



Article

# Notes on Convergence Results for Parabolic Equations with Riemann–Liouville Derivatives

Long Le Dinh <sup>1,\*</sup>  and O'Regan Donal <sup>2,†</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> Division of Applied Mathematics, Thu Dau Mot University,  
Thu Dau Mot City 75000, Binh Duong Province, Vietnam

<sup>2</sup> School of Mathematical and Statistical Sciences, University of Galway, H91 TK33 Galway, Ireland

\* Correspondence: ledinhlong@tdmu.edu.vn

† These authors contributed equally to this work.

**Abstract:** Fractional diffusion equations have applications in various fields and in this paper we consider a fractional diffusion equation with a Riemann–Liouville derivative. The main objective is to investigate the convergence of solutions of the problem when the fractional order tends to  $1^-$ . Under some suitable conditions on the Cauchy data, we prove the convergence results in a reasonable sense.

**Keywords:** fractional diffusion equation; Riemann–Liouville; regularity; convergence rate

**MSC:** 35A05; 35A08



**Citation:** Le Dinh, L.; O'Regan, D. Notes on Convergence Results for Parabolic Equations with Riemann–Liouville Derivatives. *Mathematics* **2022**, *10*, 4026. <https://doi.org/10.3390/math10214026>

Academic Editor: Xiangmin Jiao

Received: 11 October 2022

Accepted: 27 October 2022

Published: 30 October 2022

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2022 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

## 1. Introduction

Fractional differential equations arise in models in many fields such as economics, biology, mechanics, geology, and heat transfer, and usually there are two types of derivatives that are of interest, namely the Caputo and the Riemann–Liouville derivatives. Both of these derivatives are defined by non-local integrals. Note that the Riemann–Liouville derivative of a constant is not zero and if an arbitrary function is constant at the origin, then its fractional derivative has a singularity at the origin, for example, exponential and Mittag–Leffler functions. However, if we study the initial value problem with the Caputo derivative, we often treat the initial values as normal functions, just like the initial value problem with the classical derivative. However, when considering a problem with the Riemann–Liouville derivative its initial value condition usually involves a fractional integral or a fractional derivative (see [1]). In this paper, we examine:

$$\begin{cases} \mathbf{D}_{0+}^{\alpha} u - u_{xx} = G(x, t), & (x, t) \in (0, \pi) \times (0, T), \\ u(0, t) = u(\pi, t) = 0, & 0 < t < T, \\ t^{1-\alpha} u|_{t=0} = f(x), \end{cases} \quad (1)$$

where  $\mathbf{D}_{0+}^{\alpha} v$  is called the Riemann–Liouville fractional derivative of  $v$  with order  $\alpha$ ,  $0 < \alpha \leq 1$  and it is defined by

$$\mathbf{D}_{0+}^{\alpha} v(t) = \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_0^t (t-r)^{-\alpha} v(r) dr \right), \quad (2)$$

and  $\mathbf{D}_{0+}^{\alpha} v(t) =: \frac{d}{dt} v(t)$  if  $\alpha = 1$ . The diffusion equation arises from many diffusion phenomena that occur in nature (e.g., phase transitions, biochemistry) and equations of time fractional reactions occur in describing “memory” in physics, for example plasma turbulence [2], fractal geometry [3,4], and single-molecular protein dynamics [5] (we also refer the reader to Refs. [6–22]).

In Ref. [23], the authors focused on:

$$\begin{cases} \mathbf{D}_{0+}^\alpha u = F(t, u(t)), & (x, t) \in (0, \pi) \times (0, T), \\ t^{1-\alpha} u|_{t=0} = \lambda \int_0^T u(t) dt + h, & h \in \mathbb{R}, \end{cases} \tag{3}$$

where  $\lambda \geq 0$  and in [24] the following non-local problem was studied:

$$\begin{cases} \mathbf{D}_{0+}^\alpha u + F(t, v(t)) = a, & t \in (0, T), \\ \mathbf{D}_{0+}^\beta v + F(t, u(t)) = b, & t \in (0, T), \\ u(0) = 0, \quad u(T) = \int_0^T \phi(t)u(t) dt, \\ v(0) = 0, \quad v(T) = \int_0^T \phi(t)v(t) dt, \end{cases} \tag{4}$$

where  $1 < \alpha, \beta < 2$ . In Ref. [25], the authors studied the existence and continuation of solutions, and several global existence results were given to a general fractional differential equation (FDE) with a Riemann–Liouville derivative.

Recently, the authors in Ref. [26] investigated the following nonlinear diffusion equation with the Riemann–Liouville derivative

$$\mathbf{D}_{0+}^\alpha u - u_{xx} = F(x, t, u),$$

and obtained the existence and regularity of mild solutions using the Banach fixed point theorem. In Ref. [27], Luc studied the fractional diffusion equation with the Riemann–Liouville derivative in the form

$$\mathbf{D}_{0+}^\alpha u - u_{xx} = F(x, t), \tag{5}$$

and under some assumptions on the input data, he obtained the wellposedness of problem (5).

