health risk indicators.

<span id="page-11-1"></span>**Table 3.** Subway microenvironmental health risk coping behaviors.



# *4.2. Virtual Simulation*

A total of 20 experts and 20 passengers were recruited in the case study, as a simulation typically involves dozens of individuals [\[42,](#page-21-27)[93\]](#page-23-20). The information about the experts is shown in Table [4.](#page-12-0) Additionally, we randomly recruited 20 students who frequently use the subway to participate in the experiment as passengers. Since the purpose of this experiment was to verify that this system can be used for training and improving passengers' coping skills, the selection of subjects met the experimental needs.

<span id="page-12-0"></span>



Participants were given brief information about the study's purpose before deciding Participants were given brief information about the study's purpose before deciding whether to participate. This study was conducted with the explicit consent of all partici-whether to participate. This study was conducted with the explicit consent of all participants, who were informed that the data would be used for research purposes. Each expert pants, who were informed that the data would be used for research purposes. Each expert conducted 50 experiments, and 10 out of the initial 20 experts were selectively invited for a conducted 50 experiments, and 10 out of the initial 20 experts were selectively invited for second round of experiments. The second round also included a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation, which provided standard answers for passenger coping behaviors. Additionally, each passenger then completed 10 experiments. To evaluate the effectiveness of passenger training based on Ebbinghaus' forgetting curve and the decline in memory retention over time, each passenger repeated the same 10 experiments two days later [\[94\]](#page-23-21). In total, the two rounds of experiments yielded 1500 expert samples and 400 passenger samples, with a 100% response rate.

On one hand, the experts logged in by entering their names, numbers, and clicking On one hand, the experts logged in by entering their names, numbers, and clicking the "Expert" button. Upon accessing the visual risk assessment interface, experts roamed the "Expert" button. Upon accessing the visual risk assessment interface, experts roamed from the entrance to the interior of the subway station, a virtual environment built using from the entrance to the interior of the subway station, a virtual environment built using Revit and Unity. During this immersive experience, they continuously collected subway Revit and Unity. During this immersive experience, they continuously collected subway microenvironmental indicators. All collected indicators were displayed on the microenvironment assessment interface, where experts provided a health risk assessment of the subway microenvironment. Since MYSQL was integrated with Unity, the results were recorded in MYSQL. Repeating the above steps (Figure [10\)](#page-12-1), each expert evaluated 50 sets of scenarios, the data of which were randomly assigned. scenarios, the data of which were randomly assigned.



<span id="page-12-1"></span>**Figure 10.** Work steps of the virtual simulation. **Figure 10.** Work steps of the virtual simulation.

On the other hand, passengers logged in by entering their names, numbers, and clicking the "Passenger" button to start the gamification simulation. They navigated different locations within the Xinzhuang station system to collect indicators (Figure [11\)](#page-13-0). Based on the information displayed on the subway microenvironment coping behavior interface, passengers selected coping behaviors from the options provided. Each passenger repeated these steps for 10 sets of scenarios. As MYSQL was integrated with Unity, all repeated these steps for to sets of seemation. The introgen was integrated with entry, an results were recorded in MYSQL. The entire immersive simulation process is illustrated in Figure [10.](#page-12-1)

<span id="page-13-0"></span>

**Figure 11.** Immersive VR simulation. **Figure 11.** Immersive VR simulation.

# **5. Results**

# **5. Results**  *5.1. Expert Visual-Based Health Risk Assessment System*

The results of the experts' risk level assessments in different scenarios (random combinations of temperature, humidity, passenger flow, etc.) were exported from MYSQL, binations of temperature, humidity, passenger flow, etc.,) were exported from MYSQL, facilitating the quantitative study of subway microenvironmental health risks. The BP facilitative study with the abouty to symmetrize complex relationships allong manaper management cators and learn from data, objectively reflects the intrinsic connections between various indicators and health risks. Thus, we predicted the experts' risk results based on BP neural networks due to their suitability for analyzing the combined effects of numerous factors on subway microenvironmental health risks. The BP neural network calculates predicted outputs through forward propagation, computes errors at each layer, and then updates weights through error backpropagation until the error is minimized, achieving<br>fitting to the training data [10]. A differedly negroy totice feature into actor as gravides a robust method for gaining insight into how the model makes predictions on a broad scale and is a common method to obtain indicator importance. Therefore, this study applied permutation feature importance to further analyze the expert samples. The core idea of permutation feature importance is to assess the impact of each feature on model predictions by permuting the features in the model and observing the change in model performance.<br>
contains the model performance. pectureally, we built notunted telationships between multators and risks using bi-iterial networks and explained the model to determine indicator importance through permutation<br>feature importance neural network, with its ability to synthesize complex relationships among multiple indifitting to the training data [\[10\]](#page-20-9). Additionally, permutation feature importance provides a Specifically, we built nonlinear relationships between indicators and risks using BP neural feature importance.

Throughout the experiment, we iteratively adjusted the learning rate and the number of hidden layers and neurons to optimize the model's performance. One successful network structure consisted of 30 neurons in the input layer, four hidden layers with fourteen, nine, four, and five neurons, respectively, and five neurons in the output layer. This model was trained for 1000 iterations with a learning rate of 0.01, achieving remarkably high accuracy.

Figures [12](#page-14-0) and [13](#page-14-1) display the accuracy of the neural network's training and testing phases. Blue dots represent predictions that matched the actual results, while red dots represent predictions that did not match. As shown in Figure [12,](#page-14-0) the neural network model achieved <sup>1</sup> an accuracy rate of 95.92% on the training set. Figure [13](#page-14-1) illustrates that the model achieved an impressive test accuracy rate of 94.67%, indicating its strong predictive performance.

<span id="page-14-0"></span>

**Figure 12.** Prediction results of training. **Figure 12.** Prediction results of training. **Figure 12.** Prediction results of training.

<span id="page-14-1"></span>

**Figure 13.** Prediction results of testing. **Figure 13.** Prediction results of testing. **Figure 13.** Prediction results of testing.

Next, each indicator was permutated 1000 times since the importance may have been unstable [\[10\]](#page-20-9). As shown in Figure  $14$ , a deeper exploration of the importance for each indicator was demonstrated using box plots. The box plot in Fi[gu](#page-15-0)re 14 displays the distribution of the data, including the median, lower quartile, upper quartile, minimum, and maximum values. Subway microenvironmental health risks are influenced by the combined effects of bined effects of multiple indicators, including key and secondary ones. Permuting important indicators can lead to significant fluctuations in intervention results, while permutuation has minimal impact. Figure 14 indicates the fluctuation of mutuation reatures based on their importance levels through feature permutation. As shown in Figure [14,](#page-15-0)<br>indicators P1 and D1 was the word important while C2 was the least important. This indicators B1 and D1 were the most important, while C2 was the least important. This bined effects of multiple indicators, including key and secondary ones. Permuting im-multiple indicators, including key and secondary ones. Permuting important indicators can lead to significant fluctuations in intervention results, while permuting less important indicators has minimal impact. Figure  $14$  illustrates the fluctuation of indicator features

meant that the educational level and safety knowledge pass rate had the greatest influence on the health risk, while the emergency location pass rate had the least influence. This was conducive to comprehensive management of subway microenvironments health risks. Currently, the health risk control of subway operators is mainly guided by standard codes. But these codes are limited to identifying, for example, the threshold values and measurement methods of noise. The existing research on subway control measures also focuses on measures taken for certain factors, such as the development of intelligent ventilation control systems [\[95\]](#page-23-22), dynamic gain timing ventilation control systems for subway internal ventilation, and magnetic hybrid filters for heavy metal pollution [\[96\]](#page-23-23). It was supposed that corresponding control measures should be taken whenever the factor exceeds the threshold, just like the physician treats the head when it aches, and treats the foot when it aches. However, in a complex subway microenvironment, several factors may exceed threshold values simultaneously. Leadership behaviors were crucial in this context [\[97\]](#page-23-24). For instance, if relatively unimportant indicators like C2, A3, and D5 exceed threshold values, subway operators may consider ignoring them if the overall underground microenvironmental health risk is acceptable. However, if important indicators such as B1, D1, A6, and A7 exceed threshold values, operators need to pay significant attention. Based on these results, subway operators can determine which factors should be prioritized and implement multimeasure controls to effectively manage excessive factors.

