

Review

End-of-Life Options for Bio-Based Plastics in a Circular Economy – Status Quo and Potential from a Life Cycle Assessment Perspective

Sebastian Spierling ^{1,*}, Venkateshwaran Venkatachalam ¹, Marina Mudersbach ², Nico Becker ³, Christoph Herrmann ⁴ and Hans-Josef Endres ¹

¹ Institute of Plastics and Circular Economy, Leibniz Universität Hannover, An der Universität 2, 30823 Garbsen, Germany; venkatachalam@ikk.uni-hannover.de (V.V.); endres@ikk.uni-hannover.de (H.-J.E.)

² Fraunhofer Institute for Wood Research, Application Center for Wood Fiber Research, Heisterbergallee 10A, 30453 Hannover, Germany; marina.mudersbach@wki.fraunhofer.de

³ Institute for Bioplastics and Biocomposites, University of Applied Sciences and Arts Hannover, Heisterbergallee 10A, 30453 Hannover, Germany; nico.becker@hs-hannover.de

⁴ Institute of Machine Tools and Production Technology, Sustainable Manufacturing & Life Cycle Engineering, Technische Universität Braunschweig, Langer Kamp 19 B, 38106 Braunschweig, Germany; c.herrmann@tu-braunschweig.de

* Correspondence: spierling@ikk.uni-hannover.de; Tel.: +49(0)511-762-13303

Received: 30 June 2020; Accepted: 17 July 2020; Published: date

Supplementary information

Table S1. Overview identified publications without absolute values.

Bio-Based Plastic	End-of-Life Options										Source
	MR	CR	SbR	IC	D fS	IwER	InoER	AD	LFnoER	LFwER	
TPS				X ¹							Razza et al. 2010 [1]
PLA				X		X					Vercalsteren et al. 2010 [2]
PLA, TPS	X			X		X		X			Piemonte 2011 [3]
PLA	X			X							Piemonte & Gironi 2011 [4]
PLA				X					X		Shen 2011 [5]
PHB								X			Rostkowski et al. 2012 [6]
PLA		X									Tecchio et al. 2012 [7]
Bio-PE						X					Liptow & Tillman 2012 [8]
Bio-PE, PLA	X					X					Detzel et al. 2012 [9]

¹ No industrial composting, but rather degradation in soil (mulch film product application).

MR: Mechanical Recycling, CR: Chemical Recycling, SbR: Solvent based recycling, IC: Industrial Composting, DfS: Direct fuel substitution in plants¹, IwER: Incineration with Energy recovery, InoER: Incineration without energy recovery, AD: Anaerobic Digestion, LFnoER: Landfill without energy recovery, LFWER: Landfilling with energy recovery.

¹: Describes the energetic utilization of selected waste materials with recoverable calorific value which are used outside a waste incineration plant as substitute for fossil fuels in e.g. cement plants, lime plants, coal fired power plants.

Table S2. Bio-based plastic demand.

Bio-Based Plastic	Global Demand in Tonnes ¹
TPS	18,179,760.00
PLA	19,134,700.00
PHA	42,038,900.00
Bio-based PE	72,388,760.00
Bio-based PET	9,675,050.00

¹: calculated based on the method described in figure 2.

Table S3. Results of the literature review (87 scenarios).