Returning to Problem (1) we see that if  $f \in \mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)$  for any  $s \geq 0$ , Problem (1) has a unique solution. The solution to the problem depends on the fractional order  $\alpha$  and we denote the solution as  $u_\alpha$ . The main goal of this paper is to see what happens to  $u_\alpha$  when  $\alpha \rightarrow 1^-$ , and this question is inherently difficult.

In this paper, we prove for the first time that the solution  $u_\alpha$  to our problem converges to the solution of the problem with a classical derivative. Theorem 1 gives a result concerning this convergence in the homogeneous case and Theorem 2 is a convergent result for the linear inhomogeneous case. The main technique of the paper is to use a Lemma in Ref. [28] combined with the evaluation in Hilbert scale spaces.

## 2. Preliminaries

With  $\Omega = (0, \pi)$ , note the spectral problem

$$\begin{cases} \Delta e_j(x) = -\lambda_j e_j(x), & x \in \Omega, \\ e_j(x) = 0, & x \in \partial\Omega, \end{cases}$$

with the eigenvalues

$$0 < \lambda_1 \leq \lambda_2 \leq \dots \leq \lambda_j \leq \dots \text{ with } \lambda_j \rightarrow \infty \text{ for } j \rightarrow \infty$$

and the corresponding eigenfunctions  $e_j \in H_0^1(\Omega)$ .

**Definition 1.** The Mittag–Leffler function, which is defined by

$$E_{\alpha,\beta}(z) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{z^n}{\Gamma(n\alpha + \beta)}, (z \in \mathbb{C}),$$

for  $\alpha > 0$  and  $\beta \in \mathbb{R}$ . When  $\beta = 1$ , it is abbreviated as  $E_{\alpha}(z) = E_{\alpha,1}(z)$ .

We note following lemmas (see for example Ref. [2] ).

**Lemma 1** (see Ref. [28]). Let  $\frac{3}{4} \leq \alpha < 1$  and  $\alpha \leq \beta \leq 1$ . Then there exists a constant  $C$  which is independent of  $\alpha, \beta, z$  such that, for any  $z < 0$ ,

$$|E_{\alpha,\beta}(z) - e^z| \leq \frac{C}{1 + |z|}(1 - \alpha). \tag{6}$$

The proof can be found in Ref. [28].

**Lemma 2** (see Ref. [29]). Let  $0 < \alpha < 1$ . Then the function  $z \mapsto E_{\alpha,\alpha}(z)$  has no negative root. Moreover, there exists a constant  $\bar{C}_{\alpha}$  such that

$$0 \leq E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-z) \leq \frac{\bar{C}_{\alpha}}{1+z}, \quad z > 0. \tag{7}$$

For a positive number  $r \geq 0$ , we define the Hilbert scale space

$$H^r(0, \pi) = \left\{ f \in L^2(0, \pi) : \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2r} \left\langle f, \sqrt{\frac{2}{\pi}} \sin(jx) \right\rangle^2 < +\infty \right\}, \tag{8}$$

with the following norm  $\|u\|_{H^r(0,\pi)} = \left( \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2r} \left\langle f, \sqrt{\frac{2}{\pi}} \sin(jx) \right\rangle^2 \right)^{\frac{1}{2}}$ .

**Theorem 1.** Let the Cauchy data  $f \in \mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega) \cap \mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega) \cap \mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)$  any  $0 < \varepsilon < 1, s \geq 0, 0 < \beta, \theta < 1, \frac{3}{4} \leq \alpha < 1, \beta, \theta \leq \frac{s}{2}$  and  $\theta < \alpha$ . Let  $u_{\alpha}$  be the mild solution to Problem (1) and  $u^*$  be the mild solution to Problem (1) with  $\alpha = 1$ , i.e.,

$$\begin{cases} u_t^* - u_{xx}^* = 0, & (x, t) \in (0, \pi) \times (0, T), \\ u^*(0, t) = u^*(\pi, t) = 0, & t \in (0, T), \\ u^*(x, 0) = f(x), \end{cases} \tag{9}$$

Then we get

$$\begin{aligned} \|u_{\alpha} - u^*\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} &\leq \left( \frac{C\Gamma(\alpha)T^{\alpha-\alpha\beta}}{\alpha - \alpha\beta} (1 - \alpha) \right) \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)} \\ &\quad + C(\theta, \mu, T) \left[ (1 - \alpha)^{\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right] \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)} \\ &\quad + \frac{T^{1-\beta}}{1 - \beta} \left| \Gamma(\alpha) - 1 \right| \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)} \\ &\quad + \left[ (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{\varepsilon} \right] \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)}, \end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

where  $T^* = \max(T, 1)$ .

