




| Author, year           | Item |   |   |   |   |   |   |
|------------------------|------|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Song et al, 2020       | L    | U | U | U | H | U | U |
| Fateme et al, 2017     | L    | U | U | U | U | L | U |
| Fang and Dai, 2019     | L    | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Ye et al, 2010         | L    | U | U | H | L | L | U |
| Qutaiba et al, 2021    | L    | U | U | U | L | U | L |
| Cao et al, 2007        | L    | U | U | H | L | U | U |
| Alavi et al, 2020      | L    | L | U | U | L | U | U |
| Chen et al, 2018       | L    | L | U | U | L | U | U |
| Du et al , 2010        | L    | L | U | H | L | U | U |
| Lindenberg et al, 2022 | L    | L | L | H | L | L | L |
| Wang, 2012             | L    | U | U | U | L | U | H |
| Wölfling et al, 2019   | L    | L | L | U | L | L | L |
| Yang et al, 2022       | L    | U | U | U | L | L | L |
| Liu et al, 2013        | L    | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Li Geng, 2009          | L    | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Li and Dai, 2009       | L    | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Lu et al,2021          | L    | L | U | U | L | L | U |
| Ming, 2014             | L    | U | U | H | L | L | U |
| Wang et al,2011        | L    | L | U | H | L | U | L |
| Zhao et al,2016        | L    | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Bong et al, 2020       | L    | U | L | U | L | U | U |
| Hong et al, 2020       | L    | U | L | U | L | L | U |
| Sung et al, 2016       | L    | U | L | U | U | L | L |
| Wei et al, 2021        | L    | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Yang et al, 2017       | L    | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Zhu et al, 2012        | L    | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Tang et al, 2018       | L    | L | U | U | H | U | U |
| Tang et al, 2017       | L    | L | U | U | U | L | H |
| Yang, 2013             | L    | L | U | U | U | L | L |
| Zhu et al, 2008        | L    | L | U | H | L | L | L |
| Zhu et al, 2011        | L    | U | U | H | L | L | U |
| Zhu et al, 2011        | L    | L | U | H | L | U | L |
| Zhu et al, 2009        | L    | L | U | U | L | L | L |
| Çelik,2016             | L    | L | U | H | L | L | U |

|                      |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
|----------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Abdullah, 2021       | L | L | U | U | U | L | H |
| Yang, 2021           | L | H | U | U | U | U | H |
| Zhang, 2013          | L | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Liao et al, 2009     | L | U | U | H | L | U | L |
| Qiu et al, 2011      | L | L | U | U | L | U | H |
| Yang et al,2017      | L | U | U | U | U | H | H |
| Zhang et al, 2023    | L | L | U | U | L | L | L |
| Ren et al,2014       | L | H | U | U | L | H | U |
| Gao et al, 2012      | L | U | U | U | L | L | L |
| Zhang, 2009          | L | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Bai et al, 2007      | L | U | L | U | L | L | L |
| Huang et al, 2010    | L | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Li et al, 2017       | L | L | U | H | L | U | H |
| Zhang and Wang, 2011 | L | U | U | U | U | H | U |
| Yin, 2021            | L | U | U | U | L | U | H |
| Zhang, 2011          | L | H | H | U | U | U | H |
| Chen et al,2010      | L | L | U | U | L | L | U |
| Chen et al,2011      | L | L | U | U | L | U | U |
| Duan et al,2012      | L | U | H | U | L | U | H |
| Ge et al,2014        | L | U | U | H | U | L | U |
| Guo et al,2008       | L | L | U | H | L | L | U |
| Liu,2014             | L | L | U | U | L | L | U |
| Liu et al,2010       | L | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Lv et al,2012        | L | L | U | U | L | U | L |
| Park and Hee, 2011   | L | L | U | H | H | U | H |
| Zhang et al,2009     | L | L | U | U | L | U | H |
| Zheng et al,2007     | L | L | U | U | L | L | U |
| Guan et al,2012      | L | L | U | U | L | U | U |
| Kong et al,2011      | L | L | U | U | H | L | U |
| Li, 2012             | L | U | U | U | H | U | U |
| Su,2015              | L | L | U | U | U | L | U |
| Liu et al,2013       | L | U | U | U | L | L | U |
| Peng et al,2015      | L | L | U | U | U | L | U |
| Xu et al,2012        | L | U | U | U | L | U | L |
| Xu et al,2018        | L | L | U | U | L | L | U |
| Zhang and Wang, 2015 | L | L | U | U | U | U | H |

|                      |   |            |                             |  |  |   |   |
|----------------------|---|------------|-----------------------------|--|--|---|---|
| Zhao and Hu, 2015    | L   | U          | U                           | U  | H  | H   | U                                       |
| Zhong et al, 2011    | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | L                                       |
| Lu et al, 2013       | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | U                                       |
| Du et al, 2013       | L   | U          | U                           | H  | U  | H   | H                                       |
| Wei et al,2014       | L   | L          | U                           | H  | U  | U   | U                                       |
| Liu et al,2015       | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | U                                       |
| Gong et al,2022      | L   | U          | U                           | H  | L  | U   | U                                       |
| Preeti et al, 2020   | L   | U          | U                           | H  | H  | L   | U                                       |
| Zhao and Zhang, 2022 | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | U   | U                                       |
| Li et al, 2017       | L   | L          | U                           | U  | U  | H   | U                                       |
| Liu et al, 2021      | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | U                                       |
| Huang, 2020          | L   | L          | U                           | U  | U  | L   | U                                       |
| Cheng and luo, 2017  | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | L                                       |
| Jeong et al, 2020    | L   | L          | U                           | U  | L  | U   | U                                       |
| Lee et al, 2021      | L   | L          | L                           | H  | L  | L   | L                                       |
| Zhong, 2020          | L   | U          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | U                                       |
| Sun et al, 2022      | L   | L          | U                           | U  | U  | L   | U                                       |
| Zhang et al, 2018    | L   | U          | U                           | U  | L  | L   | U                                       |
| Kim, 2008            | L   | U          | U                           | U  | L  | U   | H                                       |
| Deng et al, 2017     | L   | U          | U                           | U  | U  | H   | U                                       |
| Low risk             |  |            |                             |  |  |   |   |
| Unclear risk         |  |            |                             |  |  |   |   |
| High risk            |  |            |                             |  |  |   |   |
|                      | Random sequence generation<br>(selection bias)                                      | Allocation | concealment(selection bias) | Blinding of participants and<br>personnel (performance bias) | Blinding of outcome<br>assessment (detection bias) | Incomplete outcome data<br>(attrition bias) | Selective reporting<br>(reporting bias) |
|                      |   |            |                             |  |  |   | Other bias                              |