Scenario NR.	Source	Bio-based plastic	End-of-life Option	CED per kg (MJ)	GWP per kg (kg CO ₂ -eq.)	EP per kg (kg PO ₄ -eq.)	AP per kg (kg SO ₂ -eq.)	POCP per kg (kg C ₂ H ₄ -eq.)	ODP per kg (kg CFC-11-eq.)
1	Hottle et al.	Bio-HDP E	MR	n/a	-1.060	5.10E-04	2.10E-03	1.18E-01	2.91E-08
2	Hottle et al.	Bio-HDP E	LFnoER	n/a	0.150	6.00E-05	3.00E-04	8.00E-03	5.90E-09
3	Hottle et al.	Bio-LDPE	MR	n/a	-1.096	4.10E-04	1.90E-03	1.16E-01	2.70E-08
4	Hottle et al.	Bio-LDPE	LFnoER	n/a	0.140	6.00E-05	3.00E-04	8.00E-03	6.00E-09
5	Hottle et al.	Bio-PET	MR	n/a	-1.930	8.00E-05	-3.40E-03	3.60E-02	1.28E-08
6	Hottle et al.	Bio-PET	LFnoER	n/a	0.110	1.60E-04	3.00E-04	8.00E-03	5.80E-09
7	Hottle et al.	PLA	LFnoER	n/a	2.810	1.65E-04	3.36E-04	1.11E-02	5.82E-09
8	Hottle et al.	PLA	LFnoER	n/a	0.045	1.62E-04	2.78E-04	7.94E-03	5.82E-09
9	Hottle et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	0.308	9.68E-05	1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
10	Hottle et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	0.308	9.68E-05	1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09

11	Hottle et al.	TPS	LFnoE R	n/a	1.250	1.89E-03	4.51E-04	8.47E-03	6.08E-09
12	Hottle et al.	TPS	IC	n/a	0.283	9.68E-05	1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
13	Suwanmanee et al.	PLA	LFwER	n/a	9.254	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
14	Suwanmanee et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	1.473	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
15	Rossi et al.	PLA	MR	n/a	-0.422	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
16	Rossi et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	1.740	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
17	Rossi et al.	PLA	AD	n/a	0.950	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
18	Rossi et al.	PLA	DfS	n/a	0.080	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
19	Rossi et al.	PLA	IwER	n/a	0.920	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
20	Rossi et al.	PLA	LFwER	n/a	0.130	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
21	Rossi et al.	TPS	MR	n/a	-0.550	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
22	Rossi et al.	TPS	IC	n/a	1.830	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
23	Rossi et al.	TPS	AD	n/a	0.870	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
24	Rossi et al.	TPS	DfS	n/a	0.260	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
25	Rossi et al.	TPS	IwER	n/a	1.070	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
26	Rossi et al.	TPS	LFwER	n/a	6.790	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
27	Rossi et al.	PLA	MR	n/a	0.610	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
28	Rossi et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	1.950	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
29	Rossi et al.	PLA	AD	n/a	2.220	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
30	Rossi et al.	PLA	DfS	n/a	1.930	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
31	Rossi et al.	PLA	InoER	n/a	1.880	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
32	Rossi et al.	TPS	MR	n/a	0.590	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
33	Rossi et al.	TPS	IC	n/a	2.040	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
34	Rossi et al.	TPS	AD	n/a	2.250	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
35	Rossi et al.	TPS	DfS	n/a	2.030	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
36	Rossi et al.	TPS	InoER	n/a	1.990	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
37	Rossi et al.	TPS	LFnoE R	n/a	7.000	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
38	Gironi & Piemonte	PLA	IwER	-6.631	1.410	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
39	Gironi & Piemonte	PLA	LFwER	-2.451	4.664	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
40	Gironi & Piemonte	PLA	IC	0.385	2.574	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
41	Gironi & Piemonte	PLA	MR	-47.213	0.370	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