**Proof.** From the paper Ref. [27], we obtain the representation of the mild solution  $u_\alpha$

$$\int_{\Omega} u_\alpha(x, t) e_j(x) dx = \Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1} E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right). \tag{11}$$

The mild solution of the classical problem is defined by

$$\int_{\Omega} u^*(x, t) e_j(x) dx = \exp(-j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right). \tag{12}$$

Subtracting both sides of the two equations above we get

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\Omega} (u_\alpha(x, t) - u^*(x, t)) e_j(x) dx &= \Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1} \left( E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) \\ &+ \Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1} \left( \exp(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) \\ &+ \Gamma(\alpha) \left( t^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right) \exp(-j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) \\ &+ \left( \Gamma(\alpha) - 1 \right) \exp(-j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right). \end{aligned} \tag{13}$$

Thus, we get

$$\begin{aligned} u_\alpha(x, t) - u^*(x, t) &= \sum_j \Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1} \left( E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) e_j(x) \\ &+ \sum_j \Gamma(\alpha) \left( t^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right) \exp(-j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) e_j(x) \\ &+ \sum_j \left( \Gamma(\alpha) - 1 \right) \exp(-j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) e_j(x) \\ &+ \sum_j \Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1} \left( \exp(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right) e_j(x) \\ &= J_1(x, t) + J_2(x, t) + J_3(x, t) + J_4(x, t). \end{aligned} \tag{14}$$

*Step 1. Estimate of  $J_1$ .* In view of the inequality in Lemma 1, we have for  $z > 0$  that

$$\left| E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-z) - \exp(-z) \right| \leq \frac{C}{1 + |z|} (1 - \alpha),$$

and we find that

$$\left| E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right| \leq \frac{C}{1 + j^2 t^\alpha} (1 - \alpha). \tag{15}$$

From  $0 < \beta < 1$ , we get

$$\frac{C}{1 + j^2 t^\alpha} \leq \frac{C}{(1 + j^2 t^\alpha)^\beta} \leq C j^{-2\beta} t^{-\alpha\beta}. \tag{16}$$

Hence, we obtain the following estimate for  $0 < \beta < 1$ ,

$$\left| E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right| \leq C j^{-2\beta} t^{-\alpha\beta} (1 - \alpha). \tag{17}$$

This implies that

$$\begin{aligned} \|J_1(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &= \sum_j j^{2s} |\Gamma(\alpha)|^2 t^{2\alpha-2} \left( E_{\alpha, \alpha}(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right)^2 \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2 \\ &\leq C^2 |\Gamma(\alpha)|^2 t^{2\alpha-2-2\alpha\beta} (1-\alpha)^2 \sum_j j^{2s-4\beta} \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2. \end{aligned} \tag{18}$$

Using Parseval’s equality, we have for any  $0 < \beta < 1$  that

$$\|J_1(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \leq C\Gamma(\alpha) t^{\alpha-1-\alpha\beta} (1-\alpha) \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)}. \tag{19}$$

Thus

$$\|J_1\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} = \int_0^T \|J_1(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} dt \leq C\Gamma(\alpha)(1-\alpha) \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\alpha\beta} dt \right). \tag{20}$$

Note the integral  $\int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\alpha\beta} dt$  is convergent and

$$\int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\alpha\beta} dt = \frac{T^{\alpha-\alpha\beta}}{\alpha-\alpha\beta}.$$

Hence, we get that

$$\|J_1\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} \leq \frac{C\Gamma(\alpha)T^{\alpha-\alpha\beta}}{\alpha-\alpha\beta} (1-\alpha) \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)}. \tag{21}$$

*Step 2. Estimate of  $J_2$ .* In this step (at the end) since  $\theta < \alpha$  we choose  $0 < \mu < 1$  so that  $\mu + \theta < \alpha$ . Note

$$\|J_2(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 = \sum_j j^{2s} |t^{\alpha-1} - 1|^2 \exp(-2j^2 t) \left( \int_{\Omega} f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2. \tag{22}$$

We now consider the term  $|t^{\alpha-1} - 1|$ . If  $0 < t \leq 1$ , then we use the inequality  $1 - e^{-z} \leq C_\mu z^\mu$ ,  $0 < \mu < 1$  to obtain

$$\begin{aligned} |t^{\alpha-1} - 1| &= t^{\alpha-1} (1 - t^{1-\alpha}) = t^{\alpha-1} (1 - \exp(-(1-\alpha) \log(1/t))) \\ &\leq t^{\alpha-1} C_\mu (1-\alpha)^\mu \left( \log\left(\frac{1}{t}\right) \right)^\mu. \end{aligned} \tag{23}$$

In view of the inequality  $\log(z) \leq z$  for any  $z \geq 1$ , we have that

$$\left( \log\left(\frac{1}{t}\right) \right)^\mu \leq t^{-\mu}.$$

Therefore, we obtain for the case  $0 < t \leq 1$  that

$$|t^{\alpha-1} - 1| \leq C_\mu (1-\alpha)^\mu t^{\alpha-\mu-1}. \tag{24}$$

For the case  $t > 1$ , we see that

$$|t^{\alpha-1} - 1| = t^{\alpha-1} (t^{1-\alpha} - 1) \leq t^{\alpha-1} ((T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1), \tag{25}$$

where  $T^* = \max(T, 1)$ . From (24) and (25), we have that

$$|t^{\alpha-1} - 1| \leq t^{\alpha-1} [C_\mu(1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{-\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1], \tag{26}$$

for any  $0 < \mu < 1$ . In view of the inequality  $e^{-z} \leq C_\theta z^{-\theta}, 0 < \theta < 1$ , one has the following inequality

$$\exp(-2j^2t) \leq C_\theta^2 t^{-2\theta} j^{-4\theta}. \tag{27}$$

Combining (22), (26), and (27), we deduce that

$$\begin{aligned} \|J_2(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &\leq C(\theta, \mu) t^{2\alpha-2-2\theta} [C_\mu(1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{-\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1]^2 \\ &\quad \sum_j j^{2s-4\theta} \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2 \\ &= C(\theta, \mu) t^{2\alpha-2-2\theta} [C_\mu(1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{-\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1]^2 \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)}^2. \end{aligned} \tag{28}$$