<span id="page-15-0"></span>

**Figure 14.** Indicator importance box chart. **Figure 14.** Indicator importance box chart.

In the future, the expert visual-based health risk assessment system could be com-with other approaches to further expand its functions, such as neural networks [\[98\]](#page-23-25), particle swarm optimization [\[99\]](#page-23-26), and genetic algorithms [\[100\]](#page-23-27). In addition, the hyperparameters of the predictive model could also be further optimized to achieve higher accuracy [\[101\]](#page-24-0). Moreover, the combination of an expert visual-based health risk assessment system, the Internet of Things (IoT), and Blockchain will optimize the importation of field data. When IoT is introduced, data such as the concentration of  $PM_{2.5}$ , humidity, and temperature, can be linked to the IoT by measuring instruments and importing data into the risk assessment system in real-time. The introduction of blockchain can ensure the reliability and security of data in the BIM-VR intelligent system [\[102\]](#page-24-1). The above two ideas to achieve functional expansion are not conflicting and it is suggested that these two ideas combined lead the direction of future research to realize the development of an intelligent and real-time expert visual-based health risk assessment system. In the future, the expert visual-based health risk assessment system could be combined

## *5.2. Passenger Risk Prevention Gamification Simulation System*

The results from the passengers can also be exported from MYSQL, facilitating the quantitative study of the effectiveness of passenger training. Jaccard Similarity, a measure quantitative staty of the effectiveness of passenger training, jaccard similarity, a measure used to compare the similarity between samples, was calculated by determining the ratio the intersection to the union of two sets. We calculated the Jaccard Similarity between of the intersection to the union of two sets. We calculated the Jaccard Similarity between the expert's standard answers and the passengers' answers, and plotted it as a scatter plot. are experit businessed and the passengers differently and protect that a section protection of the vertical axis As shown in Figure [15,](#page-16-0) the horizontal axis represents passengers, and the vertical axis represents similarity, with colors distinguishing different groups of experiments: blue for the initial round and red for the follow-up round after two days. The heights of the dots in Figure [15](#page-16-0) indicate the Jaccard Similarity scores, where higher dots signify greater similarity. It should be noted that Jaccard Similarity values range from 0 to 1, where 0 indicates no overlap between the two sets and 1 indicates complete similarity. As seen in Figure [15,](#page-16-0) passengers' performance in the first round was relatively poor, with seven passengers scoring as low as 0%, highlighting their limited awareness of protection measures and weak risk coping capacity. However, the red dots, representing the follow-up round, were generally higher than the blue dots, demonstrating that the simulation system effectively improved passengers' awareness and encouraged them to take appropriate measures to reduce health risks.

<span id="page-16-0"></span>

**Figure 15.** Similarity box chart.

decrease in similarity. The numerical values represent the difference in similarity between the two rounds. Note: Redder colors represent an increase in similarity, while bluer colors represent a

To better illustrate the improvement in similarity, we have depicted Figure [16.](#page-17-0) This study computed the similarity difference of each experimental subject. In Figure [16,](#page-17-0) redder colors indicate a greater increase in similarity, while bluer colors indicate a greater decrease. Additionally, the intensity of colors represents the magnitude of the values; deeper reds signify larger increases, while deeper blues signify larger decreases. The numerical values represent the difference in similarity between the two rounds. Overall, the trend showed that 92% of the region was in red, indicating a substantial increase in similarity. This further validated the fact that the passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system effectively enhanced passengers' risk coping capacity through continuous training.

While the study achieved good results, further in-depth analysis of passenger data is worth discussing. The system developed in this study, based on the extensive volume of passenger simulation results, can be integrated with data analysis software such as SPSS and Stata to delve deeper into population characteristics. This includes investigating whether passengers' coping behaviors vary based on factors like education level, age, gender, and occupation. Exploring these differences in characteristics can optimize the passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. The system has the potential to incorporate more elements from passengers' perspectives in the future, simulating and training habitual behaviors. Moreover, we can categorize the population based on these training habitual behaviors. Moreover, we can categorize the population based on these characteristic differences and develop personalized passenger risk prevention gamification simulation systems for different categories of people. This approach would enhance the system's effectiveness by tailoring it to specific demographics and behaviors, ultimately system's effectiveness by tailoring it to specific demographics and behaviors, ultimately improving passengers' risk coping capacities.

<span id="page-17-0"></span>

**Figure 16.** Passenger similarity difference heat map. **Figure 16.** Passenger similarity difference heat map.

# *5.3. Results of Subject Evaluation with Questionnaire Surveys 5.3. Results of Subject Evaluation with Questionnaire Surveys*

Apart from the quantitative analysis of expert and passenger results, we designed a simulated feedback questionnaire based on references of Zhang et al. (2023) [\[103\]](#page-24-2). After each participant completed the entire 4.2 virtual simulation, they sat quietly in the laboeach participant compressed the entire 1.2 virtual simulation, they sat quietly in the labor-<br>ratory for 10 min as a buffer period. Then, we invited the participants to rate our system atory for 10 min as a buffer period. Then, we invited the participants to rate our system based on their experimental experience using a five-point Likert scale. All participants provided their feedback and rated the system on a 5-Point Likert Scale after the entire test provided the system of provided the system on a 5-Point Likewise completed. In this scale, 1 represents strongly disagree, and 5 represents strongly agree.  $\mu$   $\mu$  represents strongly disagree,  $\mu$  represents strongly disagree, and  $\mu$  represents  $\mu$  represents  $\mu$  represents  $\mu$  represents  $\mu$  represents to  $\mu$  represents to  $\mu$  represents to  $\mu$  represents to  $\$ agree. The questionnaire data are summarized in Table 5. The questionnaire data are summarized in Table [5.](#page-17-1) Apart from the quantitative analysis of expert and passenger results, we designed a

<span id="page-17-1"></span>**Table 5.** Results of the five-point Likert questionnaire evaluation. **Table 5.** Results of the five-point Likert questionnaire evaluation.



Based on the scores, the overall system performance was satisfactory. The simulation system received positive feedback from both experts and passengers, indicating an improved understanding of subway microenvironmental health risks. Additionally, the majority of passengers expressed confidence in their ability to handle microenvironmental health risks better through repeated training.