42	Khoo et al.	PHA	LFnoER	n/a	2.769	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
43	Khoo et al.	PHA	IwER	n/a	0.554	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
44	Khoo et al.	PHA	IC	n/a	0.365	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
45	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	2.767	1.53E-03	2.46E-02	n/a	n/a
46	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	MR	n/a	0.180	1.53E-03	1.61E-02	n/a	n/a
47	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	IwER	n/a	2.949	1.51E-03	2.29E-02	n/a	n/a
48	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	3.003	1.11E-03	2.12E-02	n/a	n/a
49	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	MR	n/a	0.414	1.14E-03	1.26E-02	n/a	n/a
50	Changwicha n et al.	PLA	IwER	n/a	3.200	1.11E-03	1.95E-02	n/a	n/a
51	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	IC	n/a	1.620	1.25E-03	2.01E-02	n/a	n/a
52	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	MR	n/a	-0.299	1.25E-03	1.40E-02	n/a	n/a
53	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	IwER	n/a	1.756	1.23E-03	1.88E-02	n/a	n/a
54	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	IC	n/a	1.960	7.31E-04	1.30E-02	n/a	n/a
55	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	MR	n/a	0.122	7.53E-04	6.90E-03	n/a	n/a
56	Changwicha n et al.	PHA	IwER	n/a	2.096	7.42E-04	1.18E-02	n/a	n/a
57	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	IC	n/a	0.261	1.28E-03	1.70E-02	n/a	n/a
58	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	MR	n/a	-1.825	1.30E-03	1.05E-02	n/a	n/a
59	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	IwER	n/a	0.405	1.28E-03	1.57E-02	n/a	n/a
60	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	IC	n/a	0.232	8.70E-04	1.05E-02	n/a	n/a
61	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	MR	n/a	-1.854	8.92E-04	3.89E-03	n/a	n/a
62	Changwicha n et al.	PBS	IwER	n/a	0.376	8.70E-04	9.15E-03	n/a	n/a

63	Choi et al.	PLA	IwER	n/a	3.181	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
64	Choi et al.	PLA	LFnoER	n/a	0.001	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
65	Papong et al.	PLA	IC	16.03	-0.592	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
66	Papong et al.	PLA	IwER	-99.03	-3.525	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
67	Papong et al.	PLA	LFnoER	19.53	68.325	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
68	Papong et al.	PLA	LFwER	-85.43	22.855	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
69	Papong et al.	PLA	CR	-49.33	-1.183	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
70	Cosate de Andrade et al.	PLA	MR	4	0.329	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
71	Cosate de Andrade et al.	PLA	CR	9	0.888	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
72	Cosate de Andrade et al.	PLA	IC	43	3.025	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
73	Maga et al.	PLA	MR	-21.544	-0.786	n/a	-3.42E-03	-2.75E-03	-5.00E-10
74	Maga et al.	PLA	MR	-25.013	-0.893	n/a	-3.97E-03	-3.16E-03	0.00E+00
75	Maga et al.	PLA	CR	43.543	-1.488	n/a	-7.00E-03	-2.14E-03	-1.03E-09
76	Maga et al.	PLA	SbR	-43.182	-1.519	n/a	-7.17E-03	-5.65E-03	2.10E-10
77	Maga et al.	PLA	IwER	-2.601	-0.403	n/a	3.34E-04	3.19E-04	2.00E-10
78	Maga et al.	PLA	IwER	-10.380	-0.698	n/a	-8.20E-04	-5.60E-04	0.00E+00
79	Ingrao et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	0.215	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
80	Hermann et al.	Bio-PE	IwER	n/a	1.700	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
81	Hermann et al.	Bio-PE	LFwER	n/a	0.100	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
82	Hermann et al.	Bio-PE	IwER	n/a	1.750	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
83	Hermann et al.	Bio-PE	LFwER	n/a	0.119	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
84	Hermann et al.	PLA	IwER	n/a	1.211	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
85	Hermann et al.	PLA	LFwER	n/a	0.974	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
86	Hermann et al.	PLA	IC	n/a	2.000	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

87	Hermann et al.	PLA	AD	n/a	0.992	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
----	----------------	-----	----	-----	-------	-----	-----	-----	-----