Thus

$$\|J_2(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \leq C(\theta, \mu) t^{\alpha-1-\theta} [(1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{-\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1] \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)}, \tag{29}$$

where  $C(\theta, \mu)$  represents a constant that depends on  $\mu, \theta$ . Therefore, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \|J_2\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} &= \int_0^T \|J_2(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} dt \\ &\leq C(\theta, \mu) (1 - \alpha)^\mu \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\theta-\mu} dt \right) \\ &\quad + C(\theta, \mu) ((T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1) \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\theta} dt \right). \end{aligned} \tag{30}$$

Note (with  $\mu$  chosen so that  $\theta + \mu < \alpha$ )

$$\int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\theta-\mu} dt = \frac{T^{\alpha-\theta-\mu}}{\alpha - \theta - \mu},$$

and

$$\int_0^T t^{\alpha-1-\theta} dt = \frac{T^{\alpha-\theta}}{\alpha - \theta}.$$

The above imply that

$$\|J_2\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} \leq C(\theta, \mu, T) [(1 - \alpha)^\mu + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1] \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\theta}(\Omega)}. \tag{31}$$

Step 3. Estimate of  $J_3$ . Using Parseval’s equality, we have

$$\|J_3(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 = (\Gamma(\alpha) - 1)^2 \sum_j j^{2s} \exp(-2j^2t) \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2. \tag{32}$$

In view of the inequality  $e^{-z} \leq C_\beta z^{-\beta}$ , we have

$$\exp(-2j^2t) \leq C_\beta^2 j^{-4\beta} t^{-2\beta}.$$

This inequality together with (32) gives

$$\|J_3(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \leq |\Gamma(\alpha) - 1| t^{-\beta} \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)}. \tag{33}$$

Thus

$$\|J_3\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} = \int_0^T \|J_3(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} dt \leq |\Gamma(\alpha) - 1| \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{-\beta} dt \right). \tag{34}$$

Since  $0 < \beta < 1$ , then the proper integral  $\int_0^T t^{-\beta} dt$  is convergent and

$$\int_0^T t^{-\beta} dt = \frac{T^{1-\beta}}{1-\beta}. \tag{35}$$

Combining (34) and (35), we obtain

$$\|J_3\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} \leq \frac{T^{1-\beta}}{1-\beta} |\Gamma(\alpha) - 1| \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)}. \tag{36}$$

Step 4. Estimate of  $J_4$ . We will choose  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$  below. In view of Parseval’s equality, we get

$$\|J_4(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 = (\Gamma(\alpha))^2 t^{2\alpha-2} \sum_j j^{2s} \left( \exp(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right)^2 \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2. \tag{37}$$

Using the inequality  $|e^{-a} - e^{-b}| \leq C_\varepsilon |a - b|^\varepsilon$ , see Refs. [30,31] page 12–13, for any  $a, b > 0, 0 < \varepsilon < 1$ , we get

$$\left| \exp(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right| \leq C_\varepsilon j^{2\varepsilon} |t^\alpha - t|^\varepsilon. \tag{38}$$

From (26), we obtain the following inequality

$$\begin{aligned} |t^\alpha - t| &= t |t^{\alpha-1} - 1| \leq t^\alpha \left[ C_\mu (1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{-\mu} + (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right] \\ &\leq C_\mu (1 - \alpha)^\mu t^{\alpha-\mu} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right) t^\alpha, \end{aligned} \tag{39}$$

for any  $0 < \mu < 1$ . Thus, we obtain that

$$|t^\alpha - t|^{2\varepsilon} \leq C(\mu, \varepsilon) \left( (1 - \alpha)^{2\varepsilon\mu} t^{2\varepsilon\alpha-2\varepsilon\mu} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{2\varepsilon} t^{2\varepsilon\alpha} \right). \tag{40}$$

From some previous observations, we have

$$\begin{aligned} &t^{2\alpha-2} \sum_j j^{2s} \left( \exp(-j^2 t^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2 t) \right)^2 \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2 \\ &\leq C(\mu, \varepsilon) (1 - \alpha)^{2\varepsilon\mu} t^{2\varepsilon\alpha-2\varepsilon\mu+2\alpha-2} \sum_j j^{2s+4\varepsilon} \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2 \\ &+ C(\mu, \varepsilon) \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{2\varepsilon} t^{2\varepsilon\alpha+2\alpha-2} \sum_j j^{2s+4\varepsilon} \left( \int_\Omega f(x) e_j(x) dx \right)^2. \end{aligned} \tag{41}$$