#### **6. Discussion**

In the field of architecture, building information modeling (BIM) stands out as a widely embraced modeling tool among engineers, often described as "a digital representation of physical and functional characteristics of a facility" due to its robust modeling capabilities. BIM serves as both a tool and a concept that evolves with advancing technological trends [\[104\]](#page-24-3). However, it is crucial to note that BIM's primary application has traditionally been during the design or construction phases, focusing on tasks like cost control and clash detection. For instance, Li et al. (2020) introduced a budget control method for port construction projects leveraging BIM technology to alleviate practical economic pressures and establish effective cost control environments [\[105\]](#page-24-4). Similarly, Luo et al. (2022) employed BIM to create a sustainable multidisciplinary evaluation framework for subway pipeline clash detection and analysis [\[106\]](#page-24-5). Despite its extensive use, the architecture field has long advocated for comprehensive lifecycle management, underscoring the importance of safety and smooth operation during the operational phase [\[107\]](#page-24-6). However, the value of BIM during this phase has not been thoroughly explored. Therefore, this study pioneers the application of BIM in the operational phase of large-scale infrastructure projects, aiming to broaden the scope of BIM utilization throughout the entire project lifecycle.

Furthermore, when evaluating the environmental health of large-scale infrastructure like subway stations, sluices, dams, and high-speed rail stations, conventional methods typically involve questionnaires and field tests [\[108–](#page-24-7)[110\]](#page-24-8). For example, Lee et al. (2018) utilized a thermal-optical elemental analyzer and an organic carbon analyzer to measure particulate matter in subway environments [\[111\]](#page-24-9). However, the time-consuming nature of field tests has been a longstanding concern in academia. Therefore, questionnaires that can be completed in the short term are commonly used for environmental risk assessments. For instance, Yang et al. (2022) conducted thermal comfort surveys in the Harbin subway in China [\[12\]](#page-20-13). Moreover, Han et al. (2015) conducted surveys based on five dimensions: heat, air, light, sound, and overall comfort [\[35\]](#page-21-20). Our research methodology was inspired by the work of Wu et al. (2011) and Nie (2020) [\[112](#page-24-10)[,113\]](#page-24-11). In the former's study, questionnaires were used for strategic environmental assessment, but the scholars noted that the data collected from questionnaires was often incomplete and insufficient. Similarly, in our study, without the use of virtual technology, the scenarios for expert risk assessment and passenger training would be limited, as extreme subway microenvironments are rarely encountered in real-life situations. In Nie's study (2020), marine architecture in coastal cities was designed using "BIM plus VR", which compensated for the limitations of traditional architectural design methods through features like visibility, optimization, and simulation. Therefore, drawing inspiration from Nie (2020) [\[113\]](#page-24-11), our study aimed to address the limitations of questionnaires and field tests in environmental assessment by integrating BIM and VR technologies. This integration allows experts to conduct subway microenvironment assessments efficiently and comprehensively, enhancing the overall quality and depth of the assessment process.

Additionally, for training related to large-scale infrastructure, passengers typically rely on methods such as field exercises, video watching, and brochures to enhance their coping capacity. However, the audience for field exercises was limited, and the effectiveness of methods like video watching and brochure reading was often constrained. Our research drew inspiration from Rajabi et al. (2022) [\[114\]](#page-24-12), who utilized VR technology to design and model a virtual scenario evaluating the impact of education and anticipation on residents' decision-making under earthquake stress conditions. VR's visual effects are often more engaging and appealing to passengers. This study aimed to depart from traditional methods by leveraging VR technology to enhance the coping capacity of subway passengers. Previously, the advantages of VR in providing immersive and engaging virtual environments

have been extensively utilized by Van and De (2009) and Wang et al. (2018) for specialized training of healthcare workers, mining workers, and construction practitioners [\[115,](#page-24-13)[116\]](#page-24-14). It has been demonstrated that VR training can significantly improve safety awareness and behavioral capacity among users [\[117](#page-24-15)[,118\]](#page-24-16). This study further confirmed these findings, highlighting the significant potential of VR for behavioral training purposes.

In conclusion, this study contributed significantly from both practical and academic perspectives. Practically, our research has revolutionized traditional subway risk management by introducing intelligent systems that provide immersive experiences of subway microenvironments for experts and passengers. These systems offer innovative models for environmental assessment and passenger training, aiding subway operators and researchers efficiently collecting comprehensive subway environmental data and policymakers in informing government policies on subway environmental management. This is highly beneficial for managing complex projects [\[119\]](#page-24-17). From an academic viewpoint, this study fostered interdisciplinary integration among urban planning, environmental science, and technology development. By integrating various software tools like Revit, Navisworks, Unity, MYSQL, and Visual Studio, we comprehensively simulated subway infrastructure microenvironmental conditions. Moreover, it expanded the application scope of BIM technology, leveraging it to play a more extensive role throughout the entire lifecycle of construction projects. The intelligent systems play a pioneering and foundational role in ensuring the healthy and safe operation of public transportation.

Nonetheless, it is important to acknowledge the limitations of this study. Firstly, although VR devices have been improved, from desktop 3D graphics to head-mounted devices (e.g., HMDs) and VR glasses (e.g., Oculus Rift), they can rarely achieve the simulation of all senses (touch, hearing, sight, taste, and smell). Due to the limitation of this technology, only the sense of sight is realized in the systems. It is encouraged to use more advanced devices in the near future to achieve immersive sensory experiences encompassing vision, hearing, touch, and smell such as sEMG wearable sensors [\[120\]](#page-24-18). Additionally, it must be acknowledged that due to psychological and experiential differences in VR simulations, there may be discrepancies between the results obtained from case studies and actual values. Therefore, in future research, it is advisable to conduct standardized psychological tests and VR simulation training before VR simulation to reduce the probability of experts and passengers making erroneous judgments due to psychological stress. Lastly, due to resource constraints, the case study in this research only involved 20 passengers and 20 experts, making it inadequate to test intelligent systems on a wide range of people. It is suggested to expand the scope of validation in future research to include individuals of different ages and educational backgrounds, thus broadly verifying the practicality and effectiveness of the intelligent systems. At the same time, we also hope that complex guidelines could be simplified, making BIM-VR applications more accessible to urban planners and civil engineers [\[121\]](#page-24-19).

# **7. Conclusions**

Subway microenvironmental risks pose a significant threat to the health of passengers. However, few intelligent systems are proposed to facilitate the management of subway environments. This study proposed novel intelligent systems for enhancing subway environment management. Based on different application functions, the systems included an expert visual-based health risk assessment system and a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system. It also validated the feasibility by using the Xinzhuang Station in Nanjing Subway Line 3 as the case study. The case study results demonstrate that the intelligent systems developed in this study are viable. Additionally, with the assistance of a passenger risk prevention gamification simulation system, the passengers' coping capacity was greatly enhanced. The feedback questionnaire further affirmed the value of the intelligent systems.

This study has significantly advanced interdisciplinary integration among urban planning, environmental science, and technology development. It combined various software tools like Revit, Navisworks, Unity, MYSQL, and Visual Studio to comprehensively simulate the subway infrastructure's microenvironmental conditions. This has expanded BIM technology's application scope, empowering it to play a more extensive role across construction project lifecycles. Practically, the intelligent systems proposed offer innovative models for environmental assessment and passenger training, benefiting subway operators and researchers in data collection and government authorities in policy formulation. While this study focused on subway microenvironmental health risks, its framework is adaptable to various research objects like public buildings (office buildings, shopping malls, hotels, libraries, airports, etc.,) residential buildings, and industrial structures. Furthermore, there is potential for integrating different virtual technologies like AR, VR, MR, etc., with BIM and traditional architectural software to create more intelligent systems with improved information exchange and sensory realism.