PHA min	SbR										
PHA max	SbR										
PHA average	SbR										
PHA min	IC		3.65E-01		7.31E-04				1.30E-02		
PHA max	IC		1.96E+00		1.25E-03				2.01E-02		
PHA average	IC		1.31E+00		9.89E-04				1.65E-02		
PHA min	DfS										
PHA max	DfS										
PHA average	DfS										
PHA min	IwER		5.54E-01		7.42E-04				1.18E-02		
PHA max	IwER		2.10E+00		1.23E-03				1.88E-02		
PHA average	IwER		1.47E+00		9.84E-04				1.53E-02		
PHA min	InoER										
PHA max	InoER										
PHA average	InoER										
PHA min	AD										
PHA max	AD										
PHA average	AD										
PHA min	LFnoER		2.77E+00								
PHA max	LFnoER		2.77E+00								
PHA average	LFnoER		2.77E+00								
PHA min	LFwER										
PHA max	LFwER										
PHA average	LFwER										
PLA min	MR	-4.72E+01	-8.93E-01	-5.70E-02	1.14E-03	-1.22E-02	-1.31E-03	-1.00E-05	-3.97E-03	-3.16E-03	-5.00E-10
PLA max	MR	4.00E+00	6.10E-01	-1.27E-02	1.53E-03	-1.07E-02	-1.14E-03	-4.80E-06	1.61E-02	-2.75E-03	
PLA	MR	-2.24E+01	-2.48E-02	-3.49E-02	1.34E-03	-1.14E-02	-1.22E-03	-7.40E-06	5.33E-03	-2.95E-03	-2.50E-10
PLA min	CR	-4.93E+01	-1.49E+00	9.90E-02		-2.26E-02	-2.69E-03	-1.20E-05	-7.00E-03	-2.14E-03	-1.03E-09
PLA max	CR	4.35E+01	8.88E-01	9.90E-02		-2.26E-02	-2.69E-03	-1.20E-05	-7.00E-03	-2.14E-03	-1.03E-09
PLA average	CR	1.07E+00	-5.94E-01	9.90E-02		-2.26E-02	-2.69E-03	-1.20E-05	-7.00E-03	-2.14E-03	-1.03E-09
PLA min	SbR	-4.32E+01	-1.52E+00	1.66E-02		-2.21E-02	-2.38E-03	-1.00E-05	-7.17E-03	-5.65E-03	2.10E-10
PLA max	SbR	-4.32E+01	-1.52E+00	1.66E-02		-2.21E-02	-2.38E-03	-1.00E-05	-7.17E-03	-5.65E-03	2.10E-10
PLA average	SbR	-4.32E+01	-1.52E+00	1.66E-02		-2.21E-02	-2.38E-03	-1.00E-05	-7.17E-03	-5.65E-03	2.10E-10
PLA min	IC	3.85E-01	-5.92E-01		9.68E-05				1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
PLA max	IC	4.30E+01	3.03E+00		1.53E-03				2.46E-02	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
PLA average	IC	1.98E+01	1.56E+00		7.09E-04				1.21E-02	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
PLA min	DfS		8.00E-02								
PLA max	DfS		1.93E+00								
PLA average	DfS		1.01E+00								
PLA min	IwER	-9.90E+01	-3.53E+00	1.12E+00	1.11E-03	-1.95E-03	-2.30E-04	-1.62E-06	-8.20E-04	-5.60E-04	
PLA max	IwER	-2.60E+00	3.20E+00	1.17E+00	1.51E-03	1.52E-03	1.42E-04	-2.00E-07	2.29E-02	3.19E-04	2.00E-10
PLA average	IwER	-2.97E+01	9.16E-01	1.15E+00	1.31E-03	-2.15E-04	-4.40E-05	-9.10E-07	1.05E-02	-1.21E-04	1.00E-10