We now choose  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$ . Using the inequality  $\sqrt{a+b} \leq \sqrt{a} + \sqrt{b}$  for any  $a, b \geq 0$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \|J_4(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} &\leq \Gamma(\alpha)C(\alpha, \varepsilon)(1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} t^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2} + \alpha - 1} \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)} \\ &\quad + \Gamma(\alpha)C(\alpha, \varepsilon) \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\varepsilon t^{\varepsilon\alpha + \alpha - 1} \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)}. \end{aligned} \tag{42}$$

The latter estimate implies that

$$\begin{aligned} \|J_4\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} &= \int_0^T \|J_4(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} dt \\ &\leq \Gamma(\alpha)C(\alpha, \varepsilon)(1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2} + \alpha - 1} dt \right) \\ &\quad + \Gamma(\alpha)C(\alpha, \varepsilon) \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\varepsilon \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)} \left( \int_0^T t^{\varepsilon\alpha + \alpha - 1} dt \right). \end{aligned} \tag{43}$$

We note that the two integrals  $\int_0^T t^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2} + \alpha - 1} dt$  and  $\int_0^T t^{\varepsilon\alpha + \alpha - 1} dt$  are convergent. Thus, it follows from (43) that

$$\|J_4\|_{L^1(0,T;\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega))} \lesssim \left[ (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\varepsilon \right] \|f\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)}, \tag{44}$$

where the hidden constant depends on  $\alpha, \varepsilon$ .  $\square$

**Remark 1.** Note that the right hand side of (10) goes to 0 when  $\alpha \rightarrow 1^-$ .

### 3. Inhomogeneous Case

In this section, we consider the following diffusion equation with the inhomogeneous term

$$\begin{cases} \mathbf{D}_{0+}^\alpha u - u_{xx} = G(x, t), & (x, t) \in (0, \pi) \times (0, T), \\ u = 0, & (x, t) \in \partial\Omega \times (0, T), \\ t^{1-\alpha} u|_{t=0} = f(x). \end{cases} \tag{45}$$

In order to reduce the calculation duplication process, we take the function  $f = 0$ . The goal of this section is to prove the convergence of the mild solution to problem (45) when  $\alpha \rightarrow 1^-$ .

**Theorem 2.** Let  $G \in L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega)) \cap L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)) \cap L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s-\theta}(\Omega))$ , for any  $\varepsilon > 0, s \geq 0, 0 < \beta, \theta < 1, \frac{3}{4} \leq \alpha < 1, \beta, \theta \leq \frac{s}{2}, \beta < \frac{1}{2}$  and  $\theta < \alpha$ . Let  $u_\alpha$  be the mild solution of Problem (45) and let  $u^*$  be the mild solution to the classical problem, i.e.,

$$\begin{cases} u_t^* - u_{xx}^* = G(x, t), & (x, t) \in (0, \pi) \times (0, T), \\ u^* = 0, & (x, t) \in \partial\Omega \times (0, T), \\ u^*(x, 0) = f(x), & x \in \Omega. \end{cases} \tag{46}$$

Then we have the following estimate

$$\begin{aligned} \|u_\alpha(\cdot, t) - u^*(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} &\leq (1 - \alpha) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega))} \\ &\quad + \left( (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\varepsilon \right) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega))} \\ &\quad + \sqrt{C_\alpha T^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} + \frac{T^\alpha}{\alpha} \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)} \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-\theta}(\Omega))}. \end{aligned} \tag{47}$$



**Proof.** The mild solution  $u_\alpha$  of Problem (45) is defined by (see Ref. [26])

$$\int_\Omega u_\alpha(x, t)e_j(x)dx = \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr. \tag{48}$$

The mild solution to the classical problem is given by

$$\int_\Omega u^*(x, t)e_j(x)dx = \int_0^t \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr. \tag{49}$$

From two above equalities, we get that

$$\begin{aligned} & u_\alpha(x, t) - u^*(x, t) \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^\infty \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right] \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right] e_j(x) \\ &\quad + \sum_{j=1}^\infty \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ \exp(-j^2(t-r)) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right] \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right] e_j(x) \\ &\quad + \sum_{j=1}^\infty \left[ \int_0^t \left[ (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right] \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right] e_j(x) \\ &= \mathbb{H}_1(x, t) + \mathbb{H}_2(x, t) + \mathbb{H}_3(x, t). \end{aligned} \tag{50}$$

*Step 1. Estimate of  $\mathbb{H}_1$ .* In order to estimate  $\mathbb{H}_1$ , we use the bound (17) and obtain

$$\left| E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right| \leq Cj^{-2\beta}(t-r)^{-\alpha\beta}(1-\alpha). \tag{51}$$

The term  $\mathbb{H}_1$  is bounded by

$$\begin{aligned} \|\mathbb{H}_1\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &= \sum_{j=1}^\infty j^{2s} \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right] \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right]^2 \\ &\leq \sum_{j=1}^\infty j^{2s} \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} dr \right) \\ &\quad \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ E_{\alpha,\alpha}(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right]^2 \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr, \end{aligned} \tag{52}$$

where we have used the Hölder inequality. In view of (51), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \|\mathbb{H}_1\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &\lesssim (1-\alpha)^2 \sum_{j=1}^\infty j^{2s-4\beta} \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1-2\alpha\beta} \left( \int_\Omega G(x, r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr \right) \\ &= (1-\alpha)^2 \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1-2\alpha\beta} \left\| G(\cdot, r) \right\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega)}^2 dr \\ &\leq (1-\alpha)^2 \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega))}^2 \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1-2\alpha\beta} dr \right). \end{aligned} \tag{53}$$