**Author Contributions:** Conceptualization, Q.C. and P.M.; methodology, Q.C. and C.L.; software, Q.C. and C.L.; validation, X.X., Q.C. and C.L.; formal analysis, Q.C. and C.L.; resources, X.X. and P.M.; data curation, X.X. and L.X.; writing—original draft preparation, Q.C.; writing—review and editing, L.X., X.X. and P.M.; visualization, L.X.; supervision, X.X. and P.M.; project administration, L.X. and X.X.; funding acquisition, X.X. and P.M. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This research was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (72071115), Nanjing Medical Science and Technology Development Fund (ZKX21053) and the Postgraduate Research & Practice Innovation Program of Jiangsu Province (SJCX22\_0302).

**Data Availability Statement:** The data from this article can be found online at [https://github.com/](https://github.com/Qiwenchen12/BIM-VR.git) [Qiwenchen12/BIM-VR.git](https://github.com/Qiwenchen12/BIM-VR.git) (accessed on 5 May 2024).

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

# **References**

- <span id="page-20-0"></span>1. Sun, Q.; Yu, W. Comparison of Chinese and foreign urban rail transit system and analysis on their development trend. In *Asia-Pacific Power and Energy Engineering Conference*; IEEE Computer Society: Washington, DC, USA, 2011; pp. 1–4. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1109/APPEEC.2011.5748513)
- <span id="page-20-1"></span>2. He, S.J.; Zhi, J.Y. Study on Occupancy Behaviors of Passengers in the Subway Cabin: An Observation in Chengdu, China. *J. Adv. Transp.* **2022**, *2022*, 8781489. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1155/2022/8781489)
- <span id="page-20-2"></span>3. Han, B.; Yang, Z.; Yu, Y.; Qian, L.; Chen, J.; Ran, J.; Sun, Y.; Xi, Z.; Lu, F. Statistical analysis of urban rail transit operation in the world in 2020: A review. *Urban Rapid Rail Transit* **2021**, *34*, 5–11. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3969/j.issn.1672-6073.2022.01.002)
- <span id="page-20-3"></span>4. Cheng, Y.H.; Yan, J.W. Comparisons of particulate matter, CO, and CO<sub>2</sub> levels in underground and ground-level stations in the Taipei mass rapid transit system. *Atmos. Environ.* **2011**, *45*, 4882–4891. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2011.06.011)
- <span id="page-20-4"></span>5. Moreno, T.; de Miguel, E. Improving air quality in subway systems: An overview. *Environ. Pollut.* **2018**, *239*, 829–831. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2018.01.077)
- <span id="page-20-5"></span>6. Yang, J.; Fan, X.; Zhang, H.; Zheng, W.; Ye, T. A review on characteristics and mitigation strategies of indoor air quality in underground subway stations. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2023**, *869*, 161781. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.161781) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/36708828)
- <span id="page-20-6"></span>7. McCreanor, J.; Cullinan, P.; Nieuwenhuijsen, M.J.; Stewart-Evans, J.; Malliarou, E.; Jarup, L.; Harrington, R.; Svartengren, M.; Han, I.-K.; Ohman-Strickland, P.; et al. Respiratory effects of exposure to diesel traffic in persons with asthma. *N. Engl. J. Med.* **2007**, *357*, 2348–2358. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa071535)
- <span id="page-20-7"></span>8. Miller, D.; King, M.F.; Nally, J.; Drodge, J.R.; Reeves, G.I.; Bate, A.M.; Cooper, H.; Dalrymple, U.; Hall, I.; López-García, M.; et al. Modeling the factors that influence exposure to SARS-CoV-2 on a subway train carriage. *Indoor Air.* **2022**, *32*, e12976. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1111/ina.12976)
- <span id="page-20-8"></span>9. Wang, J.; Zhao, L.; Zhu, D.; Gao, H.O.; Xie, Y.; Li, H.; Xu, X.; Wang, H. Characteristics of particulate matter (PM) concentrations influenced by piston wind and train door opening in the Shanghai subway system. *Transp. Res. Part D Transp. Environ.* **2016**, *47*, 77–88. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trd.2016.05.006)
- <span id="page-20-9"></span>10. Chen, Q.; Mao, P.; Zhu, S.; Xu, X.; Feng, H. A decision-aid system for subway microenvironment health risk intervention based on backpropagation neural network and permutation feature importance method. *Build. Environ.* **2024**, *253*, 111292. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2024.111292)
- <span id="page-20-10"></span>11. Zhang, S.; Sunindijo, R.Y.; Loosemore, M.; Wang, S.; Gu, Y.; Li, H. Identifying critical factors influencing the safety of Chinese subway construction projects. *Eng. Constr. Archit. Manag.* **2021**, *28*, 1863–1886. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1108/ECAM-07-2020-0525)
- <span id="page-20-13"></span>12. Yang, B.; Yang, C.; Ni, L.; Wang, Y.; Yao, Y. Investigation on thermal environment of subway stations in severe cold region of China: A case study in Harbin. *Build. Environ.* **2022**, *212*, 108761. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2022.108761)
- <span id="page-20-11"></span>13. Mao, P.; Li, J.; Xiong, L.; Wang, R.; Wang, X.; Tan, Y.; Li, H. Characterization of urban subway microenvironment exposure—A case of Nanjing in China. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2019**, *16*, 625. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16040625) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30791659)
- <span id="page-20-12"></span>14. Passi, A.; Nagendra, S.S.; Maiya, M.P. Assessment of exposure to airborne aerosol and bio-aerosol particles and their deposition in the respiratory tract of subway metro passengers and workers. *Atmos. Pollut. Res.* **2021**, *12*, 101218. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apr.2021.101218)
- <span id="page-21-0"></span>15. Hsu, W.T.; Chen, J.L.; Lung, S.C.C.; Chen, Y.C. PM2.5 exposure of various microenvironments in a community: Characteristics and applications. *Environ. Pollut.* **2020**, *263*, 114522. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.114522) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32298940)
- <span id="page-21-1"></span>16. Correia, C.; Martins, V.; Cunha-Lopes, I.; Faria, T.; Diapouli, E.; Eleftheriadis, K.; Almeida, S.M. Particle exposure and inhaled dose while commuting in Lisbon. *Environ. Pollut.* **2020**, *257*, 113547. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2019.113547) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/31733963)
- <span id="page-21-2"></span>17. Martins, V.; Minguillón, M.C.; Moreno, T.; Querol, X.; de Miguel, E.; Capdevila, M.; Centelles, S.; Lazaridis, M. Deposition of aerosol particles from a subway microenvironment in the human respiratory tract. *J. Aerosol Sci.* **2015**, *90*, 103–113. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaerosci.2015.08.008)
- <span id="page-21-3"></span>18. Xu, B.; Hao, J. Air quality inside subway metro indoor environment worldwide: A review. *Environ. Int.* **2017**, *107*, 33–46. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2017.06.016)
- <span id="page-21-4"></span>19. Sandvik, K.B.; Jacobsen, K.L.; McDonald, S.M. Do no harm: A taxonomy of the challenges of humanitarian experimentation. *Int. Rev. Red Cross* **2017**, *99*, 319–344. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1017/S181638311700042X)
- <span id="page-21-5"></span>20. LaFrance, M. The disappearing fourth wall: Law, ethics, and experimental theatre. *Vand. J. Ent. Tech. L.* **2012**, *15*, 507–582.
- <span id="page-21-6"></span>21. Patten, M. *Questionnaire Research: A Practical Guide*; Routledge: London, UK, 2016.