PLA min	InoER		1.88E+00							
PLA max	InoER		1.88E+00							
PLA average	InoER		1.88E+00							
PLA min	AD		9.50E-01							
PLA max	AD		2.22E+00							
PLA average	AD		1.39E+00							
PLA min	LFnoER	19.53	9.68E-04		1.62E-04			2.78E-04	7.94E-03	5.82E-09
PLA max	LFnoER	19.53	6.83E+01		1.65E-04			3.36E-04	1.11E-02	5.82E-09
PLA average	LFnoER	19.53	1.78E+01		1.64E-04			3.07E-04	9.52E-03	5.82E-09
PLA min	LFwER	-8.54E+01	1.30E-01							
PLA max	LFwER	-2.45E+00	2.29E+01							
PLA average	LFwER	-4.39E+01	7.58E+00							
TPS min	MR		-5.50E-01							
TPS max	MR		5.90E-01							
TPS	MR		2.00E-02							
TPS min	CR									
TPS max	CR									
TPS average	CR									
TPS min	SbR									
TPS max	SbR									
TPS average	SbR									
TPS min	IC		2.83E-01		9.68E-05			1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
TPS max	IC		2.04E+00		9.68E-05			1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
TPS average	IC		1.38E+00		9.68E-05			1.25E-03	1.38E-02	3.72E-09
TPS min	DfS		2.60E-01							
TPS max	DfS		2.03E+00							
TPS average	DfS		1.15E+00							
TPS min	IwER		1.07E+00							
TPS max	IwER		1.07E+00							
TPS average	IwER		1.07E+00							
TPS min	InoER		1.99E+00							
TPS max	InoER		1.99E+00							
TPS average	InoER		1.99E+00							
TPS min	AD		8.70E-01							
TPS max	AD		2.25E+00							
TPS average	AD		1.56E+00							
TPS min	LFnoER		1.25E+00		1.89E-03			4.51E-04	8.47E-03	6.08E-09
TPS max	LFnoER		7.00E+00		1.89E-03			4.51E-04	8.47E-03	6.08E-09
TPS average	LFnoER		4.13E+00		1.89E-03			4.51E-04	8.47E-03	6.08E-09
TPS min	LFwER		6.79E+00							
TPS max	LFwER		6.79E+00							
TPS average	LFwER		6.79E+00							

References

1. Razza, F.; Degli Innocenti, F.; Dobon, A.; Aliaga, C.; Sanchez, C.; Hortal, M. Environmental profile of a bio-based and biodegradable foamed packaging prototype in comparison with the current benchmark, *J. Cleaner Prod.* **2015**, *102*, 493–500. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2015.04.033
2. Vercalsteren, A.; Spirinckx, C.; Geerken, T. Life cycle assessment and eco-efficiency analysis of drinking cups used at public events. *Int J Life Cycle Assess* **2010**, *15*, 221–230. doi:10.1007/s11367-009-0143-z
3. Piemonte, V. Bioplastic Wastes: The Best Final Disposition for Energy Saving. *J Polym Environ.* **2011**, *19*, 2011, 988–994, doi:10.1007/s10924-011-0343-z
4. Piemonte, V.; Gironi, F. Bioplastics and GHGs Saving: The Land Use Change (LUC) Emissions Issue. *Energy Sources Part A* **2012**, *34*, 1995–2003, doi: 10.1080/15567036.2010.497797
5. Shen, J. Comparative Life cycle Assessment of Polylactic acid (PLA) and Polyethylene terephthalate (PET). Available online. <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/9775/9b12e0619a221eb285c612ecbda1b13eba47.pdf> (accessed on 26 6 2020).
6. Rostkowski, K.H.; Criddle, C.S.; Lepech, M.D. Cradle-to-gate life cycle assessment for a cradle-to-cradle cycle: biogas-to-bioplastic (and back). *Environ Sci Technol.* **2012**, *46*(18), 98229829. doi:10.1021/es204541w
7. Tecchio, P.; Foschia, M.; Talon, O.; Dejonghe, S. Lactic acid production by PLA-waste chemical recycling: environmental impact evaluation. Available online. <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/4251/7feefd208c892126bf072884398caa4464d3.pdf> (accessed on 26 6 2020).
8. Liptow, C.; Tillman, A.-M. A Comparative Life Cycle Assessment Study of Polyethylene Based on Sugarcane and Crude Oil. *J. Ind. Ecol.* **2012**, *16*, 420–435, doi:10.1111/j.1530-9290.2011.00405.x
9. Detzel A.; Kauertz B.; Derreza-Greeven C. Study of the Environmental Impacts of Packagings Made of Biodegradable Plastics. Available online. <https://www.umweltbundesamt.de/sites/default/files/medien/461/publikationen/4446.pdf> (accessed on 26 6 2020).



© 2020 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).