Note

$$\int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1-2\alpha\beta} dr = \frac{t^{\alpha-2\alpha\beta}}{\alpha-2\alpha\beta},$$

and we recall that  $\beta < \frac{1}{2}$ . Thus, we can deduce that

$$\|\mathbb{H}_1\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \lesssim (1-\alpha) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega))}. \tag{54}$$

*Step 2. Estimate of  $\mathbb{H}_2$ .*

We will choose  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$  below. Using Hölder’s inequality, the term  $\mathbb{H}_2$  is bounded by

$$\begin{aligned} \|\mathbb{H}_2\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &= \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s} \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ \exp(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right] \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right]^2 \\ &\leq \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s} \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} dr \right) \\ &\quad \left[ \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} \left[ \exp(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right] \right]^2 \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr. \end{aligned} \tag{55}$$

Using (38) and (40) and the inequality  $(a + b)^\epsilon \leq C_\epsilon(a^\epsilon + b^\epsilon)$  for any  $a, b \geq 0, \epsilon > 0$ , we find for any  $0 \leq r \leq t$  that

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \exp(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right| &\leq C_\epsilon j^{2\epsilon} |(t-r)^\alpha - (t-r)|^\epsilon \\ &\lesssim j^{2\epsilon} \left[ (1-\alpha)^{\mu\epsilon} (t-r)^{(\alpha-\mu)\epsilon} + ((T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1)^\epsilon (t-r)^{\alpha\epsilon} \right]. \end{aligned} \tag{56}$$

Now choose  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$ . Thus, we see

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \exp(-j^2(t-r)^\alpha) - \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \right|^2 &\lesssim j^{4\epsilon} (1-\alpha)^{2\mu\epsilon} (t-r)^{\alpha\epsilon} + j^{4\epsilon} ((T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1)^{2\epsilon} (t-r)^{2\alpha\epsilon}. \end{aligned} \tag{57}$$

This implies that

The right hand side of (55)

$$\begin{aligned} &\lesssim (1-\alpha)^{\alpha\epsilon} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s+4\epsilon} \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+\alpha\epsilon} \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr \\ &\quad + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{2\epsilon} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s+4\epsilon} \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+2\alpha\epsilon} \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr. \end{aligned} \tag{58}$$

Hence, we obtain that

$$\begin{aligned} \|\mathbb{H}_2\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &\lesssim (1-\alpha)^{\alpha\epsilon} \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+\alpha\epsilon} \|G(\cdot, r)\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\epsilon}(\Omega)}^2 dr \\ &\quad + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{2\epsilon} \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+2\alpha\epsilon} \|G(\cdot, r)\|_{\mathbb{H}^{s+2\epsilon}(\Omega)}^2 dr. \end{aligned} \tag{59}$$

Note the convergence of the two proper integrals  $\int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+\alpha\epsilon} dr$  and  $\int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1+2\alpha\epsilon} dr$ , and we have the following estimate

$$\|\mathbb{H}_2\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 \lesssim \left( (1-\alpha)^{\alpha\epsilon} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^{2\epsilon} \right) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s+2\epsilon}(\Omega))}^2. \tag{60}$$

Thus, we deduce that

$$\|\mathbb{H}_2\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \lesssim \left( (1-\alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\epsilon}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\epsilon \right) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s+2\epsilon}(\Omega))}. \tag{61}$$

Step 3. Estimate of  $\mathbb{H}_3$ .

We will choose  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$  below and recall  $\theta < \alpha$ . By Parseval’s equality, we obtain that

$$\begin{aligned} \|\mathbb{H}_3\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 &= \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s} \left[ \int_0^t \left[ (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right] \exp(-j^2(t-r)) \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right) dr \right]^2 \\ &\leq \left( \int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| dr \right) \\ &\quad \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s} \left[ \int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| \exp(-2j^2(t-r)) \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr \right]. \end{aligned}$$

In view of (26) (and choosing  $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{2}$ ) we have for  $0 \leq r \leq t$  that

$$\left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| \leq C_{\alpha}(t-r)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}-1}(1-\alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right) (t-r)^{\alpha-1}, \tag{62}$$

where  $C_{\alpha}$  indicates a constant which depends on  $\alpha$ . The inequality (62) implies that

$$\begin{aligned} \int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| dr &\leq C_{\alpha}(1-\alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}-1} dr \right) \\ &\quad + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right) \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} dr \right). \end{aligned} \tag{63}$$

Note

$$\int_0^t (t-r)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}-1} dr = \frac{2}{\alpha} t^{\frac{\alpha}{2}}, \quad \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1} dr = \frac{1}{\alpha} t^{\alpha}.$$