- <span id="page-21-7"></span>22. Borkowski, A.S. A Literature Review of BIM Definitions: Narrow and Broad Views. *Technologies* **2023**, *11*, 176. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/technologies11060176)
- <span id="page-21-8"></span>23. Cheng, D.; Peng, S.; Wei, L.I.; Wu, X.; Chang, J.; Zhang, M.; Luo, Q. Application Research of BIM in the Whole Life Cycle of Metro Station. In Proceedings of the 2019 International Conference on Intelligent Informatics and Biomedical Sciences, Shanghai, China, 21–24 November 2019; pp. 79–85.
- <span id="page-21-9"></span>24. Marzouk, M.; Abdelaty, A. BIM-based framework for managing performance of subway stations. *Autom. Constr.* **2014**, *41*, 70–77. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2014.02.004)
- <span id="page-21-10"></span>25. Wiig, H.; Tenstad, O.; Iversen, P.O.; Kalluri, R.; Bjerkvig, R. Interstitial fluid: The overlooked component of the tumor microenvironment? *Fibrogenesis Tissue Repair* **2010**, *3*, 12. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1186/1755-1536-3-12) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20653943)
- <span id="page-21-11"></span>26. Li, Z.; Che, W.; Frey, H.C.; Lau, A.K. Factors affecting variability in PM2. 5 exposure concentrations in a metro system. *Environ. Res.* **2018**, *160*, 20–26. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2017.09.006) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/28941800)
- <span id="page-21-12"></span>27. Moreno, T.; Reche, C.; Rivas, I.; Minguillón, M.C.; Martins, V.; Vargas, C.; Buonanno, G.; Parga, J.; Pandolfi, M.; Brines, M.; et al. Urban air quality comparison for bus, tram, subway and pedestrian commutes in Barcelona. *Environ. Res.* **2015**, *142*, 495–510. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2015.07.022) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26277386)
- <span id="page-21-13"></span>28. Midander, K.; Elihn, K.; Wallén, A.; Belova, L.; Karlsson, A.K.B.; Wallinder, I.O. Characterisation of nano-and micron-sized airborne and collected subway particles, a multi-analytical approach. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2012**, *427*, 390–400. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.04.014)
- <span id="page-21-14"></span>29. Buonanno, G.; Stabile, L.; Morawska, L. Personal exposure to ultrafine particles: The influence of time-activity patterns. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2014**, *468*, 903–907. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.09.016) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24080417)
- <span id="page-21-15"></span>30. Weichenthal, S.; Kulka, R.; Dubeau, A.; Martin, C.; Wang, D.; Dales, R. Traffic-related air pollution and acute changes in heart rate variability and respiratory function in urban cyclists. *Environ. Health Perspect.* **2011**, *119*, 1373–1378. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1003321) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/21672679)
- <span id="page-21-16"></span>31. Barmparesos, N.; Assimakopoulos, D.V.; Niki Assimakopoulos, M.; Tsairidi, E. Particulate matter levels and comfort conditions in the trains and platforms of the Athens underground metro. *AIMS Environ.* **2016**, *3*, 199–219. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3934/environsci.2016.2.199)
- <span id="page-21-17"></span>32. Ye, X.; Lian, Z.; Jiang, C.; Zhou, Z.; Chen, H. Investigation of indoor environmental quality in Shanghai metro stations, China. *Environ. Monit. Assess.* **2010**, *167*, 643–651. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-009-1080-9)
- <span id="page-21-18"></span>33. Dybwad, M.; Granum, P.E.; Bruheim, P.; Blatny, J.M. Characterization of airborne bacteria at an underground subway station. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **2012**, *78*, 1917–1929. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.07212-11)
- <span id="page-21-19"></span>34. *GB3095-2012*; Ambient Air Quality Standards. Ministry of Environmental Protection, General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine of the People's Republic of China: Beijing, China, 2012.
- <span id="page-21-20"></span>35. Han, J.E.; Kwon, S.B.; Chun, C.Y. A study on the evaluation of indoor environment and passengers comfort in the subway stations in summer. *J. Archit. Inst. Korea Plan. Des.* **2015**, *31*, 129–136. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.5659/JAIK_PD.2015.31.5.129)
- <span id="page-21-21"></span>36. Mao, P.; Wang, X.; Wang, R.; Wang, E.; Li, H. Passengers' Sensitivity and Adaptive Behaviors to Health Risks in the Subway Microenvironment: A Case Study in Nanjing, China. *Buildings* **2022**, *12*, 386. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12030386)
- <span id="page-21-22"></span>37. Leite, F.; Akcamete, A.; Akinci, B.; Atasoy, G.; Kiziltas, S. Analysis of modeling effort and impact of different levels of detail in building information models. *Autom. Constr.* **2011**, *20*, 601–609. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2010.11.027)
- <span id="page-21-23"></span>38. Bryde, D.; Broquetas, M.; Volm, J.M. The project benefits of building information modelling (BIM). *Int. J. Proj. Manag.* **2013**, *31*, 971–980. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijproman.2012.12.001)
- <span id="page-21-24"></span>39. Becerik-Gerber, B.; Rice, S. The perceived value of building information modeling in the US building industry. *J. Inf. Technol. Constr.* **2010**, *15*, 185–201.
- <span id="page-21-25"></span>40. Costin, A.; Adibfar, A.; Hu, H.; Chen, S.S. Building Information Modeling (BIM) for transportation infrastructure–Literature review, applications, challenges, and recommendations. *Autom. Constr.* **2018**, *94*, 257–281. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2018.07.001)
- <span id="page-21-26"></span>41. Tang, Y.; Xia, N.; Lu, Y.; Varga, L.; Li, Q.; Chen, G.; Luo, J. BIM-based safety design for emergency evacuation of metro stations. *Autom. Constr.* **2021**, *123*, 103511. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2020.103511)
- <span id="page-21-27"></span>42. Garbett, J.; Hartley, T.; Heesom, D. A multi-user collaborative BIM-AR system to support design and construction. *Autom. Constr.* **2021**, *122*, 103487. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2020.103487)
- <span id="page-21-28"></span>43. El Ammari, K.; Hammad, A. Remote interactive collaboration in facilities management using BIM-based mixed reality. *Autom. Constr.* **2019**, *107*, 102940. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2019.102940)
- <span id="page-21-29"></span>44. Abbas, J.R.; O'Connor, A.; Ganapathy, E.; Isba, R.; Payton, T.; MgGrath, B.; Tolley, N.; Bruce, I. What is Virtual Reality? A healthcare-focused systematic review of definitions. *Health Policy Technol.* **2023**, *12*, 100741. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hlpt.2023.100741)
- <span id="page-22-0"></span>45. Delgado, J.M.D.; Oyedele, L.; Demian, P.; Beach, T. A research agenda for augmented and virtual reality in architecture, engineering and construction. *Adv. Eng. Inform.* **2020**, *45*, 101122. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aei.2020.101122)
- <span id="page-22-1"></span>46. Shi, Y.; Du, J.; Lavy, S.; Zhao, D. A multiuser shared virtual environment for facility management. *Procedia Eng.* **2016**, *145*, 120–127. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2016.04.029)
- <span id="page-22-2"></span>47. Lewińska, P.; Róg, M.; Żądło, A.; Szombara, S. To save from oblivion: Comparative analysis of remote sensing means of documenting forgotten architectural treasures–Zagórz Monastery complex, Poland. *Measurement* **2022**, *189*, 110447. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.measurement.2021.110447)
- <span id="page-22-3"></span>48. Schiavi, B.; Havard, V.; Beddiar, K.; Baudry, D. BIM data flow architecture with AR/VR technologies: Use cases in architecture, engineering and construction. *Autom. Constr.* **2022**, *134*, 104054. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2021.104054)
- <span id="page-22-4"></span>49. Rahimian, F.P.; Chavdarova, V.; Oliver, S.; Chamo, F.; Amobi, L.P. OpenBIM-Tango integrated virtual showroom for offsite manufactured production of self-build housing. *Autom. Constr.* **2019**, *102*, 1–16. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2019.02.009)
- <span id="page-22-5"></span>50. Xu, Z.; Zhang, H.; Lu, X.; Xu, Y.; Zhang, Z.; Li, Y. A prediction method of building seismic loss based on BIM and FEMA P-58. *Autom. Constr.* **2019**, *102*, 245–257. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2019.02.017)
- <span id="page-22-6"></span>51. Chen, H.; Hou, L.; Zhang, G.K.; Moon, S. Development of BIM, IoT and AR/VR technologies for fire safety and upskilling. *Autom. Constr.* **2021**, *125*, 103631. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2021.103631)
- <span id="page-22-7"></span>52. Rokooei, S. Building Information Modeling in Project Management: Necessities, Challenges and Outcomes. *Procedia Soc. Behav. Sci.* **2015**, *210*, 87–95. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.11.332)
- <span id="page-22-8"></span>53. Rajabi, M.S.; Radzi, A.R.; Rezaeiashtiani, M.; Famili, A.; Rashidi, M.E.; Rahman, R.A. Key Assessment Criteria for Organizational BIM Capabilities: A Cross-Regional Study. *Buildings* **2022**, *12*, 1013. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12071013)
- <span id="page-22-9"></span>54. Rajabi, M.S.; Rezaeiashtiani, M.; Radzi, A.R.; Famili, A.; Rezaeiashtiani, A.; Rahman, R.A. Underlying Factors and Strategies for Organizational BIM Capabilities: The Case of Iran. *Appl. Syst. Innov.* **2022**, *5*, 109. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/asi5060109)
- <span id="page-22-10"></span>55. Zhang, Y.; Li, X. Response-surface-model based on influencing factor analysis of subway tunnel temperature. *Build. Environ.* **2019**, *160*, 106140. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2019.05.018)
- <span id="page-22-17"></span>56. Hoover, T.E.; Hitchcock, W.W.; Kennedy, W.D.; Guinan, J.W. Computer Simulation of Subway Environment. *Transp. Eng. J. ASCE* **1973**, *99*, 53–72. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1061/TPEJAN.0000309)
- <span id="page-22-11"></span>57. Kim, G.S.; Son, Y.S.; Lee, J.H.; Kim, I.W.; Kim, J.C.; Oh, J.T.; Kim, H. Air pollution monitoring and control system for subway stations using environmental sensors. *J. Sens.* **2016**, *2016*, 1–10. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1155/2016/1865614)
- <span id="page-22-12"></span>58. *GB50157-2013*; Code for the Design of Subway. Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development: Beijing, China, 2013.
- <span id="page-22-13"></span>59. Shiraly, R.; Khoshdel, N.; Jeihooni, A.K.; McLaws, M.L. Nudging physical distancing behaviors during the pandemic: A field experiment on passengers in the subway stations of shiraz, Iran. *BMC Public Health* **2022**, *22*, 702. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-022-13184-y) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/35399067)
- <span id="page-22-14"></span>60. Park, J. Changes in subway ridership in response to COVID-19 in Seoul, South Korea: Implications for social distancing. *Cureus* **2020**, *12*, e7668. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.7759/cureus.7668) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32313784)
- <span id="page-22-15"></span>61. Han, J.; Kwon, S.B.; Chun, C. Indoor environment and passengers' comfort in subway stations in Seoul. *Build. Environ.* **2016**, *104*, 221–231. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2016.05.008)
- <span id="page-22-16"></span>62. Xu, J.; Xiang, Z.R.; Zhi, J.Y.; Chen, Y.D.; Xu, X.F. Assessment of visual comfort in the lighting environments of subway cabins in China. *Int. J. Rail Transp.* **2023**, *11*, 406–427. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1080/23248378.2022.2082571)
- <span id="page-22-18"></span>63. Wen, Y.; Leng, J.; Yu, F.; Yu, C.W. Integrated design for underground space environment control of subway stations with atriums using piston ventilation. *Indoor Built Environ.* **2020**, *29*, 1300–1315. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1177/1420326X20941349)
- <span id="page-22-19"></span>64. Xu, S.Y.; Jiang, C.; Huang, L. Public health impacts from subway noise: Case study Hong Kong. *J. Acoust. Soc. Am.* **2019**, *145*, 1867. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1121/1.5101747)
- <span id="page-22-20"></span>65. Neitzel, R.; Gershon, R.R.; Zeltser, M.; Canton, A.; Akram, M. Noise levels associated with New York City's mass transit systems. *Am. J. Public Health* **2009**, *99*, 1393–1399. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2008.138297)
- <span id="page-22-21"></span>66. Nieuwenhuijsen, M.J.; Gomez-Perales, J.E.; Colvile, R.N. Levels of particulate air pollution, its elemental composition, determinants and health effects in metro systems. *Atmos. Environ.* **2007**, *41*, 7995–8006. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2007.08.002)
- <span id="page-22-22"></span>67. Ham, W.; Vijayan, A.; Schulte, N.; Herner, J.D. Commuter exposure to PM2. 5, BC, and UFP in six common transport microenvironments in Sacramento, California. *Atmos. Environ.* **2017**, *167*, 335–345. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2017.08.024)
- <span id="page-22-23"></span>68. Hwang, S.H.; Park, W.M. Indoor air quality assessment with respect to culturable airborne bacteria, total volatile organic compounds, formaldehyde, PM10, CO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, and O<sub>3</sub> in underground subway stations and parking lots. *Air Qual. Atmos. Health* **2019**, *12*, 435–441. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-019-00666-z)
- <span id="page-22-24"></span>69. Ji, W.; Liu, Z.; Liu, C.; Wang, C.; Li, X. Characteristics of fine particulate matter and volatile organic compounds in subway station offices in China. *Build. Environ.* **2021**, *188*, 107502. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2020.107502)
- <span id="page-22-25"></span>70. Mathew, A.P. Using the environment as an interactive interface to motivate positive behavior change in a subway station. In Proceedings of the CHI'05 Extended Abstracts on Human Factors in Computing Systems, Portland, OR, USA, 2–7 April 2005; pp. 1637–1640.
- <span id="page-22-26"></span>71. Xue, X.; Zhang, R.; Zhang, X.; Yang, R.J.; Li, H. Environmental and social challenges for urban subway construction: An empirical study in China. *Int. J. Proj. Manag.* **2015**, *33*, 576–588. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijproman.2014.09.003)
- <span id="page-22-27"></span>72. Chan, E.Y.Y.; Huang, Z.; Hung, K.K.C.; Chan, G.K.W.; Lam, H.C.Y.; Lo, E.S.K.; Yeung, M.P.S. Health emergency disaster risk management of public transport systems: A population-based study after the 2017 subway fire in Hong Kong, China. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2019**, *16*, 228. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16020228) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30650569)