Thus, it follows from (63) that

$$\int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| dr \leq C_{\alpha} T^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} (1-\alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} + \frac{T^{\alpha}}{\alpha} \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right). \tag{64}$$

By applying the inequality  $e^{-j^2(t-r)} \leq C_{\theta} j^{-\theta} (t-r)^{-\theta}$  for any  $\theta > 0$ , we get the following estimate:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s} \left[ \int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| \exp(-2j^2(t-r)) \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 dr \right] \\ \leq \int_0^t \left| (t-r)^{\alpha-1} - 1 \right| (t-r)^{-\theta} \left( \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j^{2s-2\theta} \left( \int_{\Omega} G(x,r)e_j(x)dx \right)^2 \right) dr \\ \leq \|G\|_{L^{\infty}(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-\theta}(\Omega))}^2 \left( \int_0^t (t-r)^{\alpha-1-\theta} dr + \int_0^t (t-r)^{-\theta} dr \right), \end{aligned} \tag{65}$$

where we have used the triangle inequality. Then (recall  $\theta < \alpha$ ) from the convergence of the two proper integrals above, we deduce

$$\|\mathbb{H}_3\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)}^2 \leq \left[ C_{\alpha} T^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} (1-\alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} + \frac{T^{\alpha}}{\alpha} \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right) \right] \|G\|_{L^{\infty}(0,T;\mathbb{H}^{s-\theta}(\Omega))}^2. \tag{66}$$

Combining (54), (61), and (66), we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\|u_\alpha(\cdot, t) - u^*(\cdot, t)\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} &\leq \|\mathbb{H}_1\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} + \|\mathbb{H}_2\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} + \|\mathbb{H}_3\|_{\mathbb{H}^s(\Omega)} \\
&\leq (1 - \alpha) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s-2\beta}(\Omega))} \\
&\quad + \left( (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha\varepsilon}{2}} + \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)^\varepsilon \right) \|G\|_{L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s+2\varepsilon}(\Omega))} \\
&\quad + \sqrt{C_\alpha T^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} (1 - \alpha)^{\frac{\alpha}{2}} + \frac{T^\alpha}{\alpha} \left( (T^*)^{1-\alpha} - 1 \right)} \|G\|_{L^\infty(0, T; \mathbb{H}^{s-\theta}(\Omega))}. \tag{67}
\end{aligned}$$

□

**Remark 2.** Note the right hand side of (47) tends to zero when  $\alpha \rightarrow 1^-$ .

#### 4. Conclusions

In this work, the main objective was to investigate the convergence of solutions to the problem when the fractional order tends to  $1^-$  with the Riemann–Liouville derivative. In the future, we hope to investigate the convergence towards  $1^-$  with the Caputo derivative, the Atangana Baleanu Caputo derivative, and some other non-integer order derivatives.

**Author Contributions:** Writing—original draft, review, editing, L.L.D., D.O. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This research received no external funding.

**Institutional Review Board Statement:** Not applicable.

**Informed Consent Statement:** Not applicable.

**Data Availability Statement:** Not applicable.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

#### References

- Li, C.; Qian, D.; Chen, Y.Q. On Riemann–Liouville and Caputo Derivatives. *Discret. Dyn. Nat. Soc.* **2011**, *2011*, 562494. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Podlubny, I. *Fractional Differential Equations*; Academic Press: London, UK, 1999.
- Nigmatullin, R.R. The realization of the generalized transfer equation in a medium with fractal geometry. *Physica Status Solidi B* **1986**, *133*, 425–430. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Tuan, N.H.; Caraballo, T. On initial and terminal value problems for fractional nonclassical diffusion equations. *Proc. Am. Math. Soc.* **2021**, *149*, 143–161. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Kou, S. Stochastic modeling in nanoscale biophysics: Subdiffusion within proteins. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **2008**, *2*, 501–535. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Zhao, C.; Caraballo, T.; Łukaszewicz, G. Statistical solution and Liouville type theorem for the Klein–Gordon–Schrödinger equations. *J. Differ. Equ.* **2021**, *281*, 1–32. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Zhao, C.; Wang, J.; Caraballo, T. Invariant sample measures and random Liouville type theorem for the two-dimensional stochastic Navier–Stokes equations. *J. Differ. Equ.* **2022**, *317*, 474–494. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Tuan, N.H.; Nguyen, A.T.; Yang, C. Global well-posedness for fractional Sobolev–Galpern type equations. *Discret. Contin. Dyn. Syst.* **2022**, *42*, 2637–2665.
- Tuan, N.A.; Tuan, N.H.; Yang, C. On Cauchy problem for fractional parabolic–elliptic Keller–Segel model. *Adv. Nonlinear Anal.* **2023**, *12*, 97–116.
- Tuan, N.H.; Au, V.V.; Nguyen, A.T. Mild solutions to a time-fractional Cauchy problem with nonlocal nonlinearity in Besov spaces. *Arch. Math.* **2022**, *118*, 305–314. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Tuan, N.H.; Foondun, M.; Thach, T.N.; Wang, R. On backward problems for stochastic fractional reaction equations with standard and fractional Brownian motion. *Bull. Sci. Math.* **2022**, *179*, 103158. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Tuan, N.A.; Caraballo, T.; Tuan, N.H. On the initial value problem for a class of nonlinear biharmonic equation with time-fractional derivative. *Proc. R. Soc. Edinb. Sect. A* **2022**, *152*, 989–1031. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Caraballo, T.; Mchiri, L.; Rhaima, M. Ulam–Hyers–Rassias stability of neutral stochastic functional differential equations. *Stochastics* **2022**, *94*, 959–971. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Xu, J.; Zhang, Z.; Caraballo, T. Mild Solutions to Time Fractional Stochastic 2D–Stokes Equations with Bounded and Unbounded Delay. *J. Dyn. Differ. Equ.* **2022**, *34*, 583–603. [\[CrossRef\]](#)
- Caraballo, T.; Guo, B.; Tuan, N.H.; Wang, R. Asymptotically autonomous robustness of random attractors for a class of weakly dissipative stochastic wave equations on unbounded domains. *Proc. R. Soc. Edinb. Sect. A* **2021**, *151*, 1700–1730. [\[CrossRef\]](#)