- <span id="page-23-0"></span>73. Wang, J.; Yan, W.; Xu, H.; Zhi, Y.; Wang, Z.; Jiang, J. Investigation of the probability of a safe evacuation to succeed in subway fire emergencies based on Bayesian theory. *KSCE J. Civ. Eng.* **2018**, *22*, 877–886. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12205-018-0620-7)
- <span id="page-23-1"></span>74. Miyako, J.; Nakagawa, K.; Sagisaka, R.; Tanaka, S.; Takeuchi, H.; Takyu, H.; Tanaka, H. Neurological outcomes of out-of-hospital cardiac arrest occurring in Tokyo train and subway stations. *Resusc. Plus* **2021**, *8*, 100175. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resplu.2021.100175)
- <span id="page-23-6"></span>75. Chen, H.; Chen, B.; Zhang, L.; Li, H.X. Vulnerability modeling, assessment, and improvement in urban metro systems: A probabilistic system dynamics approach. *Sustain. Cities Soc.* **2021**, *75*, 103329. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2021.103329)
- <span id="page-23-2"></span>76. Bo, Y.; Jun, Y.; Yi, H. Research on the Structure of Urban Rail Transit Talent Training System. In Proceedings of the 2020 International Conference on Big Data and Informatization Education, Zhangjiajie, China, 23–25 April 2020; pp. 221–224.
- <span id="page-23-3"></span>77. Liu, D.Q.; Sun, S.R.; Qian, Z.W. Discussion on Critical Factors in Passenger Evacuation based on the Environment Management of Metro Stations-A Case of Shanghai. *Ekoloji* **2019**, *28*, 359–364.
- <span id="page-23-4"></span>78. Deng, Y.; Song, L.; Zhou, J.; Wang, J. Evaluation and reduction of vulnerability of subway equipment: An integrated framework. *Saf. Sci.* **2018**, *103*, 172–182. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2017.10.017)
- <span id="page-23-5"></span>79. Xu, X.; Song, B.; Li, C.; Hu, X. Study on the safety and disaster-prevention signing system of the subway based on site investigation at home and abroad. In Proceedings of the 2009 International Conference on Management and Service Science, Beijing, China, 20–22 September 2009; pp. 1–4.
- <span id="page-23-7"></span>80. Chen, T.; Zhang, S.Y.; Zhao, L.Z.; Xia, J.J.; Fu, X.C.; Bao, Z.M.; Chen, Y.; Zhang, X.Z.; Wang, R.J.; Hu, C.; et al. Comparison of safety equipment between London underground and Beijing subway. *IOP Conf. Ser. Earth Environ. Sci.* **2017**, *69*, 012179. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/69/1/012179)
- <span id="page-23-8"></span>81. Wang, J.H.; Yan, W.Y.; Zhi, Y.R.; Jiang, J.C. Investigation of the panic psychology and behaviors of evacuation crowds in subway emergencies. *Procedia Eng.* **2016**, *135*, 128–137. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2016.01.091)
- <span id="page-23-9"></span>82. Xiong, G.; Shen, D.; Dong, X.; Hu, B.; Fan, D.; Zhu, F. Parallel transportation management and control system for subways. *IEEE Trans. Intell. Transp. Syst.* **2016**, *18*, 1974–1979. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1109/TITS.2016.2622282)
- <span id="page-23-10"></span>83. Zhu, Y.; Li, N. Virtual and augmented reality technologies for emergency management in the built environments: A state-of-the-art review. *J. Saf. Sci. Resil.* **2021**, *2*, 1–10. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jnlssr.2020.11.004)
- <span id="page-23-11"></span>84. Long, X.; Wang, R.; Chen, B.; Wu, N. A system for remote monitoring information management and risk control in the underground engineering. In *Information Technology in Geo-Engineering*; IOS Press: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2010; pp. 338–344.
- <span id="page-23-12"></span>85. Luglio, D.G.; Katsigeorgis, M.; Hess, J.; Kim, R.; Adragna, J.; Raja, A.; Gordon, C.; Fine, J.; Thurston, G.; Gordon, T.; et al. PM 2.5 concentration and composition in subway systems in the Northeastern United States. *Environ. Health Perspect.* **2021**, *129*, 027001. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1289/EHP7202) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/33565894)
- <span id="page-23-13"></span>86. Huang, H.; Sun, Y.; Xue, Y.; Wang, F. Inspection equipment study for subway tunnel defects by grey-scale image processing. *Adv. Eng. Inform.* **2017**, *32*, 188–201. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aei.2017.03.003)
- <span id="page-23-14"></span>87. Huang, Z.; Fu, H.L.; Fan, X.D.; Meng, J.H.; Chen, W.; Zheng, X.J.; Wang, W.; Zhang, J.B. Rapid surface damage detection equipment for subway tunnels based on machine vision system. *J. Infrastruct. Syst.* **2021**, *27*, 04020047. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)IS.1943-555X.0000591)
- <span id="page-23-15"></span>88. Loy-Benitez, J.; Li, Q.; Ifaei, P.; Nam, K.; Heo, S.; Yoo, C. A dynamic gain-scheduled ventilation control system for a subway station based on outdoor air quality conditions. *Build. Environ.* **2018**, *144*, 159–170. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2018.08.016)
- <span id="page-23-16"></span>89. Vargas-Robles, D.; Gonzalez-Cedillo, C.; Hernandez, A.M.; Alcaraz, L.D.; Peimbert, M. Passenger-surface microbiome interactions in the subway of Mexico City. *PLoS ONE* **2020**, *15*, e0237272. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0237272)
- <span id="page-23-17"></span>90. Peimbert, M.; Alcaraz, L.D. Where environmental microbiome meets its host: Subway and passenger microbiome relationships. *Mol. Ecol.* **2023**, *32*, 2602–2618. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1111/mec.16440) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/35318755)
- <span id="page-23-18"></span>91. Li, H.; Zhong, M.Y.; Shi, C.L.; Shi, J.H.; Chen, H.C.; Xu, Q.X. Experimental research on investigation of metro passenger evacuation behaviors in case of emergency. In *Pedestrian and Evacuation Dynamics*; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2011; pp. 173–184. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4419-9725-8_16)
- <span id="page-23-19"></span>92. Rong, G.; Sainan, W.; Mengshi, H. Underground railway safety analysis and planning strategy: A case of Harbin metro line 1, China. *Procedia Eng.* **2016**, *165*, 575–582. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.proeng.2016.11.753)
- <span id="page-23-20"></span>93. Potseluyko, L.; Rahimian, F.P.; Dawood, N.; Elghaish, F.; Hajirasouli, A. Game-like interactive environment using BIM-based virtual reality for the timber frame self-build housing sector. *Autom. Constr.* **2022**, *142*, 104496. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2022.104496)
- <span id="page-23-21"></span>94. Murre, J.M.; Dros, J. Replication and analysis of Ebbinghaus' forgetting curve. *PLoS ONE* **2015**, *10*, e0120644. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0120644)
- <span id="page-23-22"></span>95. Heo, S.; Nam, K.; Loy-Benitez, J.; Li, Q.; Lee, S.; Yoo, C. A deep reinforcement learning-based autonomous ventilation control system for smart indoor air quality management in a subway station. *Energy Build.* **2019**, *202*, 109440. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enbuild.2019.109440)
- <span id="page-23-23"></span>96. Son, Y.S.; Oh, Y.H.; Choi, I.Y.; Dinh, T.V.; Chung, S.G.; Lee, J.H.; Park, D.; Kim, J.C. Development of a magnetic hybrid filter to reduce PM10 in a subway platform. *J. Hazard. Mater.* **2019**, *368*, 197–203. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2019.01.045) [\[PubMed\]](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/30677651)
- <span id="page-23-24"></span>97. Omer, M.M.; Mohd-Ezazee, N.M.A.; Lee, Y.S.; Rajabi, M.S.; Rahman, R.A. Constructive and Destructive Leadership Behaviors, Skills, Styles and Traits in BIM-Based Construction Projects. *Buildings* **2022**, *12*, 2068. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12122068)
- <span id="page-23-25"></span>98. Cui, P.; Ju, X.; Liu, Y.; Li, D. Predicting and improving the waterlogging resilience of urban communities in China—A case study of Nanjing. *Buildings* **2022**, *12*, 901. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12070901)
- <span id="page-23-26"></span>99. Ourang, S.; Ourang, A. Optimizing Power Balance and Communication links in Microgrids: A Clustering Approach Using Particle Swarm Optimization. *Asian J. Soc. Sci. Manag. Technol.* **2023**, *5*, 275–281.
- <span id="page-23-27"></span>100. Ma, W.; Almasifar, N.; Amini, R.; Ourang, A.; Mahariq, I.; Alhoee, J. Crashworthiness evaluation and optimization of full polypropylene sandwich tubes under low-velocity impact based on machine learning algorithms. *Structures* **2024**, *60*, 105901. **[\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.istruc.2024.105901)**
- <span id="page-24-0"></span>101. Taheri, S.; Morteza, A.; Sadeghi, S. Deep Learning Hyperparameter Optimization: Application to Electricity and Heat Demand Prediction for Buildings. *Energy Build.* **2023**, *289*, 113036. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4349044)
- <span id="page-24-1"></span>102. Morteza, A.; Ilbeigi, M.; Schwed, J. A blockchain information management framework for construction safety. In Proceedings of the Computing in Civil Engineering, Orlando, FL, USA, 12–14 September 2021; pp. 342–349. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1061/9780784483893.043)
- <span id="page-24-2"></span>103. Zhang, Z.; Wong, M.O.; Pan, W. Virtual reality enhanced multi-role collaboration in crane-lift training for modular construction. *Autom. Constr.* **2023**, *150*, 104848. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2023.104848)
- <span id="page-24-3"></span>104. Borkowski, A.S. Evolution of BIM: Epistemology, genesis and division into periods. *J. Inf. Technol. Constr.* **2023**, *28*, 646–661. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.36680/j.itcon.2023.034)
- <span id="page-24-4"></span>105. Li, Y.; Li, Q. The Application of BIM Technology in Budget Control of Port Construction Cost. *J. Coast. Res.* **2020**, *103*, 644–648. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.2112/SI103-131.1)
- <span id="page-24-5"></span>106. Luo, S.; Yao, J.; Wang, S.; Wang, Y.; Lu, G. A sustainable BIM-based multidisciplinary framework for underground pipeline clash detection and analysis. *J. Clean. Prod.* **2022**, *374*, 133900. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.133900)
- <span id="page-24-6"></span>107. Dong, Z.; Qin, R.; Zou, P.; Yao, X.; Cui, P.; Zhang, F.; Yang, Y. Occupational health risk assessment of PC production-caused pollution based on damage assessment and cyclic mitigation model. *Eng. Constr. Archit. Manag.* 2024; *ahead-of-print*. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1108/ECAM-06-2023-0581)
- <span id="page-24-7"></span>108. Hu, P.; Feng, L. The risk of water quality deterioration with urban flood control—A case in Wuxi. *Sustainability* **2023**, *16*, 185. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/su16010185)
- 109. Lan, F.; Haisen, W.; Yan, Y. Spatial–Temporal Variations of Water Quality in Urban Rivers after Small Sluices Construction: A Case in Typical Regions of the Taihu Lake Basin. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2022**, *19*, 12453. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph191912453)
- <span id="page-24-8"></span>110. Feng, L.; Hu, P.; Wang, H.; Chen, M.M.; Han, J. Improving City Water Quality through Pollution Reduction with Urban Floodgate Infrastructure and Design Solutions: A Case Study in Wuxi, China. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2022**, *19*, 10976. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph191710976)
- <span id="page-24-9"></span>111. Lee, Y.; Lee, Y.C.; Kim, T.; Choi, J.S.; Park, D. Sources and characteristics of particulate matter in subway tunnels in Seoul, Korea. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2018**, *15*, 2534. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph15112534)
- <span id="page-24-10"></span>112. Wu, J.; Chang, I.-S.; Bina, O.; Lam, K.-C.; Xu, H. Strategic environmental assessment implementation in China—Five-year review and prospects. *Environ. Impact Assess. Rev.* **2011**, *31*, 77–84. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eiar.2010.04.010)
- <span id="page-24-11"></span>113. Nie, L. Visual Design of Marine Architecture in Coastal Cities Based on "BIM+VR". *J. Coast. Res.* **2020**, *112*, 421–424. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.2112/JCR-SI112-111.1)
- <span id="page-24-12"></span>114. Rajabi, M.S.; Taghaddos, H.; Zahrai, S.M. Improving emergency training for earthquakes through immersive virtual environments and anxiety tests: A case study. *Buildings* **2022**, *12*, 1850. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12111850)
- <span id="page-24-13"></span>115. Van Wyk, E.; De Villiers, R. Virtual reality training applications for the mining industry. In Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Computer Graphics, Virtual Reality, Visualisation and Interaction in Africa, Pretoria, South Africa, 4–6 February 2009; pp. 53–63. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1145/1503454.1503465)
- <span id="page-24-14"></span>116. Wang, P.; Wu, P.; Wang, J.; Chi, H.L.; Wang, X. A critical review of the use of virtual reality in construction engineering education and training. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2018**, *15*, 1204. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph15061204)
- <span id="page-24-15"></span>117. Shi, Y.; Du, J.; Ahn, C.R.; Ragan, E. Impact assessment of reinforced learning methods on construction workers' fall risk behavior using virtual reality. *Autom. Constr.* **2019**, *104*, 197–214. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.autcon.2019.04.015)
- <span id="page-24-16"></span>118. De-Juan-Ripoll, C.; Soler-Domínguez, J.L.; Guixeres, J.; Contero, M.; Álvarez Gutiérrez, N.; Alcañiz, M. Virtual reality as a new approach for risk taking assessment. *Front. Psychol.* **2018**, *9*, 1–8. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02532)
- <span id="page-24-17"></span>119. Ourang, S. Evaluation of Inter-Organizational Coordination of Housing Services in Rural Alaska through Social Network Analysis. 2022. Available online: <https://dr.lib.iastate.edu/handle/20.500.12876/105396> (accessed on 1 January 2024).
- <span id="page-24-18"></span>120. Mudiyanselage, S.E.; Nguyen, P.H.D.; Rajabi, M.S.; Akhavian, R. Automated workers' ergonomic risk assessment in manual material handling using sEMG wearable sensors and machine learning. *Electronics* **2021**, *10*, 2558. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.3390/electronics10202558)
- <span id="page-24-19"></span>121. Ballesteros, L.M.S.; Ourang, S.; Pazdon, J.; Kuffel, K. Increasing safety in residential construction through a simplified earthquakeand typhoon-resistant guidelines. *J. Future Sustain.* **2023**, *3*, 119–124. [\[CrossRef\]](https://doi.org/10.5267/j.jfs.2023.1.001)

**Disclaimer/Publisher's Note:** The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.