16. Bao, N.T.; Caraballo, T.; Tuan, N.H.; Zhou, Y. Existence and regularity results for terminal value problem for nonlinear fractional wave equations. *Nonlinearity* **2021**, *34*, 1448–1503. [[CrossRef](#)]
17. Xu, J.; Zhang, Z.; Caraballo, T. Non-autonomous nonlocal partial differential equations with delay and memory. *J. Differ. Equ.* **2021**, *270*, 505–546. [[CrossRef](#)]
18. Caraballo, T.; Ezzine, F.; Hammami, M.A.; Mchiri, L. Practical stability with respect to a part of variables of stochastic differential equations. *Stochastics* **2021**, *93*, 647–664. [[CrossRef](#)]
19. Zhao, C.; Li, Y.; Caraballo, T. Trajectory statistical solutions and Liouville type equations for evolution equations: Abstract results and applications. *J. Differ. Equ.* **2020**, *269*, 467–494. [[CrossRef](#)]
20. Nguyen, D.P.; Luu, V.C.H.; Erdal K.; Jagdev S.; Ho, D.B.; Nguyen, H.C. Fractional order continuity of a time semi-linear fractional diffusion-wave system. *Alex. Eng. J.* **2020**, *59*, 4959–4968. [[CrossRef](#)]
21. Nguyen, H.L.; Le, N.H.; Dumitru, B.; Nguyen, H.C. Identifying the space source term problem for a generalization of the fractional diffusion equation with hyper-Bessel operator. *Adv. Differ. Equ.* **2020**, *2020*, 1–23. [[CrossRef](#)]
22. Tuan, N.H.; Phuong, N.D.; Thach, T.N. New well-posedness results for stochastic delay Rayleigh-Stokes equations. *Discret. Contin. Dyn. Syst. Ser. B* **2023**, *28*, 347. [[CrossRef](#)]
23. Wanga, X.; Wanga, L.; Zeng, Q. Fractional differential equations with integral boundary conditions. *J. Nonlinear Sci. Appl.* **2015**, *8*, 309–314. [[CrossRef](#)]
24. Zhai, C.; Jiang, R. Unique solutions for a new coupled system of fractional differential equations. *Adv. Differ. Equ.* **2018**, *2018*, 1. [[CrossRef](#)]
25. Kou, C.; Zhou, H.; Li, C. Existence and continuation theorems of Riemann-Liouville type fractional differential equations. *Int. J. Bifurc. Chaos Appl. Sci. Engrgy* **2012**, *22*, 1250077. [[CrossRef](#)]
26. Ngoc, T.B.; Zhou, Y.; O'Regan, D.; Tuan, N.H. On a terminal value problem for pseudoparabolic equations involving Riemann-Liouville fractional derivatives. *Appl. Math. Lett.* **2020**, *106*, 106373. [[CrossRef](#)]
27. Luc, N.H. Remarks on a 1-D nonlocal in time fractional diffusion equation with inhomogeneous sources. *Bull. Math. Anal. Appl.* **2021**, *13*, 1–12. Available online: <http://www.bmathaa.org> (accessed on 30 September 2022).
28. Chen, H.; Stynes, M. Blow-up of error estimates in time-fractional initial-boundary value problems. *IMA J. Numer. Anal.* **2021**, *41*, 974–997. [[CrossRef](#)]
29. Tuan, N.H.; Huynh, L.N.; Ngoc, T.B.; Zhou, Y. On a backward problem for nonlinear fractional diffusion equations. *Appl. Math. Lett.* **2019**, *92*, 76–84. [[CrossRef](#)]
30. Nguyen, H.T.; Vo, V.A.; Xu, R.; Renhai, W. On the initial and terminal value problem for a class of semilinear strongly material damped plate equations. *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* **2020**, *492*, 124481. [[CrossRef](#)]
31. Sakamoto, K.; Yamamoto, M. Initial value/boundary value problems for fractional diffusion-wave equations and applications to some inverse problems. *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* **2011**, *382*, 426–447. [[CrossRef](#)]